THE STATE OF EXPANDED PUBLIC WORKS PROGRAMMES IN SOUTH AFRICAN CITIES 2014–2015
# CONTENTS

- **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** .................................................. 3
- **LIST OF ACRONYMS** ................................................... 4
- **FOREWORD** .............................................................. 5
- **INTRODUCTION** .......................................................... 7
  - About this report .......................................................... 7
  - Methodology ............................................................... 7
  - Background ............................................................... 7
  - Key components of EPWP .............................................. 9
  - EPWP guidelines ......................................................... 9
- **LOOKING BACK AT PHASE I AND PHASE II** .................... 12
  - Targets and achievements ............................................. 12
  - Key lessons learned .................................................... 13
- **OVERVIEW OF EPWP PHASE III** .................................... 14
  - EPWP Phase III (2014-2019) ........................................ 14
  - Targets for Phase III ................................................... 15
- **ORGANISATIONAL ARRANGEMENTS OF THE CITIES** .............. 16
  - Policy changes and targets in 2014/15 ............................ 16
  - Institutional arrangements ........................................... 17
  - Institutional arrangements for EPWP phase III. ................. 17
- **OVERVIEW OF EPWP IMPLEMENTATION** .......................... 19
  - EPWP implementation .................................................. 19
  - Employment created ................................................... 21
  - Training ................................................................. 26
  - Demographics of employment ....................................... 28
  - Expenditure on EPWP .................................................. 31
- **EPWP SECTOR ANALYSIS FOR THE CITIES** ....................... 41
- **CHALLENGES FACED BY THE CITIES** ............................. 44
  - Mitigation measures implemented by the DPW .................. 45
  - Conclusion ............................................................. 45
- **BUFFALO CITY METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY** ................... 48
- **CITY OF JOHANNESBURG** ........................................... 52
- **CITY OF TSHWANE** .................................................... 56
- **EKURHULENI METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY** ...................... 60
- **ETHEKWINI MUNICIPALITY** ........................................ 63
- **MANGAUNG METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY** ...................... 68
- **MSUNDUZI MUNICIPALITY** ........................................... 72
- **NELSON MANDELA BAY METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY** ............ 76
- **PHYSICAL VERIFICATION PROJECT (GRADUATE PROGRAMME) – CITY OF JOHANNESBURG** .......... 83
- **EPWP MATRIC PROGRAMME – CITY OF TSHWANE** .................. 85
- **WARD-BASED INTEGRATED MAINTENANCE PROGRAMME – MSUNDUZI MUNICIPALITY** ................. 87
- **COMMUNITY EMERGENCY RESPONSE TEAM (CERT) PROGRAMME – EKURHULENI METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY** ............................. 89
LIST OF TABLES & FIGURES

Figure 1: Definition of EPWP indicators ............................................. 8
Figure 2: Focus of the EPWP ............................................................... 14
Figure 3: Number of EPWP projects implemented (2014/15) ............... 19
Figure 4: Number of projects implemented (2010/11-2014/15) ............. 20
Figure 5: Work opportunities targets vs work opportunities achieved .... 21
Figure 6: Number of work opportunities (2010/11-2014/15) ............... 23
Figure 7: FTE targets vs FTE achieved ............................................. 24
Figure 8: FTEs/person-years of work training (2010/11-2014/15) ........... 25
Figure 9: WOs achieved to FTEs achieved (2014/15) ......................... 26
Figure 10: Training days (2010/11-2014/15) ..................................... 27
Figure 11: Training days provided by the cities per sector .................... 28
Figure 12: Demographics of EPWP beneficiaries (2014/15) ............... 30
Figure 13: Allocated project budget vs expenditure, including professional fees (2014/15) ......................................................... 32
Figure 14: Expenditure including professional fees (2010/11-2014/15) .... 33
Figure 15: Incentive grant allocation vs expenditure .......................... 35
Figure 16: Incentive grant allocations (2011/12–2014/15) .................... 36
Figure 17: Wages paid out to employees on EPWP projects (2014/15) .... 37
Figure 18: Cost per work opportunity (2010/11-2014/15) ................... 38
Figure 19: Minimum daily wage rate per project (2014/15) ................. 39
Figure 20: EPWP sectors being implemented by the cities .................. 41
Figure 21: Institutional arrangements – Buffalo City Municipality ........ 49
Figure 22: Institutional arrangements – City of Johannesburg ............. 53
Figure 23: Institutional arrangements – City of Tshwane ..................... 56
Figure 24: Institutional arrangements – Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality ............................................................... 60
Figure 25: Institutional arrangements – eThekwini Municipality .......... 64
Figure 26: Institutional arrangements – Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality .............................................................. 69
Figure 27: Institutional arrangements – Msunduzi Municipality .......... 73
Figure 28: Institutional arrangements – Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality .......................................................... 77

Table 1: Work opportunity targets for all spheres of government .......... 15
Table 2: FTE targets for all spheres of government ............................. 15
Table 3: Policy status of the cities ...................................................... 17
Table 4: WOs created per sector against WO targets (2014/15) .......... 27
Table 5: Demographics of EPWP beneficiaries (2010/11–2014/15) ....... 31
Table 6: Challenges and potential solutions for implementing EPWP .... 44
Table 7: Buffalo City Municipality budget allocations (2014/15) ......... 49
Table 8: Buffalo City Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15) .......... 50
Table 9: City of Johannesburg budget allocations (2014/15) ............... 53
Table 10: City of Johannesburg EPWP progress (2014/15) ................. 54
Table 11: City of Tshwane budget allocations (2014/15) ..................... 57
Table 12: City of Tshwane EPWP progress (2014/15) ......................... 58
Table 13: Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality budget allocations (2014/15) ............................................................ 61
Table 14: Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15) .......................................................... 61
Table 15: eThekwini Municipality budget allocations (2014/15) .......... 64
Table 16: eThekwini Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15) .......... 65
Table 17: Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality budget allocations (2014/15) ............................................................ 70
Table 18: Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15) ............................................................ 70
Table 19: Msunduzi Municipality budget allocations (2014/15) .......... 72
Table 20: Msunduzi Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15) .......... 74
Table 21: Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality budget allocations (2014/15) ............................................................ 77
Table 22: Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15) ............................................................ 78
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report was made possible by the commitment of the eight cities comprising the South African Cities Network (SACN): Buffalo City, Ekurhuleni, eThekwini, Johannesburg, Mangaung, Msunduzi, Nelson Mandela Bay and Tshwane, and the content direction given by their respective EPWP managers (the City of Cape Town withdrew its SACN membership in 2014, and thus has not participated in the period). The project also relies on the financial contribution and guidance of the national Department of Public Works (DPW). Recognition is also given to the other officials drawn from across the spheres of government who have provided data and other inputs for this report. A special thank-you goes to the EPWP unit: Monitoring and Evaluation Department, who provided the team with access to reports and primary data.

Chief Editor(s) / Project Manager(s):
Geci Karuri-Sebina (SACN)
Ignatius Ariyo (DPW)

Project Management Support Team:
Sadhna Bhana (SACN)

Contributors:
Mabo Makhubu (SMEC)
Mignon Brooks (SMEC)
David Mashaba (DPW)

Design & layout:
the earth is round

Copy editing:
Dave Buchanan

Photography credits:
All photos in the publication are attributable to DPW and SACN.

Report compiled by:
Fate Tharullo Mohlala

This report is published by:
South African Cities Network
16th floor, Joburg Metro Building
158 Civic Boulevard
Braamfontein

PO Box 32160
2017 Braamfontein
Johannesburg, SOUTH AFRICA

+27 (0)11 407 6471
info@sacities.net
www.sacities.net

ISBN No. 978-0-620-67658-8
2015
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACRONYM</th>
<th>EXPLANATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BCMM</td>
<td>Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLO</td>
<td>Community Liaison Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoJ</td>
<td>City of Johannesburg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSW</td>
<td>Cleansing and Solid Waste</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoRA</td>
<td>Division of Revenue Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPW</td>
<td>Department of Public Works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECD</td>
<td>Early Childhood Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPWP</td>
<td>Expanded Public Works Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESRI</td>
<td>Environmental Systems Research Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE</td>
<td>Full-Time Equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIS</td>
<td>Geographical Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HCBC</td>
<td>Home/Community-based Care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIC</td>
<td>Labour-Intensive Construction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIS</td>
<td>Management Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDP</td>
<td>National Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDPW</td>
<td>National Department of Public Works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPO</td>
<td>Non-Profit Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSF</td>
<td>National Skills Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEP</td>
<td>Public Employment Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACN</td>
<td>South African Cities Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SETA</td>
<td>Skills Education and Training Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WO</td>
<td>Work Opportunity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FOREWORD

The 2014/15 State of the Expanded Public Works Programme in South African Cities Report marks the fifth publication in the series of reports produced by the South African Cities Network. Annual publications of this nature ensure reporting continuity that allows for monitoring of the cities’ progress against benchmarks established in previous reports. The EPWP Reference Group provides a consistent platform for the generation of knowledge and sharing of information, experiences and lessons learned, encapsulated in the annual reports.

Employment creation is one of the drivers of economic growth; and with the current economic situation in South Africa, it is important to draw lessons from the annual reports and develop initiatives to create work opportunities through the EPWP. The 2014/15 report along with the previous report, therefore, present the state of EPWP implementation in South African cities, and lessons to be learned in order to maximise the job creation opportunities presented by the EPWP.

The 2014/15 report also tracks the progress and experiences of the eight cities across the previous annual reporting periods in Phase II and Phase III of the EPWP. Furthermore, it investigates the institutional arrangements along with the organisational capacity of each city, identifying the changes implemented as well as the resulting successes and challenges experienced. The report sets out to identify key relationships and correlations having an impact on the performance of the EPWP, reporting on best practice as well as challenges faced and lessons learned.

We trust that the stakeholders will continue to find value in the reporting, and use its findings to enhance the performance and impact of the EPWP. This report continues to be significantly informed by the cities themselves, through the SACN EPWP Reference Group – a peer-based platform comprising key city officials responsible for implementing the EPWP in their respective cities. This collective has continued to meet quarterly over the period, providing a forum in which experiences and knowledge are exchanged between peers. The Reference Group also contributes to enhancing coordination between the cities and other role-players towards the effective implementation of the EPWP. We look forward to these reports contributing even more significantly to enhancing job creation in South Africa, through information, reflection and learning based upon the EPWP, our flagship public employment programme.

Stanley W. Henderson
Deputy Director General: EPWP
National Department of Public Works

www.epwp.gov.za
www.publicworks.gov.za

Sithole M. Mbanga
Chief Executive Officer
South African Cities Network

www.socities.net
ABOUT THIS REPORT

The South African Cities Network (SACN) is an established network of South African cities and partners that encourages the exchange of information, experiences and best practices on urban development and city management. The SACN was established in 2002 by the Minister of Provincial and Local Government, in collaboration with the mayors of South Africa’s largest cities and the South African Local Government Association.

The goals and mandates of the SACN are to:
• promote good governance and management in South African cities;
• analyse strategic challenges facing South African cities, particularly in the context of global economic integration and national development challenges;
• collect, collate, analyse, assess, disseminate and apply the experience of large-city government in a South African context; and
• promote shared-learning partnerships between different spheres of government to support the management of South African cities.

The SACN’s core members are eight of South Africa’s largest cities: Buffalo City, Ekurhuleni, eThekwini, Johannesburg, Mangaung, Msunduzi, Nelson Mandela and Tshwane; though the report also includes the City of Cape Town, despite its withdrawal from the network of cities. These cities collectively occupy 17% of the country’s land area (approximately 21,828 km²), and are home to 40.8% of South Africa’s population. In 2013, the average per capita income in the metros was approximately twice the value of that in the rest of South Africa, at R63,754 compared to R32,353. The employed constitute a higher percentage of the working-age population in metros than in the rest of South Africa. In 2011, the official employment rate was 48% in metros, versus 32% in the rest of the country. In 2013, the percentage of the metro population living below the poverty line was 25% (down from 29% in 1996), compared to 40% in the rest of South Africa.

The report outlines the progress and implementation of the EPWP by the cities over the 2014/15 period. This reporting period corresponds to the first year of Phase III of the EPWP. The report will also summarise the key challenges and features of Phase III, along with a brief summary of the lessons learned from Phase I and Phase II. The report does not include an individual report for the City of Cape Town, as it is no longer a member of SACN (as of 2014).

METHODOLOGY

The methodology applied to develop this report comprised a desktop study and telephonic interviews. The desktop study involved the review and analysis of relevant documents sourced from the SACN member cities, as well as from the EPWP and SACN websites. Statistical data was obtained from the EPWP Quarterly Reports and from the Management Information System (MIS) used by the EPWP Unit National Technical Support Programme, which supports municipalities in implementing and reporting on EPWP projects. All the cities were also given an opportunity to provide input towards the data contained in the report through the individual city reports. Telephonic interviews were held with representatives of the cities. In many instances, these were the individuals representing the cities on the SACN EPWP Reference Group. The SACN established the Reference Group for the member cities as a platform to share best practice and lessons learnt in the implementation of the EPWP.

The main body of the report gives an overview of EPWP Phase III, institutional arrangements, implementation, and challenges faced. Individual city reports for eight SACN member cities (found in Part III) focus on the progress made and key successes in implementing the EPWP. Part IV contains best-practice examples in the form of case studies which the Reference Group documents over time to support shared learning from experience.

BACKGROUND

Over successive periods, South African administrations have come up with strategies to alleviate unemployment. One such instance is the introduction of the EPWP by the government in 2003, as a complementary measure to reduce poverty and curb rising unemploy-
PERSON-DAYS OF EMPLOYMENT CREATED
» The number of people who worked on a project multiplied by the number of days each person worked.

JOB OPPORTUNITIES
» One job opportunity is paid work created for an individual on an EPWP project for any period of time. In the case of Social Sector projects, learnerships also constitute job opportunities.
» The same individual can be employed on different projects. Each period of employment will be recorded as a job opportunity.

PROJECT WAGE
» The minimum daily wage rate is the daily wage (whether task-rated or time-rated) per individual project. This wage rate must be included in the project tender document at all times, as per the EPWP Guidelines.

TRAINING PERSON-DAYS
» Training is funded through the Department of Higher Education and Training’s National Skills Fund (NSF) or from project budgets. The training funded through the NSF is accredited, while training funded through project budgets is not necessarily accredited. The number of training person-days is calculated by multiplying the number of people who attended training by the number of days of training.
» For any other training, one training day equates to at least seven hours of formal training. It is, however, important to draw a distinction between accredited and non-accredited training person-days.

PROJECT BUDGET
» The project budget is the price tendered by the contractor plus the professional fees for the professional service provider appointed to design and supervise the project. The project budget excludes government management and administration costs.

ACTUAL EXPENDITURE
» Actual expenditure relates to the expenditure on the project by the contractor plus the expenditure by the professional service provider appointed to design and supervise the project. The actual expenditure excludes expenditure on government management and administration.

DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF WORKERS
» The number of workers that fall within the following categories must be recorded:
  · youth (18 – 35 years of age)
  · women
  · persons with disabilities.

Figure 1: Definition of EPWP indicators
Source: Guidelines for the Implementation of Labour-Intensive Infrastructure Projects under EPWP (Appendix D)
ment. When announcing the EPWP, then-President Thabo Mbeki stated that the programme was designed to use public budgets to provide the unemployed with temporary jobs in productive sectors. This would provide a source of income and a measure of training that would facilitate their absorption into the job market.

The primary goal of the EPWP is to provide more people with productive work. The EPWP aimed to create 1 million jobs in Phase I, which ran from 2004 to 2009. It also aimed to provide skills, training and work experience. Phase II aimed to generate 4.9 million jobs from 2009 to 2014. Phase III of the EPWP aims to generate 6 million jobs between the 2014/15 and 2018/19 financial years. The programme focuses on expanding methods of labour-intensive construction (LIC) or production, by means of government-funded projects, in order to create more job opportunities. This is achieved by limiting the use of machines and employing people to do the work.

KEY COMPONENTS OF EPWP

To enable the creation of jobs in a short period, the EPWP approach is based on the requirements of the Growth Development Summit agreement, and has the following key principles:

- To allow for diversity in existing programmes;
- To expand the use of best practice in existing programmes;
- To use existing budgets and replace special poverty-relief or public-works budgets;
- To be sustainable (the EPWP must not be ‘made to work’, but must be ‘economically efficient’);
- To focus on growing sectors of the economy to avoid displacement; and
- To attempt, through the design process, to maximise the involvement of local unemployed labour.

The EPWP covers all spheres of government and state-owned enterprises. Each public-sector body must formulate plans for using its budget to contribute to implementing the EPWP. The focus is on four sectors:

- **Infrastructure**: increasing the labour intensity of specific government-funded infrastructure projects in terms of specified guidelines in order to create work opportunities (WOs). This requirement is specified in the Division of Revenue Act (DoRA), to be applied in respect of provincial and municipal infrastructure grants;
- **Environment**: creating WOs in public environmental programmes through expanding existing projects originally implemented through the Special Poverty Relief Allocation – for example, Working for Water;
- **Social**: creating WOs in public social programmes, particularly home/community-based care (HCBC) and early childhood development (ECD); and
- **Non-state**: using wage subsidies to support non-profit organisations (NPOs) in their community-development initiatives.

The key components of an EPWP project are as follows:

- Public-sector bodies make a deliberate attempt to use expenditure on goods and services to create additional WOs, coupled with training for unemployed individuals;
- Projects usually employ workers on a temporary basis (either by government, contractors or other non-governmental organisations), under the code of good practice or learnership employment conditions; and
- Public-sector bodies attempt to define and facilitate exit strategies for workers when they leave the programme.

EPWP GUIDELINES

The EPWP issued guidelines for the implementation of labour-intensive infrastructure projects in 2004, and updated them in 2005. These guidelines are designed to provide provinces and municipalities with the necessary tools to tender for labour-intensive projects. They cover how to implement the most commonly-encountered delivery model for labour-intensive works: ‘design by the employer’, where the contractor undertakes construction based on full designs issued by the employer. The assumption is that the public body appoints a consultant to design the works and to administer the contract.

Guidance is also provided in respect of:

- identification of suitable projects,
- appropriate design for labour-intensive construction,
- specification of labour-intensive works, and
- the compilation of contract documentation for labour-intensive projects.

Specific direction is given regarding contract clauses that need to be included in order to amend or augment standard documentation regarding the implementation of labour-intensive projects.

The guidelines stipulate that the employment of locally employed temporary workers on all EPWP labour-intensive infrastructure projects must be in line with the Code of Good Practice for Employment and Conditions of Work for Special Public Works Programmes issued in terms of the Basic Conditions of Employment Act, 1997 (Act No 75 of 1997), and promulgated in the Government Gazette, Notice No. P64 of 25 January 2002. The Code of Good Practice and the EPWP Ministerial Determination have subsequently been updated for EPWP Phase III. Figure 1 shows the EPWP indicators defined in the guidelines document.
PART II

THE REPORT
LOOKING BACK AT PHASE I AND PHASE II

TARGETS AND ACHIEVEMENTS

Following the 2003 Growth and Development Summit, Government agreed on a massification of the public works programme, EPWP Phase I, with a five-year target of 1 million work opportunities. The key assumption was that economic growth in the ‘first economy’ was not having an impact on the ‘second economy’; hence the need for targeted developmental programmes (SMME Development, Taxi Recapitalisation Project and EPWP) as once-off ladders to ‘graduate’ the ‘second economy’ activities to the ‘formal economy’. Phase I achieved its ‘1 million work opportunities’ target a year ahead of schedule (2008), but unemployment remained stubbornly high – and worsened from 2008, with the onset of the global economic crisis.

Launched in April 2009, Phase II of the EPWP was intended to build on the successes and lessons learned from Phase I. The EPWP was expected to grow to approximately four and a half times its then-current size, and make a significant contribution to the Millennium Development Goal of halving unemployment by 2014. The goal was to create employment equal to 2 million Full-Time Equivalents (FTEs), or 4.5 million short, on-going Work Opportunities (WOs), with an average duration of 100 days (one FTE = 230 working days).

The objectives for Phase II included the following:

• The WOs provided annually (starting 2009/10) would include 55% for women, 40% for youth, and 2% for people with disabilities;
• Government and non-state-sector service delivery would be provided to approved and defined standards;
• An increased proportion of the normal budget would be spent on EPWP outputs (WOs, people employed, training and income transferred); and
• Sector programme targets would be specified, where applicable, as a percentage of labour-intensive employment.

Phase II was on track to achieve its targets by March 2014, with the following factors highlighted as the contributors to its success:

• significant scaling up of public-sector employment programmes as part of the National Anti-Poverty Strategy;
• enabling the creation of paid work as the primary objective of the programme (employer of last resort);
• allocating clear political and administrative accountability for EPWP work creation targets across all spheres of government;
• aligning EPWP outputs with the core mandates and programmes of the implementing public bodies;
• providing fiscal incentives to accelerate the scaling of EPWP outputs across all spheres of government; and
• mobilising non-state capacity to deliver additional EPWP work opportunities to scale up progressively from 210 000 FTEs per year in 2009/10 to 680 000 FTEs in 2013/14.

The EPWP was expected to grow to approximately four and a half times its then-current size, and make a significant contribution to the Millennium Development Goal of halving unemployment by 2014.
KEY LESSONS LEARNED

The DPW highlighted six key lessons from EPWP Phase I and II, as part of a presentation to the Portfolio Committee on Public Works on 5 March 2015:

Lesson 1: Primary Purpose

There was often much confusion between public and practitioners as to what the aim of the Public Employment Programme (PEP) was. The PEP’s development, potentially, depended on providing three outcomes: sustainable household livelihoods, skills development, and the provision of assets and services. Every EPWP was to involve all these outcomes, though they need not be carried out equally. There would need to be trade-offs. The optimal balance between the outcomes would vary, and increasing one output was thus likely to result in decreases in the others.

Lesson 2: More than just WOs

Better balance was needed between work-opportunity headcounts and other outcomes. As good as focusing on targets was, the danger was that it could become a number-crunching exercise, and other salient issues would be underplayed.

Lesson 3: Infrastructure Focus

Infrastructure was the largest contributor to work opportunities, but the short-term nature of many infrastructure construction projects creates problems; because once the construction is done, the jobs are over – and so is the participants’ work.

Lesson 4: Perceptions and Understanding

There was a perception that there is risk for public bodies taking on EPWP projects. There was concern that labour-intensive methods are slow, and that the quality produced is poor. There was also concern over compliance challenges, in reporting and supply chain requirements. Finally, there were expectations from participants that there would be full-time employment for them at the completion of their projects. The programme should be better clarified to the participants and the conditions of employment should be communicated.

Lesson 5: Patronage

The risk of projects being captured for patronage purposes was detected. There were community accusations that the selection of EPWP participants had been hijacked by politicians for patronage purposes. This could undermine key developmental outcomes, community co-ownership (including community oversight of PEP projects), community cohesion, and any sense of ownership.

Lesson 6: Managing Complexity

Given the previous lessons, there was therefore a need for much greater co-ordination between the scale, diversity and innovative nature of South Africa’s PEPs.
OVERVIEW OF EPWP PHASE III


Drawing from the lessons learned in Phase I and II of the EPWP, it appears a paradigm shift is needed to pursue greater coordination across a range of PEPs and other developmental initiatives; training; small, medium and micro enterprises (SMMEs); and cooperative development. The following were needed: better monitoring and evaluation of what happens after participation; the impact of services and assets created, especially in poor communities; and an increase in the scope of infrastructure maintenance. The National Development Plan (NDP) called for a significant expansion of the EPWP, directed by two key objectives:

• Contributing to the reduction of unemployment by creating temporary employment, which would be responsive to the number of unemployed. The Public Employment Programmes should target the creation of two million work opportunities annually by 2020, or earlier if possible.

• Contributing to social protection for the unemployed by providing them with income support.

With regard to the projects aimed at training and graduation in EPWP Phase III, participants remain the primary element. Therefore, even very low-skilled activities in community work programmes would still warrant training, as participants would need to be trained as a team, or trained to observe basic safety precautions. Even if the training is elementary, it’s still important, as it provides participants with some basic skills. Each sector must develop its own appropriate training policy and strategy, since the role and importance of training varies considerably from sector to sector, and from sub-programme to sub-programme.

Strong collaboration with the National Skills Fund (NSF) and Skills Education and Training Agencies (SETAs) would continue, in order to source funding for training of participants. Where possible, the graduation of EPWP beneficiaries into formal employment would be promoted through various initiatives, including cooperatives and small-enterprise development. Figure 2 shows the focus of the EPWP as presented by the DPW.
TARGETS FOR PHASE III

The main objective of Phase III is to provide work opportunities and income support to the poor and unemployed through the delivery of public and community assets and services, thereby contributing to development.

Table 1 and Table 2 show the WO and FTE targets for the various spheres of government.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial year</th>
<th>Local</th>
<th>Provincial</th>
<th>National</th>
<th>Non-state</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>278 382</td>
<td>354 924</td>
<td>412 213</td>
<td>236 000</td>
<td>1 281 519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>310 992</td>
<td>380 172</td>
<td>436 022</td>
<td>245 000</td>
<td>1 372 186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016-17</td>
<td>347 578</td>
<td>382 869</td>
<td>612 707</td>
<td>418 000</td>
<td>1 761 154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-18</td>
<td>395 238</td>
<td>391 252</td>
<td>620 246</td>
<td>419 000</td>
<td>1 825 736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-19</td>
<td>428 875</td>
<td>397 778</td>
<td>629 187</td>
<td>419 000</td>
<td>1 874 840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>1 761 065</td>
<td>1 906 996</td>
<td>2 710 375</td>
<td>1 737 000</td>
<td>8 115 436</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Department of Public Works: 2015-2020 Strategic Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial year</th>
<th>Local</th>
<th>Provincial</th>
<th>National</th>
<th>Non-state</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>89 162</td>
<td>162 753</td>
<td>169 037</td>
<td>100 379</td>
<td>521 330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>100 882</td>
<td>171 689</td>
<td>177 891</td>
<td>103 254</td>
<td>553 716</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016-17</td>
<td>113 590</td>
<td>172 114</td>
<td>234 021</td>
<td>157 515</td>
<td>677 239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-18</td>
<td>129 912</td>
<td>175 476</td>
<td>268 701</td>
<td>188 993</td>
<td>763 082</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-19</td>
<td>141 995</td>
<td>178 242</td>
<td>217 609</td>
<td>188 993</td>
<td>780 839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>575 541</td>
<td>860 273</td>
<td>1 121 260</td>
<td>739 135</td>
<td>3 296 208</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Department of Public Works: 2015-2020 Strategic Plan
ORGANISATIONAL ARRANGEMENTS OF THE CITIES

This section gives an overview of the institutional arrangements and related EPWP policy governing the implementation of EPWP within each of the cities, along with the organisational arrangements presented by the National DPW (NDPW). It also investigates and reviews amendments that were implemented during the 2014/15 reporting period.

The objective of an EPWP policy is to provide a framework for implementing the EPWP in each city. The policy should therefore be geared towards providing an enabling environment for the successful implementation of EPWP projects, while ensuring adherence to all government directives and legislative requirements. A comprehensive EPWP policy, which has been approved and formally adopted by the city council, is fundamental to the success and progress of a city’s EPWP initiatives.

In order to establish a solid framework that provides the necessary guidance for implementing EPWP initiatives, the following policy objectives, defined by the NDPW, should be accommodated:

• To educate all departments and units in the city on how their functions should contribute towards the EPWP;
• To establish a delivery strategy in terms of socio-economic development, poverty alleviation, employment creation, and skills development;
• To ensure development integration across all sectors;
• To engineer the planning, design and implementation of programmes and projects with the city so that they maximise employment opportunities.
• The effectiveness of the EPWP policy depends on the compliance with the given policy of all entities in the city. Therefore, it is imperative to have mechanisms in place to monitor the implementation of and compliance with the city’s EPWP policy.

POLICY CHANGES AND TARGETS IN 2014/15

Since 2014/15 marks the beginning of Phase III of the EPWP, policy revisions had to be made by each city to align with the current phase. Table 3 reports on the status of the revisions and the dates for initial approval of each city’s EPWP policy.

Mangaung and eThekwini municipalities’ policies are yet to be approved, with the targeted date being prior to the beginning of the 2015/16 reporting period. In addition, Mangaung experienced challenges with regard to the implementation of the EPWP policy, as no EPWP coordination teams and other key EPWP personnel were appointed. The Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality is still applying the old EPWP policy, which poses some challenges in terms of compliance. However, led by the Chief Operations Officer (COO), the municipality is in the process of developing an institutional structure to align their EPWP policy to Phase III.

The key lesson learned by the cities from the 2013/14 reporting period was the importance of internal targeting. This is used as a strategy to hold all departments in a municipality individually accountable for their targets, and ensures participation, improved performance, and better reporting, monitoring and evaluation.

According to the cities, the appointment of EPWP steering committees comprising key administrative staff plays a vital role in improving implementation, compliance, coordination and performance. Without them, there would be delays in approval of policy, and no formal framework in the municipality to guide the implementation and coordination of the EPWP. It would also be difficult to monitor and evaluate EPWP implementation and progress, which would significantly affect a municipality’s achievements.
Table 3: Policy status of the cities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CITY</th>
<th>DATE APPROVED</th>
<th>REVISIONS MADE</th>
<th>REVISION STATUS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Buffalo City</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>1st revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Cape Town</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>To be confirmed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Johannesburg</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>2nd revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Tshwane</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>2nd revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ekurhuleni</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1st revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eThekwini</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>2nd revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Under review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mangaung</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>1st revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Under review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Msunduzi</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>1st revision TBC – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nelson Mandela Bay</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>1st revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Still to be reviewed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS

From the lessons learned in the previous reporting periods, the cities realised the importance of formalising the EPWP coordinating structure. Each of the eight cities placed greater emphasis on their institutional arrangements, in an effort to achieve the following goals (among others):

- Create organisational capacity to facilitate EPWP coordination within the cities
- Increase the cities’ ability to implement EPWP projects
- Improve performance
- Ensure that all internal and national EPWP targets are met
- Generate support
- Ensure commitment and responsibility in the various departments
- Centralise coordination of EPWP projects and goals in each city

The cities established steering committees, headed by programme managers and consisting of administrators and coordinators. The duties of the organisational structure in each city include reporting on the work opportunities (WO) generated through EPWP, ensuring that labour-intensive construction (LIC) methods are used where applicable, setting internal targets that are aligned with each city’s EPWP policy, and providing an enabling environment for the creation of jobs and implementation of EPWP across the city.

The City of Johannesburg, for instance, is committed to implementing EPWP projects that are in line with their slogan, ‘Every project an EPWP project’. Each department in the city, therefore, as championed by the organisational structure, is mandated to create jobs as per EPWP targets.

In 2014/15, efforts were made to identify key positions in each city’s organisational arrangements that would enhance capacity to carry out EPWP activities. All nine cities, therefore, made an effort to increase organisational capacity through the appointment of EPWP staff such as coordinators, data capturers, project managers, administrators and supervisors. It should be noted that even though greater importance has been placed on establishing functional and effective institutional arrangements, not all cities have been able to appoint personnel as per the requirements of the organisational structure. Among these are the City of Johannesburg and the City of Tshwane.

INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS FOR EPWP PHASE III

To achieve better synergy between our wide range of PEPs and other poverty alleviation, employment, enterprise development and skills development initiatives, Cabinet (November 2013) has agreed that a Presidential Public Employment Coordinating Commission will be established, and that it should:

- be chaired by the President or Deputy President, and should meet quarterly;
- be composed of relevant ministers, the nine premiers and the South African Local Government Association (SALGA);
- be supported by a Political Management Committee of relevant ministers, and a Political Secretariat of relevant ministers and deputy ministers;
- have two major work streams – PEPs and Employment, and PEPs and Sustainable Livelihoods;
- have as technical secretariat the DPW’s current EPWP Branch, working closely with other relevant line department branches.
PART II
THE REPORT
OVERVIEW OF EPWP IMPLEMENTATION

This section of the report highlights the progress of the cities in their implementation of the EPWP during 2014/15, and reviews trends over the 2010/11-2014/15 financial periods.

Six indicators are used to assess each city’s progress in meeting their EPWP objectives:
- number of WOs created,
- number of person-days of work created,
- minimum day-task wage rate,
- number of person-days of training provided,
- overall budget and expenditure, and
- demographics of workers.

The analysis and figures that follow use data extracted from the EPWP Quarter 4 Consolidated Report for 2014/15, as well as from the 2009/10-2011/12, 2012/13 and 2013/14 Annual Reports. Indicators cannot be reviewed in isolation when assessing the progress of the EPWP within the cities. Therefore, progress across previous reporting periods is reviewed in conjunction with the 2014/15 achievements. Analysis across reporting periods will show emerging trends and underlying correlations influencing the progress and success of the EPWP.

EPWP IMPLEMENTATION

In 2014/15, the nine cities generated 149 204 work opportunities and 42 775 FTEs, amounting to 125% and 104% achievement, respectively. This was done through a total of 2 134 projects in 2014/15; a 35% increase from 2013/14. Figure 3 shows the number of EPWP projects implemented by each of the nine cities in 2014/15.

Figure 3: Number of EPWP projects implemented (2014/15)
Analysed in isolation, the number of projects implemented by each city is not an indication of that city’s efficiency or success. This indicator is dependent on the city’s organisational arrangements, policies and allocated budget.

The cities with the highest number of projects implemented are the City of Cape Town, the City of Johannesburg and the City of Tshwane, as was the case in 2013/14. These three cities have capacity through their institutional arrangements, and large budgets and incentive grant allocations (Figure 13 and Figure 14). The City of Johannesburg and the City of Tshwane also have EPWP policies in place that were amended and updated to align with Phase III, for which 2014/15 is the first year.

The number of projects implemented by the cities has increased over the years, by 23% on average and by 35% between 2013/14 and 2014/15 (see Figure 4). The smaller cities, such as Buffalo City, Mangaung and Msunduzi, have implemented the least number of projects. This correlates with the availability of resources in the cities, including institutional capacity and allocated budget. The cities have placed greater emphasis on establishing institutional arrangements to assist with the implementation and coordination of the EPWP, which has improved performance between 2010/11 and 2014/15. Even with a slight decrease in the number of projects implemented (e.g. in Buffalo City, the City of Tshwane, Ekurhuleni and Msunduzi) between 2013/14 and 2014/15, the cities have managed to create more work opportunities per project in 2014/15 than in 2013/14.

Figure 4: Number of projects implemented (2010/11-2014/15)
EMPLOYMENT CREATED

In 2014/15, the cities contributed 51% of the work opportunities generated by all the municipalities in the country, achieving 125% of their set WO targets and 106% of the FTE targets. Figure 5 shows the WO targets compared to the WOs achieved by the nine cities.

Most of the WOs were generated from the infrastructure sector (approximately 62%). The sector that contributed the lowest number of WOs in 2014/15 was the social sector, with 15%. The larger cities – the City of Johannesburg, the City of Tshwane, the City of Cape Town, and eThekwini – generated the most WOs in 2014/15. This was expected, since these cities also implemented the most EPWP projects. The city with the highest number of projects (the City of Cape Town) generated the most WOs; and the cities with the lowest number of projects (Msunduzi and Buffalo City) generated the fewest WOs.

The number of WOs created by the cities over the past five years has increased by an average of 12%, as illustrated in Figure 6. Even with four of the cities recording a 9% decrease (on average) in the number of projects implemented, together the cities have increased the number of WOs generated by an average of 31% from 2013/14 to 2014/15. The four cities that recorded a decrease in the number of projects implemented between 2013/14 and 2014/15 are Buffalo City, the City of Tshwane, Ekurhuleni and Msunduzi. The City of Cape Town contributed 28% of the WOs generated and 57% of the number of projects implemented in 2014/15, with Buffalo City and Msunduzi contributing the least.

...the cities contributed 51% of the work opportunities generated by all the municipalities in the country, achieving 125% of their set WO targets and 106% of the FTE targets.
There was an increase in the number of projects implemented from 2013/14 to 2014/15, which can be attributed to the following factors:

- greater emphasis on institutional capacity
- alignment of individual cities’ EPWP policies to Phase III
- enforcing LIC methods across all relevant projects, especially in the infrastructure sector

The number of FTEs was also analysed along with the relationship this factor has with WOs generated in 2014/15. Figure 7 shows the number of FTE targets to the number of FTEs achieved by the nine cities in 2014/15.
Msunduzi Municipality achieved 196% of their FTE targets in 2014/15. However, this over-achievement may have been due to the low FTE target set for the year, at 340. As Msunduzi has the third lowest number of FTEs achieved, the 196% achievement cannot be regarded as an indicator of the city’s ability to generate FTEs.

Buffalo City has reported poor performance with regard to meeting their FTE targets for 2014/15, which was the case in the 2013/14 reporting period as well. Drawing from the data reported by Msunduzi, it may be that the targets set by Buffalo City were too high for the city’s institutional capacity and resources.

Figure 8 illustrates the number of FTEs generated by each of the cities between 2010/11 and 2014/15.
The City of Johannesburg has shown a general decrease in the FTEs generated between 2010/11 and 2014/15; however, the city has generated the most FTEs over the five years. The City of Cape Town, which has implemented the most projects and generated the highest number of WOs, has generated fewer FTEs over the five-year period compared to the larger cities, such as the City of Johannesburg, the City of Tshwane and eThekweni. This may be an indication of a decline in efficiency at the City of Cape Town, and an inability to create longer-term employment.

Since most of the indicators of EPWP performance cannot be analysed in isolation in order to properly assess the cities’ ability to implement EPWP projects and meet targets, the relationship between FTEs and WOs generated in 2014/15 was also assessed (see Figure 9).
There is no linear relationship between WOs and FTEs, which was also the case in 2013/14. There are two relationships that can be observed from the FTEs and WOs generated by the cities:

- An increase in FTEs coupled with a decrease in WOs may be an indication that the duration of WOs has decreased.
- A decrease in both the WOs and FTEs for a city is an indication of the city’s decreased efficiency.

Cities such as Nelson Mandela Bay and Buffalo City had the fewest EPWP projects implemented and WOs generated, but had a higher proportion of FTEs generated. This is an indication that these cities were able to create longer-term employment with the few projects they were able to implement. It should be noted that these cities also had some of the lowest budget and incentive grant allocations (as seen in the later sections of this report), which affected their ability to implement EPWP projects in 2014/15.

**TRAINING**

Training is an important aspect of the EPWP, as it ensures that skills and knowledge are transferred to the beneficiaries of the programme. There is a need for the cities to promote training initiatives through EPWP projects, in order to aid the transition of beneficiaries from secondary economy to mainstream employment. It is therefore essential that training be included in the annual plans of the cities, including in budgets. Figure 10, however, shows that very little importance is placed on training in any of the cities.
All the training days provided by City of Tshwane were through the infrastructure sector. The infrastructure sector contributes the most to training days in all the cities (approximately 99%). This may be because the infrastructure sector also provided the most work opportunities in 2014/15 (Table 4).

Table 4: WOs created per sector against WO targets (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Annual targeted WOs</th>
<th>WOs achieved (2014/15)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>% of targeted WOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>379 156</td>
<td>409 209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and culture</td>
<td>227 650</td>
<td>221 090</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social</td>
<td>202 714</td>
<td>224 606</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-profit organisations</td>
<td>49 000</td>
<td>50 371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community work</td>
<td>187 000</td>
<td>198 707</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>1 045 520</strong></td>
<td><strong>1 103 983</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The cities are able to create work opportunities through the infrastructure sector by the use of LIC methods. The cities have not provided any training through the social sector, as seen in Figure 11.
It was pointed out in 2013/14 that greater emphasis needs to be placed on prioritising the provision of training in order to fulfil the EPWP mandate going into Phase III of the programme. However, the cities seem to be regressive with regard to training, with only two cities – the City of Tshwane, and Mangaung – showing improvement compared to the 2013/14 reporting period.

DEMOGRAPHICS OF EMPLOYMENT

In order to analyse the cities’ success in generating employment by demography, it is important to highlight the targets for Phase III, which were to generate employment in the following proportions:

- 55% for women
- 55% for youth
- 2% for people with disabilities

It should be noted that these percentages are not a reflection of the total population; one may be both a woman and youth, both youth and disabled, both woman and disabled, or fall into all three categories. Figure 12 demonstrates the cities’ performance in relation to the set targets – that is, the demographic distribution of the EPWP beneficiaries across the nine cities.

...the cities seem to be regressive with regard to training, with only two cities – the City of Tshwane, and Mangaung – showing improvement compared to the 2013/14 reporting period.
In 2014/15, six of the cities met and exceeded the youth target of 55% by an average of 6.8%; the previous year, seven cities met the target. The city that met the target in 2013/14 and did not in 2014/15 is Buffalo City, with 49% achieved against a 40% target in 2013/14, and 47% achieved against a target of 55% in 2014/15. It may be that the city failed to update its targets from Phase II to Phase III, and when planning and reporting were done, a false achievement was recorded. The other city that did not meet its target is Nelson Mandela Bay, which failed to meet all three targets in 2014/15. This was also the case in 2013/14. Only two of the nine cities met the target for women: the City of Tshwane at 55%, and eThekwini at 62%, eThekwini being the only city that exceeded the target. It is alarming that none of the cities were able to meet the 2% target for people with disabilities. Table 5 shows the demographics of beneficiaries employed under the EPWP over the 2010/11-2014/15 period.
Table 5: Demographics of EPWP beneficiaries (2010/11–2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
<th>2014/15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% Youth</td>
<td>% Women</td>
<td>% Disabled</td>
<td>% Youth</td>
<td>% Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buffalo City</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Cape Town</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Johannesburg</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>0.001%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Tshwane</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ekurhuleni</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>0.003%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eThekwini</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mangaung</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>0.001%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Msunduzi</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nelson Mandela Bay</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>0.001%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The inability of all the cities to create employment for people with disabilities may be an indication that most EPWP WOs are not suitable for disabled persons. The other factor noted in the 2013/14 report is that the term ‘people with disabilities’ may be misunderstood; the term refers not only to people who are physically disabled, but also to people with hearing disabilities, mental disabilities, etc.

Most of the projects reported on in 2014/15 were from the infrastructure sector, which consequently generated more WOs. This may be the reason for the cities not being able to meet the set targets for women, with the average being 48%. Due to the nature of the work in the infrastructure sector, and what seems to be the sector’s general gender bias (being male-dominated), then as the WOs are predominantly from this sector, it is not surprising that there has not been an improvement in creating employment for women and people with disabilities. The cities must raise awareness about the opportunities in the infrastructure sector available for women and people with disabilities. Another possible way to create employment for women and people with disabilities would be to implement more projects in the environment and social sectors.

**EXPENDITURE ON EPWP**

Expenditure is another key indicator of the performance and efficiency of the cities’ EPWP implementations. Therefore, the budgets allocated to the cities are analysed along with the wages paid. Figure 13 shows allocated budget and expenditure, including professional fees, for EPWP projects in 2014/15.

The cities must raise awareness about the opportunities in the infrastructure sector available for women and people with disabilities.
The City of Tshwane was allocated the highest budget in 2014/15, but spent the second-lowest percentage of it, at 11.3% expenditure. However, though the expenditure is low when evaluated as a function of the budget, Figure 16 shows that the high budget allocation allowed the City of Tshwane to pay the second-highest wages in 2014/15, compared to the other cities. The city with the lowest budget allocation for 2014/15 was Msunduzi Municipality, with R87.6 million. But Msunduzi was able to spend 19% of its allocated budget, which on a percentage basis is higher than the City of Tshwane.

The larger cities had the largest budget allocations, with some of the lowest expenditures in terms of percentage, whereas the smaller cities had the lowest budget allocations, with the highest percentages spent. The cities with the highest allocated budgets were able to create more WOs and FTEs in total, and made the most improvements from 2013/14 to 2014/15. In order to demonstrate this, the expenditure over the 2010/11-2014/15 period was analysed, as illustrated in Figure 14.
Figure 14 shows that the smaller cities have had relatively low expenditure over the past five years, with the larger cities spending more. However, that in itself cannot be used as evidence of the cities’ ability or success in EPWP implementation. The number of WOs and FTEs generated along with the number of projects implemented and wages paid should also be taken into account.

The cities with the lowest expenditure consequently generated the lowest number of WOs and FTEs, and implemented the fewest projects during the five-year period. On average, the expenditure reported by the cities has decreased by 5%, the number of projects increased by 23%, WOs increased by 12% and FTEs increased by 11%. This may be an indication of the cities’ increased efficiency through increased organisational capacity, alignment with EPWP policy, and increased emphases on LIC methods to create WOs.

The cities rely on incentive grants for EPWP projects. Figure 15 shows the incentive grants allocated to each of the cities in 2014/15, and Figure 16 illustrates the changes in the incentive grant allocation between 2010/11 and 2014/15.
PART II
THE REPORT
Incentive grant allocations show a similar trend to the budget allocations in Figure 13; however, the cities were able to spend a higher proportion of their incentive grant allocations for 2014/15. From the individual cities report, Part III, it was found that the cities used the incentive grants to pay wages for EPWP labour. It was also found that the higher the wages paid, the more WOs and FTEs were generated. This is because through higher wages, the workforce increases and labour disputes are minimised.

...the cities were able to spend a higher proportion of their incentive grant allocations for 2014/15
The incentive grant allocations for the City of Johannesburg have been decreasing year on year since 2011/12 (see Figure 16). However, the city has still been able to increase its WOs and FTEs and keep its wages relatively high, at R110.55 per day. It had the second-highest total budget allocation including professional fees for 2014/15, which was used to supplement the decrease in incentive grants. Buffalo City, Msunduzi and Mangaung have received the lowest incentive grants over the years, and point to these low allocations as one of the main challenges to their ability to create WOs and FTEs.
The cities do not have the same wage rates for EPWP jobs, though the wage rates do not differ drastically, with the highest being R142.82 per day and the lowest R103.26 (Figure 19). The City of Tshwane had the highest allocated budget, second-highest expenditure and third-highest incentive grant allocation. This allows the city enough financial resources to pay the highest wages per project. This is consistent, since the lowest wage rate is that paid by Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality, which also had the second-lowest budget and incentive grant allocation in 2014/15.

In order to further assess the cities’ spending efficiency, the cost per work opportunity generated from 2010/11 to 2014/15 was monitored (illustrated in Figure 18).
Most of the cities have shown a decrease in the cost of WOs from 2010/11 to 2014/15 – a 16% decrease on average, with the exception of Buffalo City and Nelson Mandela Bay, which have both shown an increase in the cost of WOs, especially at the beginning of Phase III. It is to be expected that the cities’ cost per WO would decrease over the five-year period, as policies are updated and institutions are capacitated, resulting in increased efficiency in EPWP implementation and spending.

Under-reporting, which was reported as one of the major challenges experienced by the cities in 2014/15 (Table 6) may have affected the number of WOs and FTEs reported, and thus the resultant cost per WO.

The low cost per WO in 2014/15 for the City of Cape Town, the City of Johannesburg, the City of Tshwane, Mangaung and Msunduzi may be attributed to the cities implementing small-scale projects at low cost.

Buffalo City and Msunduzi implemented a similar number of projects (23 and 20, respectively); however, Msunduzi generated more WOs, at 89% lower cost per WO. This is evidence that Msunduzi has been more efficient in implementing EPWP projects and spending.
The cities with the highest wage rates and the highest total wages paid also had the highest numbers of WOs created. There is a need for the cities to standardise the EPWP wage rates, to ensure that:

- beneficiaries have sufficient income, thus avoiding labour disputes
- beneficiaries are safeguarded from exploitation
- cities meet WO targets
PART II
THE REPORT
EPWP SECTOR ANALYSIS FOR THE CITIES

This section focuses on the sectors in which the cities are implementing projects. The predominant sector is infrastructure, but the cities are also implementing projects in the environment and culture, social, and non-state sectors, as shown in Figure 20.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Infrastructure</th>
<th>Environment &amp; Culture</th>
<th>Social</th>
<th>Non-State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BUFFALO CITY</td>
<td>![Infrastructure Icon]</td>
<td>![Environment &amp; Culture Icon]</td>
<td>![Social Icon]</td>
<td>![Non-State Icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CITY OF CAPE TOWN</td>
<td>![Infrastructure Icon]</td>
<td>![Environment &amp; Culture Icon]</td>
<td>![Social Icon]</td>
<td>![Non-State Icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CITY OF JOHANNESBURG</td>
<td>![Infrastructure Icon]</td>
<td>![Environment &amp; Culture Icon]</td>
<td>![Social Icon]</td>
<td>![Non-State Icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CITY OF TSHWANE</td>
<td>![Infrastructure Icon]</td>
<td>![Environment &amp; Culture Icon]</td>
<td>![Social Icon]</td>
<td>![Non-State Icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EKURHULENI</td>
<td>![Infrastructure Icon]</td>
<td>![Environment &amp; Culture Icon]</td>
<td>![Social Icon]</td>
<td>![Non-State Icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ETHEKWINI</td>
<td>![Infrastructure Icon]</td>
<td>![Environment &amp; Culture Icon]</td>
<td>![Social Icon]</td>
<td>![Non-State Icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MANGAUNG</td>
<td>![Infrastructure Icon]</td>
<td>![Environment &amp; Culture Icon]</td>
<td>![Social Icon]</td>
<td>![Non-State Icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSUNDUZI</td>
<td>![Infrastructure Icon]</td>
<td>![Environment &amp; Culture Icon]</td>
<td>![Social Icon]</td>
<td>![Non-State Icon]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NELSON MANDELA BAY</td>
<td>![Infrastructure Icon]</td>
<td>![Environment &amp; Culture Icon]</td>
<td>![Social Icon]</td>
<td>![Non-State Icon]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 20: EPWP sectors being implemented by the cities.
INFRASTRUCTURE SECTOR

The infrastructure sector involves the use of labour-intensive methods in the construction and maintenance of public-sector-funded infrastructure projects. Labour-intensive infrastructure projects under the EPWP entail:

• using LIC methods to provide WOs for local unemployed people,
• providing training and skills development to local unemployed people, and
• building cost-effective, quality assets.

The provinces and municipalities implement most projects. While all provinces and 99% of municipalities are already contributing to the EPWP, many provincial departments and municipalities could increase their contribution. The continued growth of the sector will depend on the degree to which some of the underperforming provinces and municipalities can increase their performance by implementing more labour-intensive projects, and by establishing dedicated labour-intensive maintenance programmes that have the potential to provide regular employment to large numbers of people, especially in rural areas.

The key EPWP infrastructure programmes include:

• Vuk’uphile Learnership Programme: This programme trains individuals in labour-intensive methods of construction to become contractors at National Qualifications Framework (NQF) level 2, and supervisors at NQF level 4;
• National Youth Service Programme: This is a year-long skills training and development intervention that aims to provide unemployed youth with technical skills, life skills, access to practical work experience, and mentoring;
• Large Projects: These are projects with a minimum budget of R30 million, aimed at ensuring the delivery of large-budget projects based on EPWP principles and meaningful development of emerging contractors; and
• Provincial Roads Programme: This programme provides assistance to provincial roads departments to help them implement labour-intensive projects and programmes. The assistance is provided in partnership with the national Department of Transport, and focuses on rural access roads.

ENVIRONMENT AND CULTURE SECTOR

The environment and culture sector builds South Africa’s natural and cultural heritage, and in doing so, dynamically uses heritage to create both medium- and long-term work and social benefits, while at the same time responding to climate-change challenges.

The key aim of the sector is to deliver programmes that create WOs and link people in the marginalised ‘second economy’ with opportunities and resources that enable their participation in the developed ‘first economy’, through generating useful outputs and positive outcomes in the areas of environment, heritage (including tourism development) and biodiversity.

The objectives of the sector are:

• To create jobs and provide training, and through these jobs, facilitate long-term employment;
• To link marginalised people with opportunities and resources, to enable their participation in the developed ‘mainstream economy’;
• To integrate sustainable rural development and urban renewal;
• To create land-based livelihoods;
• To promote community-based natural resource management;
• To develop natural resources and cultural heritage;
• To rehabilitate natural resources and protect biodiversity; and
• To promote tourism.

Key environment and culture projects include:

• sustainable land-based livelihoods,
• waste management,
• tourism and creative industries,
• parks and beautification,
• coastal management, and
• sustainable energy.
SOCIAL SECTOR

A key focus of the social sector is to equip pre-school teachers and support staff with adequate training so that they can pass on their knowledge to benefit the country’s children in the long term. The social cluster comprises the Departments of Social Development, Education, and Health. Much of the work of these three departments relies on the input of volunteers and civil-society organisations, and is suitable for the development of the EPWP.

While a number of programmes present a range of opportunities for work creation, the following programmes have been selected as flagship programmes for the social sector:

- **Early childhood development (ECD):** The main purpose of early childhood development is to protect the child’s rights. The ultimate goal is to improve young children’s capacity to develop and learn. ECD interventions include educating and supporting parents, delivering services to children, developing the capabilities of caregivers and teachers, and using mass communication to enhance parents’ and caregivers’ knowledge and practices.

- **Home/community-based care (HCBC):** This entails the provision of comprehensive services, including health and social services, by formal and informal caregivers in the HCBC support programmes. It is prioritised as a cost-effective response substitute for a significant portion of AIDS-related hospital care. The programme aims to facilitate the laying of the foundation for launching the Community Health and Development Worker Programme, by equipping unemployed individuals with foundation skills and experience.

- **School nutrition programme:** Community members are employed as food handlers to provide food to children from needy families, thereby addressing malnutrition.

- **Community crime prevention:** Community members are encouraged, by employing volunteers in EPWP projects, to help identify community safety priorities for their neighbourhoods.

- **School mass participation:** Work opportunities are provided to sports coaches, and members of the public are encouraged to participate actively in sports. The objective is to promote good health, self-realisation, community development, and social cohesion.

- **Kha Ri Gude (Tshivenda for ‘let us learn’):** This is a mass literacy campaign aimed at adults who missed out on schooling and who cannot read or write, inviting them to join literacy classes provided across the country.

NON-STATE SECTOR (NSS)

The NSS comprises the Community Work Programme (CWP) and the NPOs. The CWP is area-based, and is managed by the Department of Cooperative Governance. The NPO is institutionally-based, and is managed by the DPW – which, as the custodian of the programme, offers an administration fee and wage subsidy towards the wages of the individuals employed in the non-profit organisations.

The purposes of the NSS programme are:

- To create an avenue through which NPOs can assist government in creating income for large numbers of individuals through socially constructive activities in their local communities;

- To provide accredited training to beneficiaries so that at the end of the year, beneficiaries can evolve into the second phase of the job market, which would be to exit into full-time jobs in line with the six job drivers of government’s new growth path;

- To encourage municipalities to use the human capacity of NPOs funded by the NSS; and

- To develop local communities through municipal IDP projects.
### CHALLENGES FACED BY THE CITIES

Based on the responses obtained from the cities, and analysis of existing documentation, Table 6 highlights some of the major challenges facing the cities in implementing the EPWP, as well as potential solutions to those challenges.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHALLENGES</th>
<th>POTENTIAL SOLUTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Lack of organisational capacity to manage and coordinate the EPWP in the city | • Fill all available positions in the city’s institutional arrangements.  
• Ensure technical capacity in the cities.                                   |
| Lack of buy-in and commitment from all departments and entities in the city | Include EPWP performance indicators in the scorecards of all heads of departments in order to ensure accountability and commitment to EPWP initiatives and targets. Political champions can also assist in generating buy-in and commitment across the city. |
| Non-compliance with branding regulations by providers responsible for implementing and administering EPWP projects | Stipulate all branding requirements in supply chain management and contract documentation. |
| Under-reporting, and ineffective reporting mechanisms.                    | Stipulate reporting requirements in contract documentation.  
Appoint additional data capturers to increase reporting capacity.            |
| Beneficiaries’ expectations that they will receive full-time employment.   | Ensure that all beneficiaries understand the conditions of EPWP employment before starting work. |
| Labour disputes and labour displacement because of the EPWP wage rate.     | Standardise the EPWP wage rates within each sector across all cities. The wage rate must be below that of mainstream employment, to mitigate the risk of labour displacement. More effective beneficiary selection processes will also assist in employing the targeted beneficiaries, and not individuals who are already permanently employed. |
| Difficulties in creating WOs and employing persons with disabilities.      | Focus on implementing more disability-friendly projects, such as social-sector projects. Train implementing agents on the definition of ‘persons with disabilities’, to avoid misconceptions. |
| Compliance with regard to the code of good practice and the ministerial determination. | Update cities’ policies with regard to EPWP along with targets and codes of practice to ensure alignment with national DPW determination. |
After an analysis of the challenges reported by the cities in 2013/14, the following was noted regarding the 2014/15 reporting period:

• The challenges reported by the cities have not changed significantly.
• Mitigation measures have also remained the same.
• The most common challenges experienced by the cities were in relation to institutional capacity, EPWP wages and ineffective reporting by the various departments within the cities.

MITIGATION MEASURES IMPLEMENTED BY THE DPW

The DPW has introduced additional mitigation measures in an attempt to help cities overcome these challenges. These include:

• Using baseline allocation to implement the EPWP, rather than only the Integrated Grant allocation that they receive from the NDPW;
• Improving implementation of EPWP Integrated Grant-funded projects. There seem to be delays experienced in implementing, projects not registered, and projects registered and reported on using different project names. The IG prefix must be used on registration of projects;
• Strengthening the EPWP institutional arrangements, and improving coordination in the departments and entities;
• Finalising and adopting the EPWP Policy with the inclusion of EPWP Phase III elements;
• Providing data capturing and reporting support;
• Upgrading management information systems to improve reporting efficiency;
• Providing technical assistance for the development of EPWP policy and institutional arrangements; and
• Providing training to city officials, to ensure thorough understanding of EPWP principles.

CONCLUSION

The EPWP is a great tool that government has formulated to elevate poverty and create employment for unskilled people in South Africa. This programme can be implemented across the infrastructure, social, environment and culture, and non-state sectors. With the main objectives of the programme being skills development, training and generating WOs, projects within the EPWP should be designed and coordinated as labour-intensively as possible. Through this programme, the municipalities are committed to ensuring that the EPWP beneficiaries exit the programme with enough skills to compete in the mainstream labour market. In future, therefore, more emphasis should be placed on providing training through the EPWP, which was seen to be lagging behind in 2014/15.

The SACN member cities have recognised the importance of formulating and updating EPWP policy, along with establishing institutional arrangements in order to ensure effective implementation, monitoring, evaluating and reporting of EPWP projects. Through this, the cities have managed to create institutional capacity and support for the EPWP with political champions, executive management and steering committees.

One of the most common challenges faced by the cities in 2014/15 was labour disputes, regarding wage rates. It is therefore important that EPWP wages are standardised, in order to ensure that beneficiaries are not exploited and that they can earn a decent living. This, in turn, will increase the cities’ potential to create WOs and meet their EPWP targets.
PART III
THE CITIES
PART III

CITY REPORTS
During the 2014/15 reporting period, Buffalo City Municipality generated more work opportunities than in previous financial years, through labour-intensive construction projects in the infrastructure and environment sectors. The city also focused on skills development, through the EPWP Vuk’uphile contractor learnership programme.

**POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION**

The EPWP policy was approved during the 2013/14 financial year, to provide a framework within which the city and its directorates can implement EPWP projects. The purpose of the policy is to “enhance the delivery capacity of the metro with regard to EPWP by addressing challenges, and providing an integrated and coordinated approach to support the implementation of EPWP for the holistic development of our society”. The BCMM EPWP policy document is aimed at providing an enabling environment for the city to increase the implementation of EPWP. The policy will undergo a review process before the end of the current reporting period.

**INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS**

The city approved the EPWP structure in 2013/14, with an EPWP manager to head the unit. The creation of the unit aimed at centralising the programme. In line with the EPWP institutional arrangements and the Protocol Agreement signed by the Minister of Public Works and the Executive Mayor, the Executive Mayor was given the responsibility of providing political leadership. The Executive Mayor subsequently appointed members to champion the EPWP in the infrastructure, environment and culture sectors. The city manager commissioned a task team to oversee the implementation of the EPWP in the city, and to be responsible for providing support for the coordination of the EPWP across all sectors.

Although vacant strategic management positions (such as an EPWP manager) were advertised, they were not filled during 2013/14 or 2014/15. This had a significant effect on the efficiency of the institutional arrangements. Figure 21 illustrates the approved institutional arrangements in the BCMM.

Significant changes that the municipality experienced included:
- The employment of dedicated EPWP data capturers to assist with data capturing and reporting,
- an increased EPWP awareness through engagements, and
- a greater number of work opportunities reported.

**BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR EPWP**

The EPWP unit in Buffalo City Municipality relies mainly on the 5% capacity portion of the EPWP incentive grant received from the NDPW. This allocation is used to ensure adequate project management capacity and monitoring systems. The city relied on grant funding and council budget to fund projects during 2014/15.

Challenges experienced with regard to funding sources included under-reporting by municipal departments, which negatively affected the budget allocation received for the 2015/16 reporting period. Table 7 shows the budget and expenditure for the city over the 2014/15 reporting period.
Table 7: Buffalo City Municipality budget allocations (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2014/15 INCENTIVE GRANT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 1 890 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 1 890 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R 1 595 500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R  294 500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS**

The city prioritised the beneficiation of local residents in the designated areas where the projects are implemented. Buffalo City promoted EPWP principles and re-structured project activities where possible to create greater employment opportunities when implementing projects. There was also an increase in ongoing maintenance opportunities to maintain existing infrastructure. The EPWP policy is silent about LIC requirements being stated in contract and supply chain management documents; however, this has been identified as a gap, and will be addressed during the EPWP policy review.

The city provided on-site training and skills development to locally-employed workers on EPWP projects. The Vuk’uphile contractor learnership programme targeted unemployed previously disadvantaged youth and intends to develop emerging contractors into sustainable construction companies who are able to execute labour-intensive projects. The emphasis of the programme is on developing the entrepreneurial, business, and technical skills required in the construction industry. Ten learner contractors were selected to form part of the BCMM Phase II Vuk’uphile Contractor Learnership Programme.

In terms of EPWP policy, the minimum daily wage rate (whether task-rated or time-rated) paid per beneficiary cannot be less than the minimum wage rate specified in the Ministerial Determination for the EPWP. The wage rate for the same or similar tasks is uniform, and task and time rates comply with the Ministerial Determination on EPWP. The wage rate for the infrastructure sector is sometimes influenced by the South African Forum of Civil Engineering Contractors wage rate.

**PROGRESS**

Buffalo City Municipality implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors. Table 8 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors during 2014/15.

---

**Figure 21: Institutional arrangements – Buffalo City Municipality**
Table 8: Buffalo City Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
<td>658</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure</td>
<td>R63.5 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid</td>
<td>R3.3 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CORNERSTONE PROJECTS AND SUCCESS

Maintenance of Eco Parks in Mdantsane and Duncan Village

Maintenance of Eco Parks is an ongoing project funded through the EPWP incentive grant. It is implemented by the Directorate of Community Services, and its main objectives are to clean up the open spaces in order to prevent illegal dumping, and also to promote efficient use of open spaces in the form of recreational open areas. The maintenance of Eco Parks was done through the employment of EPWP beneficiaries, and created 114 work opportunities. The Eco Parks generated much-needed employment, training and skills transfer.

Operation and maintenance of public facilities in Buffalo City Municipality

This project is aimed at the provision and maintenance of sanitation services to informal settlements throughout the municipality, through the use of labour-intensive construction methods and EPWP employment. The Sanitation Department implemented the project, and created 289 work opportunities.
Rehabilitation and maintenance of asphalt, gravel roads and stormwater in BCM

The Roads Department managed to create 500 work opportunities through maintenance of roads and stormwater infrastructure using EPWP beneficiaries. The programme therefore addresses critical service-delivery needs, and creates job opportunities.

**KEY CHALLENGES**

The challenges experienced by Buffalo City Municipality in 2014/15 include:

- Delays in mainstreaming of the EPWP throughout all Directorates in the municipality
- Lack of commitment from the departments, weakening the support for the EPWP in the municipality
- Under-reporting on projects negatively affected the incentive grant funding received
- Beneficiaries expecting to be employed full-time

**LESSONS LEARNED**

From the challenges and success of 2014/15, the city learned the following lessons, which will help improve the EPWP in the future:

- Commitment is required from both political and administrative leadership to ensure the success of the programme.
- Tenders must pass through the EPWP office before they are advertised, so the number of work opportunities can be calculated.
The City of Johannesburg (CoJ) has achieved and exceeded its set target in the 2014/15 financial year. Through the National Technical Support team the city was able to influence the design of three projects, to ensure that they were LIC-compliant and in line with EPWP guidelines.

The city has successfully launched CoJ EPWP Phase III. The key objectives were to:

- Reflect on the success of EPWP phases I and II, in which the CoJ was a leader in the implementation and management of the programme;
- Consider strategies to improve the impact of the programme during EPWP Phase III;
- Demonstrate how the EPWP can co-exist and serve as a conduit to the Jozi@Work Initiative; and
- Re-affirm the EPWP slogan, *Every Project an EPWP Project*.

In previous financial years the CoJ had to roll over the Integrated Grant. In the 2014/15 financial year, the city managed to use the entire allocation.

**POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION**

The CoJ EPWP Phase III policy framework was approved by Council in July 2015. The policy has been aligned in such a way that it caters for EPWP Phase III strategies, and will ensure the city’s core departments and municipal entities are EPWP-compliant.

Changes or additions to the policy included the following:

- The CoJ’s Growth and Development Strategy (GDS) 2040
- CoJ EPWP co-ordination (with the Executive Mayor as the overall co-ordinator, and political co-ordination by the MMC: Economic Development), and the CoJ Regions as standing members of the EPWP Steering Committee
- EPWP Targets for Phase III (2014/15-2018/19)
- Exit strategy

**INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS**

The City of Johannesburg’s EPWP responsibilities cut across all departments and municipal-owned entities. The EPWP is coordinated by the Department of Economic Development, since it facilitates economic development and job creation, and cuts across all sectors. The city is currently coordinating three sectors: infrastructure, social, and environment and culture.

The approval of the CoJ EPWP Phase III policy framework will mean reimplementation of the institutional arrangements, which is a duplicate of the previous CoJ EPWP Phase II policy framework that was approved in 2009.

The EPWP is coordinated by the Department of Economic Development, and:

- The Executive Mayor, responsible for overall EPWP coordination
- Members of the Municipal Committee (MMCs), responsible for sector coordination
- The City Manager, as an accounting officer
- The Executive Director, as the Chairperson of the CoJ EPWP Steering Committee, and the EPWP unit as a Secretariat
- The EPWP unit, which acts as citywide EPWP coordination and advisory
- Departments, municipal entities and regional offices; in each there is a dedicated EPWP champion who is appointed by the HoD to perform EPWP-related functions

The approval of the CoJ EPWP Phase III policy framework will mean reimplementation of the institutional arrangements, which is a duplicate of the previous CoJ EPWP Phase II policy framework that was approved in 2009.

The EPWP is coordinated by the Department of Economic Development, and:

- The Executive Mayor, responsible for overall EPWP coordination
- Members of the Municipal Committee (MMCs), responsible for sector coordination
- The City Manager, as an accounting officer
- The Executive Director, as the Chairperson of the CoJ EPWP Steering Committee, and the EPWP unit as a Secretariat
- The EPWP unit, which acts as citywide EPWP coordination and advisory
- Departments, municipal entities and regional offices; in each there is a dedicated EPWP champion who is appointed by the HoD to perform EPWP-related functions

During 2014/15, the City of Johannesburg relied mainly on incentive grant funding and allocations from the capital and operating expenditure budgets to implement EPWP projects.
BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR EPWP

During 2014/15, the City of Johannesburg relied mainly on incentive grant funding and allocations from the capital and operating expenditure budgets to implement EPWP projects. Using internal funding allowed the city to maximise the EPWP opportunities available. Table 9 shows the grant allocations and expenditure for City of Johannesburg in 2014/15.

Table 9: City of Johannesburg budget allocations (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2014/15 incentive grant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Challenges experienced with regard to the EPWP Integrated Grant:
• Delays in the implementation of the funded projects
• Slow spending/late submission of claims so payments are not processed on time.

EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS

The city has always adhered to the Ministerial Determination and Code of Good Practice when implementing its projects and recruiting EPWP participants. It was unable to conclude the consultation process to ensure that the EPWP rate is standardised, or rather, ‘flat’, which is expected to deal with the issue of EPWP participants stopping projects because they want to be paid higher rates. The City of Johannesburg has ensured that EPWP participants are not kept in a project for longer than 12 months, since in the past this has created expectations of permanent absorption, especially in the social and environment and culture sectors.

PROGRESS

The City of Johannesburg implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors. Table 10 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors in 2014/15.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 10: City of Johannesburg EPWP progress (2014/15)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In 2014/15, the CoJ increased the number of projects by 22% from 2013/14 reporting period. This increase resulted in the creation of 3 329 more work opportunities, a 14% increase. However, even with an increase in the number of WOs, the FTEs have decreased by 2.1% compared to 2013/14.

CORNERSTONE PROJECTS AND SUCCESS

Dobsonville Housing project

The project was implemented by the Johannesburg Social Housing Company (JOSHCO) through the City of Johannesburg’s line budget. The project entails building 502 rental housing units, delivering 152 one-bedroom units and 350 two-bedroom homes for the rental market. JOSHCO’s mandate was to increase supplies of low-cost housing so that people who earn between R3 500 and R7 000 would have a roof over their heads, and eventually move into bonded houses once their economic situation improves. The NDPW technical support team assisted in the design of the project, so that LIC was not compromised.
The recruitment process for the EPWP participants was in accordance with the EPWP Ministerial Determination; before recruitment, a survey was conducted to check unemployment levels in the area. Recruitment was based on the number of unemployed persons in a household. The project has created over 200 work opportunities, with the expectation of creating 700 work opportunities. The project also recognised the opportunity to assist students who have completed their theoretical work in engineering to acquire practical exposure in the construction environment, and six students were identified.

**KEY CHALLENGES**

The challenges experienced by the City of Johannesburg in 2014/15 include:

- Creating opportunities for PWDs
- Inconsistent wage for EPWP participants and community liaison officers (CLO)
- Expectations of permanent absorption by EPWP participants
- EPWP Policy Approval, which delayed implementation of changes

**LESSONS LEARNED**

Lessons learned by the City of Johannesburg that will allow for the future improvement of the EPWP include:

- Determination of work opportunities is decided through past performance – more importantly, from the business plans. However, experience has taught the city that not all planned projects are implemented, which has an impact on achieving the set annual targets.
- The longer the EPWP participants are kept in a project, the higher the expectations created for permanent absorption.
The EPWP is a government initiative intended to create short-term work opportunities, linked to training and skills development, for the marginalised: women, youth and people living with disabilities.

The EPWP is not implemented in isolation to other government strategic initiatives. The New Growth Path (NGP) outlines key job drivers, such as targeting more labour-absorbing activities across the main economic sectors; and substantial public investment in infrastructure – to create employment both directly, in construction, operation and maintenance, as well as the production of inputs; and indirectly, by improving efficiency across the economy. EPWP work opportunities are all linked to the NGP job drivers, and are expected to contribute to the NGP targets through the EPWP’s Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) targets.

No single policy offers the solution to youth unemployment; what is needed is a sustained period of accelerated and inclusive economic growth, and a comprehensive set of short-term and long-term policy reforms and initiatives that encompass increasing demand for labour, improving education and skills, and labour market interventions that improve the employability of young people.

In the City of Tshwane (CoT), the EPWP can and should play a meaningful role in the following sectors, because they have the potential and need to be further developed to support objectives of economic growth and job creation:

- Agriculture & Farming
- Mining
- Tourism
- SMME development
- Information Technology

A focus on training as an exit strategy should be aligned with and targeted at selected sectors.

**POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION**

The CoT’s EPWP policy aligned to Phase III was approved in November 2014. The policy is supported by the EPWP business plan and sector plans, and is monitored via the EPWP Policy Implementation Monitoring Tool. The policy is valid for a period of five years (2014/15 to 2018/19).

**INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS**

In addition to the designated EPWP staff in the approved institutional arrangements of 2013/14, the city manager appointed EPWP champions for city departments and regions in 2014/15. Regions/departments coordinate internal EPWP steering committee meetings. The EPWP officials sit in EPWP steering committees. Figure 23 illustrates the institutional arrangements for the City of Tshwane, as approved for 2014/15.
BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR EPWP

The CoT relied mainly on incentive grant funding and on allocations from the capital and operating expenditure budgets (as per the IDP) to implement EPWP projects. Although the city receives a significant amount from the incentive grant allocation, the main sources of funding are the capital and operating expenditure budget allocations. Table 11 shows the 2014/15 incentive grant allocation for the city, along with the expenditure.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2014/15 incentive grant</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
<td>R30 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
<td>R30 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
<td>R30 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11: City of Tshwane budget allocations (2014/15)

EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS

In the CoT, EPWP is mainly regulated through national legislation, such as:
- Ministerial Determination 4: Expanded Public Works Programme, No. 35310, gazetted 4 May 2012
- EPWP Guidelines, 2005

Over and above national legislation, the city developed EPWP Policy, an EPWP business plan, and EPWP sector plans for each sector (environment and culture, infrastructure, and social), to provide guidance and assistance with the implementation of the EPWP.

With all systems in place, the city still experienced implementation challenges with regard to conditions of employment – e.g. duration of employment, and study leave for training initiatives, whether arranged by the city or by the learners themselves.

The silence of EPWP legislation on this issue makes implementation difficult. The city regards training as the only means of getting people out of poverty and into more sustainable work. In addition to training opportunities offered by the NDPW, or internally by the city, some learners also register privately. But their supervisors will not grant them study leave, as it is not allowed for in EPWP legislation. EPWP legislation does not contain detail regarding duration of employment or support for skills-development programmes (study leave).

If the period of a project is not specified, there is no valid reason to terminate employment – especially in projects rendering continuous service, such as Vat Alles. This leads to a longer duration of employment, which attracts unions to recruit beneficiaries. It is recommended that EPWP legislation should be read in conjunction with other legislation – again, this poses a challenge, as some other legislation was never meant for use in the EPWP. Referring to every other legislation for EPWP implementation creates inconsistencies for the public bodies that must manage the programme. This also opens a loophole; beneficiaries sometimes refer to only the legislation that favours them on a particular issue, when in fact it is not meant for them.

PROGRESS

The City of Tshwane has implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, environment and culture and social sectors. Table 12 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors during 2014/15.

The city regards training as the only means of getting people out of poverty and into more sustainable work.
Table 12: City of Tshwane EPWP progress (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
<td>34 639</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
<td>7 652</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure</td>
<td>R563.2 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid</td>
<td>R169.3 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The City of Tshwane implemented 3.9% fewer projects in 2014/15 than in 2013/14; however, the city’s expenditure and total wages paid increased by 15% and 24% respectively. This is because for the 3.9% fewer projects, the city managed to increase its WOs and FTEs by 94.7% and 26% respectively.

**CORNERSTONE PROJECTS AND SUCCESS**

**Vat Alles**

Vat Alles is the city’s mayoral project; it was launched in May 2012, and created 6 000 WOs in 2014/15. Beneficiaries in this project are involved with waste management and city beautification activities. The project won the Best Metropolitan and District/Local Environment and Culture sector project category at the national Kamoso awards.

An example: the Vat Alles project made it possible for a Mr Ngoepe achieve his dream job of being a teacher. Mr Ngoepe qualified as a teacher in 1997, but never worked in that profession. He was employed under Vat Alles, and placed at the Eersterust Secondary School in Region 2, as a general worker. The school recognised his possibilities and motivated for his appointment as a teacher, from 2014. He teaches life orientation and social sciences for Grades 8 and 9. He is one of more than 50 beneficiaries to exit from this project to take up permanent employment in different government departments and hospitals.

**Infection Control**

A total 346 beneficiaries employed in health facilities received training on infection control. This was a one-day training course offered by the Department of Health and Social Development in the city. Each beneficiary was issued with a certificate of attendance.
The city introduced the ABET programme to EPWP beneficiaries without a senior certificate. The programme started in 2015, with 101 learners. It is currently in its second phase, with 234 learners. Classes are attended once a week.

CoT EPWP Implementers Forum

The city established an EPWP implementers’ forum in August 2015. The forum consists of all government departments implementing projects in the city, or capable of implementing projects in the future. The forum objectives are:
- To ensure that there is synergy in the manner in which the EPWP is implemented in the city;
- To measure and report internally on the overall impact of the EPWP in the city;
- To share information and address implementation challenges collectively.

KEY CHALLENGES

The key challenge experienced by the city in 2014/15 was regarding legislation (Ministerial Determination 4):
- There was no clear direction with regard to duration of employment, wage rate, or unionisation of beneficiaries.

LESSONS LEARNED

In 2014/15, the following key lessons learned were noted by the City:
- The city must place more emphasis on the maximisation of work opportunities through the involvement of champions.
- The increase in WOs will help in improving EPWP implementation and performance in the future.

The city must place more emphasis on the maximisation of work opportunities through the involvement of champions.
The Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality has implemented EPWP projects in the social, environment and infrastructure sectors. Projects in the social sector are implemented through Health and Social Development, Emergency Services and Metro Police departments. Infrastructure sector projects are more usually from the Water, Roads and Stormwater departments.

Most of the expenditure in the social and environment sectors goes towards salaries; which was the reason for increased expenditure per WO created by the city in 2014/15. New projects were initiated for rodent control, a Community Emergency Response Team programme, the Lungile Mtshali community project, etc.

The city only used 30.8% of its allocated budget in 2014/15, but saw an increase in WOs and FTEs generated. Most of the WOs in the other cities were generated from infrastructure projects; however, 70% of the projects in Ekurhuleni were from the environment and social sectors. This was as a result of a resolution taken by the city in 2013/14, to implement a larger number of projects in these two sectors.

**POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION**

The city’s policy was formulated and updated for alignment with Phase III of the EPWP, which began this year (2014/15). The policy is still in the approval process, which began in 2013/14. It is alarming that the process of approving the policy has taken so long, and the city recognises that without an approved policy, it will be difficult to hold the various departments accountable for non-compliance. This is especially applicable to the principles and targets of Phase III.

**INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS**

The municipality started with the process of filling the positions approved during the restructuring process. All the top positions were filled, but for the bottom posts, only critical posts were filled. This left the EPWP programme with minimal staff: a divisional head, a programme manager, and one coordinator. Students assisted in the management of the programme. Positions are still vacant for three project managers, a project administrator and two data capturers. Figure 24 illustrates the approved institutional arrangements for Ekurhuleni for 2014/15.
BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR THE EPWP

All the funds that were allocated to Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality were allocated to the Community Emergency Response team programme, in the social sector. The funds are used as an incentive for departments that are performing well. Funds are also used for initiative projects, with the municipality intending to continue with such projects in the coming years. This has been proved to work with certain programmes, increasing the work opportunities generated by the municipality. Though this seems to work for the departments that receive an allocation, the departments that do not get an allocation become demotivated, and slow down their reporting. The process of budgeting in the municipality starts in October, and the grant funding is only announced in March. This makes it difficult to plan for projects in advance, resulting in delayed project implementation. Table 13 shows the incentive budget allocations for the city, and the expenditure for 2014/15.

Table 13: Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality budget allocations (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2014/15 incentive grant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
<td>R6.42 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
<td>R6.42 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
<td>R6.42 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS

All the projects implemented in 2014/15 adhered to the minimum requirements for employment in the EPWP, including minimum payments, COIDA and UIF. There was engagement with all departments, to ensure that EPWP conditions such as leave days, working hours, contracts, attendance registers and other documentation required by the EPWP are complied with. Branding remains a challenge for projects that are implemented throughout the municipality. At the moment, only protective clothing for such projects is branded, and they do not have signboards.

PROGRESS

Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors. Table 14 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors during 2014/15.

Table 14: Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
<td>8 434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
<td>4401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure</td>
<td>R152.5 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid</td>
<td>R99 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The number of projects implemented by the city decreased by 1% from 2013/14 to 2014/15; however, this decrease had no major effect on the WOs and FTEs generated. The city’s WOs and FTEs increased by 41% and 175% respectively. These increases resulted in a R40.4 million (36%) increase in expenditure, and a 113% increase in wages paid (a total wage increase of R52.6 million).

**CORNERSTONE PROJECTS AND SUCCESS**

**Community Emergency Response Team (CERT) Programme**

The main successes in Ekurhuleni have been the IRPTN programme in the infrastructure sector, and the CERT programme in the social sector. The Vuk’uphile construction development programme has also worked well; the second intake of 20 learner contractors and 20 supervisors is about to complete their training. Some of the contractors from the first intake of the programme are now competing countrywide. The programme became one of the city’s focal points, leading to a request for 100 contractors and 100 supervisors to be trained in the next year. All the infrastructure projects under Economic Development for 2014/15 were implemented using Vuk’uphile learners.

**KEY CHALLENGES**

The challenges experienced by Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality in 2014/15 included:
- Projects implemented directly by the municipality saw a lot of protests in which participants demanded full-time employment. A letter from the Department of Labour has assisted in dealing with this issue.
- Several incidents of unrest also occurred, concerning minimum wages paid. This was dealt with through meetings with the participants.
- Restructuring in the municipality has led to some departments having a lot of new staff, who needed orientation.

**LESSONS LEARNED**

There are two key lessons that the city learned in 2014/15 that will help in improving EPWP implementation in the future. These were:
- It is crucial to give participants a thorough orientation at the beginning of a project, in order to avoid unnecessary protests.
- There is potential for the municipality to create more employment; however, the various departments must be motivated and assisted with new innovations.
During 2014/15, eThekwini Municipality was committed to sustaining EPWP principles in the city's most relevant projects, if not all of them. The city has recognised that in order for the EPWP to be effective, it must incorporate LIC methods into all projects undertaken by the city to stimulate economic growth.

The EPWP has been operating successfully in eThekwini Municipality for over five years, and has significantly benefited not only the municipality, but also a number of beneficiaries. The strategic focus has assisted the city to achieve or exceed WO and FTE targets set, by creating more jobs in trying to alleviate poverty and unemployment in the city.

Many lessons were learned during the course of EPWP operations. In the past year, vast improvements have been noted in the implementation and maintaining of the EPWP in the city. This is due to proactively identifying and addressing challenges that have surfaced over past years, and effectively improving the current situation.

The city’s EPWP administration, reporting and governance requirements have improved dramatically in 2014/15, which is attributable to the following:

- Progress towards the approval of the EPWP Framework Policy
- Improved reporting through awareness and consistency
- Audits (internal and external), which have highlighted significant compliance and procedural inadequacies
- Registration and deduction/payment of UIF contributions
- Plans to report directly to the office of the city manager

eThekwini Municipality has received the Kamoso Award for Best-Performing Municipality in South Africa. The city’s intention is to keep this achievement in the foreground, to remind eThekwini to maintain their outstanding performance.

The incentive grant project listing was amended from the original list for the 2014/15 period, in line with current projects undertaken. This amendment was accepted and approved by the NDPW. Certain projects were internally funded, and thus were removed from the original incentive grant list. These funds were now available for other much-needed projects. Consequently, the incentive grant was insufficient for a large Metropolitan Municipality such as eThekwini.

A dedicated human resources practitioner has been assigned to address all EPWP issues in eThekwini. This has helped lighten the burden of the EPWP department, adding a professional touch to human resources.

The new Management Information System (MIS) has posed a major challenge since implementation. Going forward, outcomes reporting for WOs and FTEs may be adversely affected by these challenges. Contingency plans have been implemented to efficiently manage the situation.

**POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION**

The eThekwini EPWP 2014/15 policy is presently in an advanced stage of review, progressing to final authorisation. The policy has been circulated to senior managers for review and comment. The formulation and adoption of the policy aim to integrate the EPWP principles into the Independent Development Plan (IDP) for all projects implemented. The finalisation of the policy would allow for greater facilitation within the eThekwini EPWP Programme with all of its latest updates, and entrench the objectives, goals and vision of EPWP in eThekwini. It would also align eThekwini’s policy with that of the EPWP Integrated Manual.

**INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS**

During 2014/15, eThekwini Municipality continued to operate within the existing institutional arrangements established to govern the EPWP in the municipality. The dedicated EPWP unit was responsible for overall coordination and administrative support of the programme. The EPWP task group, consisting of champions for each cluster or sector in the municipality, also supported the coordination of the EPWP. The task group included representatives from treasury, skills development, supply chain management, and human resources.
A nominated councillor provided political support for the programme. The EPWP task group managed the coordination of the EPWP, and was directly responsible for ensuring integrated planning, coordination, monitoring and reporting of all EPWP activities in each cluster. The department continued to face re-structuring in the past year, which resulted in vacant positions. The vacant positions influenced the coordination and success of the EPWP in the municipality. It is envisaged that the vacant positions and restructuring in the department will be finalised before the end of the next reporting period. However, the current institutional arrangements do allow acceptable capacity for EPWP operations. Figure 25 shows the approved institutional arrangements for eThekwini Municipality.

BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR EPWP

The main EPWP funding sources for eThekwini Municipality during the 2014/15 reporting period included:
- Capital budget
- Operational budget
- Various grant and institutional funding

Using internal municipal funding has allowed the city to maximise the available EPWP work opportunities created. Table 15 shows the incentive budget allocations for the city in 2014/15, along with expenditure.

Table 15: eThekwini Municipality budget allocations (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2014/15 incentive grant</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
<td>R34 154 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
<td>R34 154 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
<td>R35 626 253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance (over-expenditure)</td>
<td>R1 472 253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
<td>104,31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
<td>104,31%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The over-expenditure of R1.5 million was funded from the internal adjustment budget.

Challenges experienced with regard to the funding sources during this reporting period included:

- Insufficient grant funding received from the NDPW, which limited the expansion of the EPWP in the municipality.
- Inadequate budget allocated to EPWP projects from the capital and operating expenditure budgets, as departments relied largely on grant funding. This limited the number of projects that can be implemented in a financial year, and affected the continuity of existing projects.
- Inconsistent distribution of funds across the various sectors, which affected the success and continuity of projects.

**EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS**

The city has followed best practice in terms of employment conditions, adhering to the Ministerial Determination for EPWP, and the Basic Conditions of Employment Act. The city has promoted EPWP awareness, and focused on designing project activities in line with EPWP principles.

The municipality maximised EPWP WOs at project level through the EPWP sector plans produced by each cluster in the municipality. The sector plans incorporated the EPWP objectives across all projects within each sector, identifying all EPWP employment opportunities and maximising WOs.

The municipality encouraged LIC methods for all its projects, where possible. A number of labour-intensive programmes were funded by the operating or capital expenditure budgets, to ensure the sustainability and continuation of the EPWP. Although the municipality promoted LIC, the supply-chain management and contract documentation did not specify or regulate EPWP and LIC requirements. This is being attended to, by changes to the supply-chain management policy.

The provision of training and skills development initiatives came mainly in the form of on-site training, which promoted the sustainability of employment, while ensuring infrastructure and efficient service delivery. As the emphasis shifted towards sustainable employment, training, and skills development, the municipality promoted the implementation of successful exit strategies.

eThekwini Municipality adopted a policy of standardised wage rates, adhering to the minimum wage requirements in accordance with the Ministerial Determinations. The wage rates paid to beneficiaries were generally above the defined minimum wage rate, but varied across sectors depending on the type of work done.

**PROGRESS**

eThekwini Municipality implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors. Table 16 shows the progress of the municipality across the aforementioned sectors for 2014/15.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 16: eThekwini Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The city created 35 665 WOs through the implementation of 130 EPWP projects that collectively generated 8 610 FTEs. This indicates an increase of 55 projects (a 50% increase since 2013/14), a decrease of 876 in WOs (3% fewer than in 2013/14), and a 451-FTE increase (a 6% improvement over 2013/14). eThekwini Municipality has progressively created valuable resources over the past period, building on the negative experiences and challenges that it underwent.
The UMZ Programme is a multi-faceted programme designed to support assets, create urban infrastructure, ensure operational and maintenance resources so that assets are properly maintained, and build an environment that is well managed. The full intention is to improve the quality of life of all stakeholders, thus contributing to the city’s ‘investment quality’ and creating employment. The programme’s objective is to contribute to sustainable urban management, through facilitating the integration and management of municipal services.

Cleaning within the UMZ Boundary is undertaken by the Cleansing and Solid Waste (CSW) programme. In order to ensure that the city’s objectives were met and the identified gaps were closed, EPWP workers were brought in as a top-up service for street-sweeping/cleaning. The scope and service levels were based on the outcome of the gap analysis and service-level discussions with CSW and other stakeholders.

In discussions with the Parks Department, it became evident that the department’s capacity was limited. Regular watering of plants and weeding are prerequisites for maintaining the gardens in the area. The Parks Department limit their activities to planting, and do not undertake the watering and weeding activities necessary. EPWP workers were brought in as a top-up service to assist with weeding, and the removal of weeds from hard surfaces and flower beds.

EPWP workers also assist Roads and Stormwater Maintenance with their drain-cleaning programme. In addition, EPWP workers assist Signage and Advertising in removing the illegal stickers in the CBD, and also assist with the clean-ups for the Clean and Maintain My City campaign, and any other task, as and when required by other Line Departments.

A total of 105 beneficiaries benefited from the grant for this project, made up of 32 males and 73 females from previously disadvantaged backgrounds.
The Safety Volunteer programme is a crime-prevention initiative that provides safety awareness and visibility to high-risk areas to limit criminal activities targeted at unsuspecting victims, particularly during peak winter and summer seasons in the eThekwini Municipal Area.

The project is aimed at reducing criminality in targeted areas, increasing crime awareness, and promoting coordinated crime prevention (with law enforcement agencies, job creation, and skills development) to ensure the safety of communities. Safer Cities and the I trump Unit have employed more than 800 beneficiaries to sustain this project.

Outcomes of the project include building confidence in commuters using public transport, a reduction in muggings and pick-pocketing in congested areas, safe customers and investor confidence, high-risk areas identified, and the identification of various criminal activities.

The project is under the supervision of Safer Cities and the I trump Unit, and pursues the 2030 Vision of creating a caring and liveable city.

KEY CHALLENGES
Key challenges experienced by eThekwini Municipality in 2014/15 were:
- Projects not timeously approved, delaying the commencement of work
- Projects not registered on MIS
- Recruitment setbacks
- Staff challenges – wanting permanent employment, and resorting to CCMA intervention
- Contractors not using EPWP branding
- Inconsistent rate of pay across sectors/departments
- Training person-days not being reported
- Critical need for greater Government funding for eThekwini in supporting EPWP
- Reporting of training days should be compulsory.
- Follow-up on data-capture rejections is required; it impacts on the accuracy of reported statistics.
- eThekwini has appointed a dedicated EPWP HR practitioner to contend with beneficiary challenges regarding labour disputes.
- The communication process could be enhanced by educating key EPWP personnel and department managers in aligning their programmes with job-creation initiatives.
- Institutional arrangements must be in place in order to provide strategic focus on and coordination of EPWP.
- Timeous and accurate reporting are required, so that there is an early indication of deviations from plan and these can be adequately addressed.
- Sector reporting must be enhanced and streamlined; projects are still being reported under ‘infrastructure’.
- Exit strategies must be defined, especially with contractors.
- Project managers must be encouraged to provide for the EPWP in their Municipal budget.

LESSONS LEARNED
Some of the operational challenges experienced have led to the following lessons learned:
- Branding with contractors is a challenge; contractor agreements should include a clause about the use of EPWP-branded PPE.
In 2014/15, the city implemented projects in the infrastructure and environment and culture sectors. Enterprise Projects were created and have not yet been reported under the EPWP. Notwithstanding the above, the city has received positive feedback from the National Department of Public Works in terms of progress made in establishing a unit focusing on the implementation of the EPWP programme. The high number of training days reported by Mangaung due to the implementation of the Vuk’uphile learnership roads programme was also commended by the NDPW.

Thanks to other funding streams being provided for the infrastructure sector, the city manager approved using the 2014/15 EPWP incentive grant to fund projects in the social and environment and culture sectors. The EPWP champion ensures that there is effective, efficient, economical and transparent use of the resources allocated to the municipality for EPWP project implementation.

POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION

The Mangaung EPWP policy was approved in March 2014, and at the first meeting (on 20 November 2014), the steering committee was established. The committee made determinations regarding the following:

- The development management plan
- Reviewing the policy
- Aligning the EPWP to the IDP
- Incorporating the EPWP target in the performance agreement scorecards of senior officials

The Executive Mayor signed the protocol agreement and nominated the Deputy Executive Mayor to champion the EPWP overall. Mangaung is in the process of reviewing the policy; it has gone through the necessary consultation process, and is now awaiting approval by Council.

INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS

In line with the EPWP Institutional Arrangements Framework and Protocol Agreement signed by the Minister of Public Works and the Executive Mayor, the Executive Mayor shall provide leadership and direction on the implementation of the EPWP in the municipality. The Executive Mayor appointed three Members of the Mayoral Committee (MMCs) to champion and lead each EPWP sector in the municipality. The appointed MMCs will also ensure that the EPWP is aligned with the IDP and key policies and projects of the Municipality.

The city manager nominated an HOD: Strategic Projects and Service Delivery Regulations, and delegated to him the overall coordination of the EPWP in the city. The city manager must also ensure that all the HODs have the EPWP as an item in their performance contracts/agreements. The appointed/delegated HOD must ensure that the EPWP is incorporated in the development plan of the municipality, and must also ensure that each directorate incorporates the EPWP FTE targets into their project plans. The appointed/delegated HOD must ensure the effective coordination as well as the monitoring and implementation of the EPWP in the municipality, and assist and mobilise directorates in the municipality to meet their EPWP targets.

Mangaung does not have a structure specific to the
The current structure is illustrated in Figure 26. Appointments were made to build institutional capacity; a Manager: Service Delivery Monitoring was delegated to manage EPWP coordination in the city, with two project coordinators. The manager is a central point of contact for departmental coordination.

The following directorates were identified as potential contributors to EPWP work opportunities:

- Social Services
- Engineering Services
- Fleet & Waste Management
- Human Settlement and Housing
- Corporate Services
- Office of the Executive Mayor (Youth Unit)
- Planning
- LED
- Centlec

No appointment of EPWP coordination structures has been made. The structure may need to be revised upon approval by Council.

**BUDGET ALLOCATION FOR EPWP**

The main EPWP funding sources for Mangaung were the Urban Settlement Development Grant (USDG) and the EPWP incentive grant. Table 17 shows the incentive grant allocation for the municipality, along with the expenditure for 2014/15.

The main challenge that the city faced regarding funding was that expenditure (an indication of progress) was delayed, due to the late start of projects; the late start was due to problems related to recruitment of EPWP participants.
Table 17: Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality budget allocations (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2014/15 incentive grant</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
<td>R2 431 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
<td>R2 431 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
<td>R2 431 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
<td>100 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS

In 2014/15, the EPWP participants were employed under the conditions of employment as stipulated in the Ministerial Determination and Code of Good Practice for the EPWP. The municipality undertook to ensure that its projects comply fully with all labour legislation, such as the Unemployment Insurance Fund Act (Act No.63 of 2001), the Compensation for Injuries and Diseases Act (COIDA), and the Occupational Health and Safety Act (Act No.130 of 1993).

PROGRESS

The Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality implemented projects in the infrastructure and environment and culture sectors. Table 18 shows the progress of the city’s EPWP across these sectors in 2014/15.

Table 18: Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
<td>3 031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
<td>616</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
<td>259.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure</td>
<td>R 39.7 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid</td>
<td>R 12 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The city created 3 031 WOs through the implementation of 61 EPWP projects that collectively generated 616 FTEs. This indicates an increase of 21 projects (a 52.5% increase over 2013/14), a 1 344 increase in WOs (79.7% more than in 2013/14), and a 269-FTE increase (a 77.5% improvement from 2013/14).

The Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality implemented projects in the infrastructure and environment and culture sectors.
CORNERSTONE PROJECTS AND SUCCESS

Community Safety Project and the Cleaning of Open Spaces project.

The projects were identified by the Executive Mayor as suitable for the provision of basic services. Discussions were held between officials and relevant politicians to prioritise the needs of the communities in the various areas.

With respect to finances, the Municipality spent on EPWP job creation and EPWP project implementation in the 2014/15 financial year. All the allocation was transferred to the municipality; none was withheld during the year under review.

Mangaung Metro Municipality selected the Community Safety project and the Cleaning of Open Spaces project, which were funded entirely from the incentive grant allocation, but they were also topped up by the city’s own budget. The project was reporting to the social services directorate and was entirely labour-intensive in nature.

Participants received the following training and skills:
- First Aid training
- Health & Safety training
- EPWP Inductions, and orientation regarding the code of good practice manual and the ministerial determination
- Mangaung Traffic College and Department of Roads and Transport offered the following skills training:
  - Road Safety Education
  - Child in Traffic
  - Rules and signs
  - Point duty
- On the job training was offered on how to use grass cutters, basic horticulture, and how to use tools and work machinery

KEY CHALLENGES

- Under-reporting of projects involving labour-intensive work
- Resistance from other officials in the city, which delayed submission of data
- Slow implementation of EPWP policy
- Lack of compliance with regard to the code of good practice and ministerial determination
- Data collection (quality of data, and incomplete data)

REMEDIAL ACTIONS

- An in-house workshop was held on 3 December 2014, with the following intentions:
  - To increase awareness of EPWP
- To refine EPWP project reporting
- The EMT’s intervention to encourage departments to submit project lists and project data timeously to be registered as EPWP projects
- A monthly steering committee meeting must be used to improve the quality of EPWP reporting and implementation

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Speedy nominations of EPWP champions in the directorate
- Continuous support and interventions for the EPWP by the NDPW
- The directorate is to submit project lists signed by the city manager.
During 2014/15, Msunduzi Municipality continued to encourage the progress of its EPWP implementation throughout all departments. This was achieved through effective coordination and implementation initiatives administered by the EPWP steering committee, in line with the municipality’s EPWP policy.

EPWP projects were implemented mainly in the environment and culture sector. The municipality also emphasised generating employment through infrastructure projects, in order to maximise EPWP employment opportunities. Only a few projects were implemented in the social sector. The municipality thus recognised the need to focus on the social sector to enhance the progress and efficiency of the EPWP.

The appointment of two EPWP administrators and three EPWP supervisors in 2013/14 improved the municipality’s administrative capacity and performance in 2014/15.

**INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS**

An EPWP unit has been set up in the Community Services Business Unit as from 3 November 2014, comprising a manager and three EPWP administration assistants. Other business units in the municipality have been lobbied to be part of the EPWP Steering Committee. The EPWP Unit is responsible for capturing and reporting on all EPWP-related projects in Msunduzi Municipality. These positions are included in the municipality’s institutional arrangements (Figure 27).

**POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION**

The EPWP Policy was approved, for the first time, on 25 September 2013; and effectively adopted by the municipality. Further amendments to the policy were made for alignment with Phase III targets and principles, and these too were approved by the municipality, on 25 February 2015. The EPWP policy, in line with Phase III and incorporating set targets, was amended and approved at a full council meeting on 25 February 2015.

**BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR EPWP**

The municipality relied on incentive grant funding as well as allocations from the capital and operating expenditure budgets to implement projects during this period. Limited availability of municipal budget limited the implementation of proposed EPWP projects. Table 19 shows the incentive grant funding allocated to the municipality for 2014/15, along with the expenditure.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2014/15 incentive grant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS

During 2014/15, the EPWP beneficiaries performed general maintenance duties including grass cutting, cleaning of gutters, street sweeping, and clearing of illegal dumping within the boundaries of the city, and maintenance of city gardens, on a contract of three days a week for a period of 12 months. All beneficiaries were remunerated on a monthly basis at a rate of R120 per day. Through this, the city has been able to maximise WOs generated for 2014/15. Conditions of Service are observed for all beneficiaries according to the existing Ministerial Determination guidelines. There has also been an emphasis on utilising LIC methods in the infrastructure sector, in order to increase the WOs generated by the city.

PROGRESS

Msunduzi Municipality implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, social, and environment and culture sectors. Table 20 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors during 2014/15.
Table 20: Msunduzi Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
<td>1,650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
<td>706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure</td>
<td>R16.6 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid</td>
<td>R16.3 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Through the relatively low number of projects (20) implemented in 2014/15, the Msunduzi Municipality managed to increase the WOs generated by 199 (a 13.7% increase from 2013/14), and FTEs by 92 (a 15% increase from 2013/14). This was achieved by increasing the wages paid by 5%, encouraging more beneficiaries to take up EPWP work. Even though there was a R700 000 increase in the wages paid by the municipality in 2014/15, expenditure decreased by R5.5 million. The decrease in expenditure can be attributed to the 30% decrease in the number of projects implemented in 2014/15 compared to 2013/14.

CORNERSTONE PROJECTS AND SUCCESS

Revitalisation of Alexandra Park (Environment & Culture)

Revitalisation of Alexandra Park is a new project that the municipality has implemented in collaboration with the Department of Environmental Affairs. A total of 64 beneficiaries were appointed on 12-month contracts.

The decrease in expenditure can be attributed to the 30% decrease in the number of projects implemented in 2014/15 compared to 2013/14.
Alien Plant Eradication

A total of 10 beneficiaries are employed for a period of twelve months to eradicate alien invasive plants within the Msunduzi Municipality boundaries. Beneficiaries are trained to identify alien plants, and also to apply recommended herbicide to discourage further growth.

City Clean-up:

A total of 200 beneficiaries are employed on 12-month contracts to clean up the city streets and lanes, on a three-day-a-week rotational basis. Maintenance such as grass cutting, street sweeping and clearing of overgrown gutters and pavements is done by this team, under contract supervisors.

CHALLENGES

The Msunduzi Municipality experienced the following challenges in 2014/15, which affected the implementation of the EPWP:

- Beneficiaries demanding permanent employment.
- Not all EPWP projects implemented by the municipality were reported on.
- Beneficiaries demanding indefinite contracts, without giving others the opportunity to be employed.
- Lack of strategies to access additional grant funding sources to increase work opportunities generated by the municipality.

LESSONS LEARNED

Through the challenges experienced in 2014/15, the municipality learned the following lessons:

- The municipality must continue its active participation in order to expand the implementation of the programme.
- Labour intensity must be improved, by increasing the available sources of funding internally.
- Technical capacity must be improved for labour-intensive operations.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Ongoing support and capacity-building should be provided jointly by the NDPW and provincial DPW, targeting municipalities that trail behind in sensitising matters relating to the EPWP.
NELSON MANDELA BAY METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY

During the last financial year (2013/14), Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality officially appointed a city manager. This appointment significantly enhanced the efficiency of the city’s EPWP coordination, as it allowed for enhanced capacity as well as continuity throughout the implementation and expansion of its EPWP activities.

Furthermore, the appointment of the city manager allowed Nelson Mandela Bay to focus on mainstreaming its EPWP coordination through the city’s dedicated EPWP unit. The EPWP unit was therefore relocated from the Special Programmes Directorate to the office of the Chief Operating Officer, to allow for centralisation of EPWP coordination. The relocation of the EPWP unit brought it closer to the centre of administration in the city manager’s office.

On 13 January 2014 the EPWP unit was relocated to the office of the Chief Operating Officer (COO), which is an extension of the city manager’s office. Politically, the COO’s office falls under the Deputy Mayor’s office.

POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION

The city’s EPWP Policy was approved and adopted in October 2011, and has not been reviewed since. However, requests have been made to the executive directors for inputs. The framework for the implementation of EPWP in Nelson Mandela Bay is still being guided by the policy that was approved in 2011, along with coordination and enforcement of compliance.

A Public Employment Programme committee (political and technical) was established in September 2014 to lead the EPWP in the city. This will assist the EPWP office to unblock some of the bottlenecks, and also align the city’s policy to Phase III of the EPWP.

INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS

The city’s institutional arrangements were revised in 2013/14, and adapted and implemented for 2014/15 (see Figure 28). The unit currently has four funded posts, of which two (of the contract positions) are filled. With the implementation of the Labour Relations Amendment Act, there is a possibility that all EPWP contractual staff may be converted to permanent employees.

BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR EPWP

In 2014/15, the city relied on incentive grant allocations, which were used to fund EPWP projects and programmes as budgeted for in each directorate. The city experienced the following challenges with regard to funding:

• Late start of projects due to continuous changing of the business plan, resulting in slow expenditure
• Continuous decrease in grant funding, due to under-reporting by directorates

Table 21 shows the incentive grant allocation to Nelson Mandela Bay for 2014/15, along with the expenditure.
Table 21: Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality budget allocations (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2014/15 incentive grant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 28: Institutional arrangements – Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality
EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS

Nelson Mandela Bay maximised its EPWP WOs at project level by ensuring that EPWP principles were accommodated, right from the planning stages of projects. The DPW provided technical support to the Design and Implementation directorate to ensure that all EPWP and LIC activities were identified and included during the planning stages of all projects.

In order to ensure commitment and accountability in EPWP performance, the city established EPWP WO targets for each directorate. The targets were calculated based on budget allocation per directorate, and performance was reviewed quarterly.

In 2014/15, some directorates incorporated EPWP requirements into their specifications. EPWP targets were included in the executive director’s score cards to maximise employment creation and ensure accountability and compliance.

PROGRESS

Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, social, and environment and culture sectors. Table 22 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors during the 2014/15 reporting period.

Table 22: Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality EPWP progress (2014/15)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CORNERSTONE PROJECTS AND SUCCESS

Job Creation Through Visual Arts and Chess

Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality has created employment for 30 beneficiaries through the Visual Arts and Chess programme. The creative arts programme is not only about the development of urban renewal art pieces, but also concentrates on the training of emerging artists, job creation, education, raising public awareness, and promoting the cultural industry as a driver of urban renewal.

This multi-dimensional approach is essential to allow the Mandela Bay Development Agency to be the driver of an economic focus on art, culture and heritage, in conjunction with strategic partners and aligned institutions, to fulfil its mandate to regenerate content in open spaces in its mandated area. The project is fundamental as a secondary economic driver in a region where urban industrialism has limitations with respect to job creation, and alternate secondary industry is limited to informal seasonal jobs, with little or no creative products filling the vacuum.

An amount of R17 million was invested by the city for public art and art events programmes, in order to ensure that the city becomes one of the key tourism destinations of the Eastern Cape. The programme has garnered national and international interest, and this application seeks to continue the programming of the visual art aspect of local economic development.
KEY CHALLENGES

The following are some of the challenges experienced by Nelson Mandela Bay in 2014/15:

• Non-compliance with Auditor General Requirements results in loss of reported WOs and FTEs
• Under-reporting by line directorates on WOs created
• A lack of creativity from the directorates when designing projects that could have yielded more WOs
• Executive directors not holding project managers accountable for not reporting on WOs created
• Implementing directorates are still not ensuring that EPWP-branded signboards are put up in their respective projects.
• Delays in starting dates of projects due to wage-rate disputes, where the minimum rate as per the Ministerial Determination is said to be too low.

LESSONS LEARNED

From the challenges experienced in 2014/15, the following lessons were learned:

• EPWP targets must be included on executive directors’ scorecards, so as to improve performance and accountability.
• EPWP should be accountable to its own Portfolio Committee.
• EPWP should be reinstated and form part of the Supply Chain Management Committees, in order to enforce EPWP compliance for tender documents.
PART IV
CASE STUDIES
PART IV
CASE STUDIES
BACKGROUND

The project was conceived by the Johannesburg Property Company – a physical verification of the CoJ property portfolio in order to ascertain that all the data pertaining to each council-owned piece of land is gathered and up to date.

The physical verification project began in August 2014 as a manual process, which included the following:

- Manual data capture on hard-copy report templates
- Desktop navigation on the Geographical Information System (GIS) to find location and property details
- Taking pictures with cameras and phones
- Daily uploading of reports and pictures
- Daily capturing of data in the asset register database

INTRODUCTION

The Johannesburg Property Company has a custodial responsibility towards the City of Johannesburg to ensure the appropriate control and upkeep of council-owned land, which includes full awareness of the status of the CoJ property portfolio. The Johannesburg Property Company is responsible for all activities associated with common-law ownership, including a custodian asset-management plan to warrant that assets are:

- Efficiently and effectively managed throughout their life cycle;
- Provided in a transparent and cost-effective (best value) manner, so as to meet the service-delivery requirements of users;
- Maintained in the state in which they will provide the most effective service;
- Assessed in relation to their performance, suitability, condition and the effect of the condition of immovable assets on service-delivery ability; and
- Disposed of, at best value for money (financial and/or social returns), to the state if the assessments so indicate.

PROGRAMME DESCRIPTION

The objective of the project was to conduct physical verification of 30,551 CoJ-owned properties across the seven regions of Johannesburg. Physical verification is a procedure by which properties in the asset register are inspected to confirm their existence, use, occupancy and condition, through assessment of the characteristics of each property and liaison with the occupants of the properties.

Mobile projects were developed based on the revised field verification form received from the Johannesburg Property Company. Three mobile projects were developed and configured for the Leica Zeno 5 devices. These mobile projects were Improved Physical Assessment, Vacant Physical Assessment and Basic Conditional Assessment.

The Johannesburg Property Company asset viewer was designed, developed and implemented to present all Johannesburg Property Company properties on a mapping interface, in a browser that allows the user to perform various functions. It also assisted in tracking users in real time, for monitoring of progress during site inspection.

PROGRAMME OBJECTIVES

- To ensure that students who are close to the completion of their studies but struggling to get practical exposure are assisted, and are then able to graduate
- To aid transformation and provide practical knowledge and entrepreneurial independence for students, and to encourage competitiveness.

TARGET GROUP

Final-year university students, in the following fields of study:
A total of 95% of the students have graduated, and 30% (known) have found employment.

**ALIGNMENT AND INTEGRATION WITH POLICIES**

The programme was designed to align with the following policies:

- CoJ EPWP Policy
- Focused Public Works Framework
- Ministerial Determination
- EPWP Guidelines
- Joburg GD52040
- Government Immovable Asset Management Act (GIAMA), Act 19 of 2007
- CoJ Regional Spatial Development Framework

**PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION**

The site inspection process was conducted in three stages. Stage one was the planning and coordination phase, which was done before the field agents went out into the field to collect the data. Stage two was the data-collection stage, which was done in the field. The third stage involved consolidation, analysis and verification of data, which was done after students returned from the field. The project created 45 work opportunities, and 30 551 properties were fully verified.

**PROGRAMME CONSTRAINTS AND OPERATIONAL ISSUES**

- Not enough drivers were available on some days, resulting in fewer agents being in the field, due to lack of transportation.
- Progress projections were done on the assumption that there would be at least 30 field agents working from 08H00 to 16H30. Expected verification start times were delayed when the project areas were far from the meeting area, due to extended travelling times. On some days, the field workers would leave sites as early as 12H00, citing different reasons. This hindered progress.
- It was not possible for a supervisor to be with the Field Agents at all times, as one supervisor was in charge of 10 field agents. Delays would therefore be experienced when an agent needed the supervisor’s assistance, and had to wait for the supervisor to drive to where they were.
- Sometimes field agents would misplace devices and supervisors would have to recover the devices, thereby taking a long time to get back to the office. In turn, this would affect the ‘after-site’ processes (download, synchronising, etc.), which would sometimes only start around 20H00.

**SUPPORT PROVIDED BY THE MUNICIPALITY**

The following support initiatives were provided for the programme:

- CoJ Planning: Corporate GIS and LIS for data synchronisation purposes
- Department of Economic Development’s EPWP unit
- NDPW technical support

**LESSONS LEARNED, AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

- It is crucial that the User Requirement is signed off before the commencement of a project.
- Sufficient time must be provided for implementation of a project. Rushing through some steps of a project can result in more problems at a later stage.
- Activities must be phased out logically, to ensure accuracy of information. Development of the web viewer was done while the field agents were still collecting data.
- To ensure accuracy in data collected, get the right calibre of field agent, and provide them with training for a longer period. The field agents used in this project were third- and fourth-year students from the University of Johannesburg, doing the work as part of the requirements for their study programmes. This meant that some students had to be absent from the field on some days while they attended classes, or wrote tests or exams. Some of the students were not dedicated to the work; they only did it because they would not graduate without working experience.
- The Johannesburg Property Company should employ/appoint personnel specifically responsible for physical verification of currently-owned properties and those acquired in the future.
- The Johannesburg Property Company should employ/appoint personnel specifically responsible for the upkeep of the Assets Geodatabase. Such personnel should have relevant GIS capabilities, and should attend relevant training on Environmental Systems Research Institute (ESRI) products.
- Physical verification of new assets should be done within a stipulated timeframe of acquiring those properties, e.g. within three months of a property being acquired. Physical verification of all assets should be done on a set, regular basis, e.g. every five years.
EPWP MATRIC PROGRAMME – CITY OF TSHWANE

PROGRAMME BACKGROUND

The matric programme was established and implemented in 2015 with 101 learners, and currently has 234 learners registered. During the skills audit, the beneficiaries expressed the need for the programme. Providing skills to EPWP beneficiaries is in line with EPWP objectives. Through training, beneficiaries will be able to get sustainable work in the future.

During the skills audit, beneficiaries indicated that not having a national certificate makes their life difficult when they approach employers in search of more sustainable work. It was easy to respond to their need, as the city has an ABET programme for employees; the two schools contracted to train city employees were engaged to train these EPWP beneficiaries.

MAIN FOCUS

The main objectives of the project are:

- To assist EPWP beneficiaries without a national certificate (level 5) to obtain the certificate through ABET
- The focus is on beneficiaries who have failed matric before
- The beneficiaries should be contracted to participate in the EPWP for the duration of the training

CHARACTERISTICS OF THE PROGRAMME

The project is characterised by three key factors, namely:

- Training and empowerment of EPWP participants
- Participants are reported as EPWP beneficiaries on the EPWP reporting system
- Learners should be available to attend classes once a week, on a specified day

The key outputs are to achieve a minimum of 200 hours of training and to ensure that the learners obtain the national certificate (ABET level 5). The beneficiaries, who were all once in matric, need to pass two to three subjects in order to qualify for the certificate.

ALIGNMENT AND INTEGRATION OF POLICY

The project is aligned with the EPWP objective of providing training to EPWP beneficiaries, as stated in the EPWP Guidelines and city EPWP policy; i.e. EPWP work is of short- to medium-term work duration. The objective is to alleviate poverty through job creation and skills development.

IMPLEMENTATION

This programme is implemented in three phases:

Planning Phase

- Conduct roadshows to recruit learners in all regions of the city
- Meet with the two schools to agree on processes to be followed
- Organise learners for briefing by the schools on subject selection, registration and general motivation
- Organise training centres
- Get learners to sign the city training contract
- Share the list of learners with their supervisors
- Facilitate signing of the contract between the schools and the city

Implementation Phase

- Classes start with issuing of learning material
- Introduction to teachers
- Motivation by the city
- Regular visits to learning centres by the city
- Regular meetings with the schools to discuss any challenges and progress
- Schools submit attendance registers to supervisors
- Capture training days on the reporting system
- Facilitate payment to the schools
- Writing of examinations

Completion Phase

- Receive examination results
- Meet to discuss if objectives were achieved
- Issue examination results to learners
SUPPORT PROVIDED
The City of Tshwane provided support to the project:
• The EPWP division manages the project, with the support of the Tshwane Leadership Management Academy.
• The EPWP division provides funding for the project.

PROGRAMME CONSTRAINTS AND CHALLENGES
• Late delivery of books
• Learners travel to other training centres, following subjects of their interest
• Other work-related programmes clash with training days, e.g. World AIDS Day, for beneficiaries working on HIV/AIDS projects
• There are not enough training days
• Training venues not available in other regions
• Not enough learners to form a class in other areas
• Other subjects are new to the learners
• Learners withdraw during the period of training because of lack of money for travelling, and other reasons

LESSONS LEARNED
Through the challenges experienced, the City of Tshwane highlighted the following lessons for continuous improvement:
• Greater importance must be placed on a skills audit, in order to reveal what is valued by the beneficiaries.
• Stakeholder management must be improved, and the City of Tshwane must work closely with the Department of Education and other departments in the city.

RECOMMENDATIONS
• The programme should be compulsory for EPWP beneficiaries.
• It should cover all levels of ABET.
• Beneficiaries who managed to obtain their senior certificate through this programme should be prioritised for municipality bursaries for further education.

Stakeholder management must be improved, and the City of Tshwane must work closely with the Department of Education and other departments in the city.
WARD-BASED INTEGRATED MAINTENANCE PROGRAMME – MSUNDUZI MUNICIPALITY

BACKGROUND

In March 2010 the Msunduzi Municipality was placed under administration in terms of Section 139(1) (b) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. Some reasons for the intervention were:

- Financial distress, leading to serious cash-flow constraint;
- Allegations of maladministration, irregularities, fraud and corruption;
- Slow pace of service delivery and maintenance; and
- Poor political oversight.

Although the financial situation has been stabilised thanks to the appointment of the Municipal Manager and five Deputy Municipal Managers since 2011, service delivery failures – especially in the provision of maintenance services – are still a major challenge. It is clear that the city does not have the resources to address this challenge immediately. Nor can the challenges be resolved using traditional, conventional ways of doing business. Consequently, there was an urgent need for the city to make use of the opportunities available in the Expanded Public Works Programme to provide integrated maintenance services by engaging in a ward-based maintenance programme, while also responding to President Zuma’s call for job creation.

IMPLEMENTATION

The approach to the implementation of the Programme was six-fold:

- Firstly, beneficiaries were drawn from the existing Human Resources Department database, covering all wards in Msunduzi Municipality, with the main focus on youth, women, and physically disabled persons, from previously disadvantaged backgrounds. Where those conditions proved inadequate, additional recruitment processes were employed, working closely with Ward Committees.
- Secondly, selected beneficiaries were developed and trained to use equipment and tools that were employed throughout the duration of the programme. Additionally, beneficiaries were provided with life-skills training, including landscaping techniques.
- Thirdly, beneficiaries were exposed to opportunities and support for business development, so that they could use their skills to establish and/or open their own businesses for sustainable livelihoods.
- Fourthly, various partners were encouraged to adopt a spot to beautify and take care of in different precincts, building on the example of Hulamin and Pietermaritzburg Picture Perfect (P3).
- Fifthly, the media were employed in the mobilisation process of the programme.
- Sixthly, from time to time beneficiaries were deployed in wards of strategic nodes where their services were needed the most, subject to the provision of transport – e.g., the re-landscaping of traffic islands and city entrances, using a variety of vegetables and colourful flowers.

OPERATIONAL PLAN

The intention was to employ people from the wards who were not only previously disadvantaged but from the poorest of the poor, in order to curb unemployment and eradicate poverty. The idea was to create ownership among communities in the respective wards, and create an awareness regarding maintaining a cleaner environment.
Each ward has their own maintenance crew performing the following functions, among others:

- Cut and remove grass (verges, town-lands, river banks).
- Clear gutters
- Sweep streets
- Pick up litter
- Clean public infrastructure, such as halls, sports fields, libraries, etc.
- Clean and maintain sports fields
- Eradicate alien plants
- Beautify traffic islands and city entrances

The maintenance crew per ward comprises:

- 1 temporary supervisor
- 5 brush-cutter operators
- 4 general workers (to rake, and pick up papers)
- 4 general workers (to clear gutters)
- 2 workers to spray gutters/eradicate alien plants
- 4 workers to beautify traffic islands and city entrances

Benefits

- Each ward has each own maintenance crew to address problems associated with grass cutting, litter picking, alien plant eradication and other relevant maintenance challenges.
- This encourages the communities to keep their wards clean.
- EPWP beneficiaries have a source of income every month for the duration of the programme.
- Harvested vegetables are donated to members of the community, including local old-age homes.
- Communities adopt a ‘one home, one garden’ motto, contributing to leading a healthy lifestyle with a healthy diet.

LESSONS LEARNED

As much as the programme has made an instant impact and received great recognition and approval from the beneficiaries as well as from the community at large, much needs to be done by the municipality in terms of:

- Prioritising the EPWP as a social tool to uplift disadvantaged communities in dire need;
- Including the EPWP on the scorecards at senior management level, as part of a driving force to alleviate poverty and unemployment;
- Aggressive reporting, in order to achieve and surpass all sectoral targets set out for the municipality for EPWP Phase III.
COMMUNITY EMERGENCY RESPONSE TEAM (CERT) PROGRAMME – EKURHULENI METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY

BACKGROUND

Ekurhuleni is characterised by informal settlements, throughout the nine towns. Because people settle anywhere without considering the risks, whether natural or man-made, and do not consider the spacing between their dwellings, the community ends up facing disasters that in many cases lead to death.

The structural components of houses built in these areas also do not comply with minimum building standards, making them vulnerable to natural disasters. In the case of Ekurhuleni, people in informal settlements face issues such as fire outbreaks, floods, storms, heat waves, cold fronts, etc.

The municipality therefore had to look into ways to minimise the number of injuries and deaths in these cases. Unemployment in these settlements also had to be addressed, though not everybody could be employed – but every bit that can be done makes a difference. All these issues gave birth to the Community Emergency Response Team (CERT) programme.

CERTs are formed by members of a neighbourhood or workplace who want to be better prepared for the hazards that threaten their communities, and are developed to assist communities to take care of themselves in the aftermath of a major disaster, when first-responders are overwhelmed or unable to respond because of communication or transportation difficulties.

DESCRIPTION

The CERT programme was initiated with the aim of educating people in the informal settlements on how to avoid causing disasters. This is mainly to do with fire issues; often, people accidentally burn their dwellings (and sometimes a whole settlement) through initially small incidents involving candles, paraffin stoves, cooking on open fires, etc. They also learn how to deal with these incidents if they do occur.

Some incidents have natural causes, such as cold fronts, floods and heat waves; and people are taught how to react in these cases, to ensure their survival.

CERT members cover the area, going house to house to educate people. They also assist in disaster incidents, by being the ‘first contacts’ before Emergency Services personnel arrive. CERT members serve in their own communities beyond disaster response, adding value to the CERT programme; they are not intended to replace a community’s response capability, but to serve as an important supplement to it.

The CERT programme was initiated with the aim of educating people in both informal and formal settlements on how to mitigate the effect of disasters. The main focus is to save lives and protect property.

Participants in the programme:

- Distribute and/or install smoke alarms and batteries for the elderly and disabled;
- Assist with evacuations and traffic control;
- Promote community awareness of potential hazards and preparedness measures for cold fronts, floods, heat waves, earthquakes, hail and thunderstorms;
- Supplement staffing at special events, such as parades; and
- Perform door-to-door campaigns regarding specific topics.

PROGRAMME OBJECTIVES

The objective of the programme is to reduce the number of fires, deaths and injuries caused by either natural or man-made incidents. The number of fires occurring
in informal settlements has been reduced, and the number of fatalities has dropped significantly. It is important to note that if a fire breaks out, it is confined to only one or two dwellings—unlike in the past, when if a fire broke out, hundreds of dwellings would be involved.

Educational and awareness programmes are seasonal; for example, in summer, when heat waves are expected, community members are advised to stay hydrated and sit in the shade during the day. The target groups are both informal and formal community members. In case of emergency, CERT members are the first people to be contacted by the community. The participants then call the closest emergency office and start dealing with the emergency, while waiting for professional help to arrive on the scene. In some cases the fire is extinguished even before the emergency services arrive on site. Currently five CERT members are appointed per informal settlement, and they must reside in their specific informal settlement.

ALIGNMENT AND INTEGRATION OF POLICIES

The CERT programme is in line with the policies of the City of Ekurhuleni (CoE) in that it deals with the issue of poverty alleviation by giving the community job opportunities. The agency municipality sponsoring the CERT programme is creating a volunteer resource that is part of the community’s operational capability before and following a disaster. This project is part of the EMM Service Delivery Budget Implementation Plan. CERT members are considered ‘Good Samaritans’, and are covered under Section 2 of the Disaster Management Volunteer Regulations (2005). When helping others, CERT volunteers do not have any authority beyond serving as Good Samaritans.

IMPLEMENTATION

Initially, people in the informal settlements were appointed after being nominated by the ward councillors. This created a lot of challenges; mitigating measures were required, for example dropping off application forms in the different areas, and appointing candidates through a selection process.

The programme objective is achieved by continuously engaging with the community in terms of safety education, the importance of knowing the emergency numbers, the information that a caller should be able to give to the call centre, assisting with identification of pick-up points, and suitable routes for the fire department, to name just a few. Having campaigns together with the CERT members also boost morale, and creates confidence in being part of a team.

CERT members are given a target of ten educational house visits in a week, but it should be noted that they also assist whenever the need arises, whether at night or during the day. A call for enrolment as CERT members is made through an advertisement distributed at all relevant Customer Care Centres, and in the relevant ward. CERT members are expected to perform ten awareness activities per week, and assist until the emergency services arrive should a fire or any other disaster occur.

The programme has been a success, as the reduction in fires and deaths from disasters in the informal settlements is noticeable. On two occasions this programme was nominated for the Kamoso awards, and reached the final stages.

CHALLENGES

The following challenges were experienced:

• Though the project is very effective, funding may be a constraint over time.
• Informally settled people move often, so participants must often be replaced and new people trained, just to keep the project active.
• There were cases of abuse directed at the people doing house-to-house education, and the security of the participants is in question.
• There is a lack of suitable facilities for training and archiving.
• The programme must be aligned with the requirements and needs of the department for employment.
CERT PROGRAMME CONSTRAINTS

The CERT programme did not operate without constraints, some of which were:

- Time-consuming administration
- Control and alignment of the budget
- The personal safety of CERT members, as cases of abuse of CERT members were reported.
- A shortage of permanent staff to assist with programme monitoring
- The lack of suitable facilities for training and archiving
- The alignment of the programme with the requirements and needs of all stakeholders.

OPERATIONAL ISSUES

Both the residents of informal settlements and the Emergency Services Responders are faced with challenges when these fires occur. Preventing these fires and mitigating their consequences requires a community-based approach. Some of the challenges encountered are:

- Highly combustible materials are used to construct shacks, with the result that fires spread rapidly.
- The distance between individual shacks puts them at high risk for rapid fire spread.
- Informal settlements are often inaccessible to first-responder emergency resources.
- There are no fire hydrants for firefighting purposes.

SUPPORT PROVIDED

The project is directly managed by the Department of Emergency Management Services. The CERT programme is supported by the EMM Council, and forms part of the Service Delivery Budget Implementation Plan. It has also been funded through an EPWP incentive grant.

A concept document, developed by the HOD of Emergency Management Services, guides and gives clear indicators of what the CERT programme entails, and the benefits of being a member.

LESSONS LEARNED

- Though the programme is very effective, and currently a success, there is still room to improve and grow it. Currently, staff working on the project are expected to perform their normal duties over and above those of the CERT programme.
- It is highly recommended that staff that work on the programme should do solely that; and since informal settlements are growing day by day, the number of CERT members should not be equal throughout the municipality, but be determined by the size of each informal settlement.
- Most areas are being developed, therefore the programme should grow into the formal dwellings; and currently, most fires occur in the formal dwellings.