THE STATE OF THE EXPANDED PUBLIC WORKS PROGRAMME IN SOUTH AFRICAN CITIES 2015-2016
This report was made possible by the commitment of the eight cities comprising the South African Cities Network (SACN): Buffalo City, Ekurhuleni, eThekwini, Johannesburg, Mangaung, Msunduzi, Nelson Mandela Bay and Tshwane, and the content direction given by their respective EPWP managers. The project also relies on the financial contribution and guidance of the National Department of Public Works (NDPW). Recognition is also given to the other officials drawn from across the spheres of government who have provided data and other inputs for this report. A special thank-you goes to the EPWP unit: Monitoring and Evaluation Department, who provided the team with access to reports and primary data.

Chief Editor(s) / Project Manager(s):
Geet Karuri-Sebina (SACN)
Ignatius Ariyo (NDPW)

Report compiled by:
Feis Tharloo Muzondo

Project Management Support Team:
Sadhna Bhana (SACN)

Design & Layout:
the earth is round

Copy editing:
Dave Buchanan

Photography credits:
All photos in the publication are attributable to NDPW and SACN.


This report is published by:
South African Cities Network
16th floor, Joburg Metro Building
158 Civic Boulevard
Braamfontein
PO Box 32160
2017 Braamfontein
Johannesburg, SOUTH AFRICA

+27 (0)11 407 6471
info@sacities.net
www.sacities.net
The 2015/16 State of the Expanded Public Works Programme in South African Cities Report marks the sixth publication in the series of reports produced by the South African Cities Network. The EPWP Reference Group provides a consistent platform for the generation of knowledge and sharing of information, experiences and lessons learned, encapsulated in the annual reports.

The Community Survey 2016 Results released by Statistics South Africa show that municipalities perceived lack of or inadequate employment opportunities to be one of the biggest challenges in South Africa. Unemployment and the future of the economy are a concern globally; and, as highlighted in the 2016 budget speech, they are a great concern for South Africa as well. Various strategies will be required in order to survive these difficult times, and also to address the issues we are currently facing. This will also require a holistic approach, in order to attack the challenges from all angles. The existence of the EPWP – along with the success, experience and lessons learned – has shown that the programme is a critical component of a well-rounded strategy, and a host of possible interventions. The EPWP will continue to play a vital role in addressing the country’s challenges and will probably be required for a long time.

The 2015/16 report tracks the progress and experiences of the eight cities in the second year of Phase III of the EPWP. Furthermore, it investigates the institutional arrangements along with the organisational capacity of each city, identifying the changes implemented as well as the resulting successes and challenges experienced. The report sets out to identify key relationships and correlations having an impact on the performance of the EPWP, reporting on best practice as well as challenges faced.

We trust that the stakeholders will continue to find value in the reporting, and use its findings to enhance the performance and impact of the EPWP. This report continues to be significantly informed by the cities themselves, through the EPWP Reference Group – a peer-based platform, comprising key city officials responsible for implementing the EPWP in their respective cities. This collective has continued to meet quarterly over the period, providing a forum in which experiences and knowledge are exchanged between peers. The Reference Group also contributes to enhancing coordination between the cities and other role-players towards the effective implementation of the EPWP. We look forward to these reports contributing even more significantly to enhancing job creation in South Africa, through information, reflection and learning based upon the EPWP – our flagship public employment programme.

Stanley W. Henderson
Deputy Director General: EPWP
National Department of Public Works
www.epwp.gov.za

Sithole M. Mbanga
Chief Executive Officer
South African Cities Network
www.sacities.net
Part I: 

Introduction

ABOUT THIS REPORT

The South African Cities Network (SACN) is an established network of South African cities and partners that encourages the exchange of information, experiences and best practices on urban development and city management. The SACN was established in 2002 by the then-Minister of Provincial and Local Government, in collaboration with the mayors of South Africa’s largest cities and the South African Local Government Association.

The goals and mandates of the SACN are to:

- promote good governance and management in South African cities;
- analyse the strategic challenges facing South African cities, particularly in the context of global economic integration and national development challenges;
- collect, collate, analyse, assess, disseminate and apply the experience of large-city government in a South African context; and
- promote shared-learning partnerships between different spheres of government to support the management of South African cities.

The SACN’s core members are eight of South Africa’s largest cities: Buffalo City, Ekurhuleni, eThekwini, Johannesburg, Mangaung, Msunduzi, Nelson Mandela and Tshwane; though the report also includes the City of Cape Town. These cities collectively occupy 1.7% of the country’s land area (approximately 21,828 km²), and are home to 40.8% of South Africa’s population. In 2013, the average per capita income in the metros was approximately twice the value of that in the rest of South Africa, at R63,594 compared to R32,353. The employed constitute a higher percentage of the working-age population in metros than in the rest of South Africa. In 2011, the official employment rate was 48% in metros, versus 32% in the rest of the country. In 2013, the percentage of the metro population living below the poverty line was 25% (down from 29% in 1996), compared to 40% in the rest of South Africa.

The report outlines the progress and implementation of the EPWP by the cities over the 2015/16 period. This reporting period corresponds to the second year of Phase III of the EPWP.
Part I: intro

Figure 1: Work opportunities per EPWP Phase

The programme focuses on expanding methods of labour-intensive construction (LIC) or production, by means of government-funded projects, in order to create more job opportunities. This is achieved by limiting the use of machines and employing people to do the work.

KEY COMPONENTS OF EPWP

To enable the creation of jobs in a short period, the EPWP approach is based on the requirements of the Growth Development Summit agreement, and has the following key principles:

- To allow for diversity in existing programmes;
- To expand the use of best practice in existing programmes;
- To use existing budgets and replace special poverty-relief or public-works budgets;
- To be sustainable (the EPWP must not be ‘made to work’, but must be ‘economically efficient’);
- To focus on growing sectors of the economy to avoid displacement; and
- To attempt, through the design process, to maximise the involvement of local unemployed labour.

The EPWP covers all spheres of government and state-owned enterprises. Each public-sector body must formulate plans for using its budget to contribute to implementing the EPWP. The focus is on four sectors shown in Table 1.

The primary goal of the EPWP is to provide more people with productive work. As illustrated in Figure 1, the work opportunities created through the EPWP have increased over the first 10 years (from Phase I to Phase II) as the programme aimed to provide skills, training and work experience. Phase III of the EPWP followed the increasing trend, and aims to generate six million jobs between the 2014/15 and 2018/19 financial years.
The key components of an EPWP project are as follows:

- Public-sector bodies make a deliberate attempt to use expenditure on goods and services to create additional WOs, coupled with training for unemployed individuals;
- Projects usually employ workers on a temporary basis (either by government, contractors or other non-governmental organisations), under a code of good practice or learnership employment conditions; and
- Public-sector bodies attempt to define and facilitate exit strategies for workers when they leave the programme.

**EPWP GUIDELINES**

The NDPW issued guidelines for the implementation of labour-intensive infrastructure projects under the EPWP in 2004, with the third edition released in 2015 (http://www.epwp.gov.za/documents/Infrastructure/). These guidelines are designed to provide provinces and municipalities with the necessary tools to tender for labour-intensive projects. They cover how to implement the most commonly-encountered delivery model for labour-intensive works: ‘design by the employer’, where the contractor undertakes construction based on full designs issued by the employer. The assumption is that the public body will appoint a consultant to design the works and to administer the contract.

Guidance is also provided in respect of:

- identification of suitable projects;
- appropriate design for labour-intensive construction;
- specification of labour-intensive works; and
- the compilation of contract documentation for labour-intensive projects.

Specific direction is given regarding contract clauses that need to be included in order to amend or augment standard documentation regarding the implementation of labour-intensive projects.

The guidelines stipulate that the employment of locally employed temporary workers on all EPWP labour-intensive infrastructure projects must be in line with the Code of Good Practice for Employment and Conditions of Work for Special Public Works Programmes issued in terms of the Basic Conditions of Employment Act, 1997 (Act No 75 of 1997), and promulgated in the Government Gazette, Notice No. 964 of 25 January 2002. The Code of Good Practice and the EPWP Ministerial Determination have subsequently been updated for EPWP Phase III. Figure 2 shows the EPWP indicators defined in the guidelines document.

**Table 1: EPWP sector descriptions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTOR</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>Increasing the labour intensity of specific government-funded infrastructure projects in terms of specified guidelines, in order to create work opportunities (WOs). This requirement is specified in the Division of Revenue Act (DoRA), to be applied in respect of provincial and municipal infrastructure grants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and Culture</td>
<td>Creating WOs in public environmental programmes through expanding existing projects originally implemented through the Special Poverty Relief Allocation – for example, Working for Water.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social</td>
<td>Creating WOs in public social programmes, particularly home/community-based care (HCBC) and early childhood development (ECD).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-state</td>
<td>Using wage subsidies to support non-profit organisations (NPOs) in their community-development initiatives.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The minimum daily wage rate is the daily wage (whether task-rated or time-rated) per individual project. This wage rate must be included in the project tender document at all times, as per the EPWP Guidelines.
ORGANISATIONAL ARRANGEMENTS OF THE CITIES

This section gives an overview of the institutional arrangements and related EPWP policy governing the implementation of the EPWP within each of the cities, along with the organisational arrangements presented by the National Department of Public Works (NDPW). It also investigates and reviews amendments that were implemented during the 2015/16 reporting period.

The objective of an EPWP policy is to provide a framework for implementing the EPWP in each city. The policy should therefore be geared towards providing an enabling environment for the successful implementation of EPWP projects, while ensuring adherence to all government directives and legislative requirements. A comprehensive EPWP policy, which has been approved and formally adopted by the city council, is fundamental to the success and progress of a city’s EPWP initiatives.

In order to establish a solid framework that provides the necessary guidance for implementing EPWP initiatives, the following policy objectives, defined by the NDPW, are to be accommodated:

• To educate all departments and units in the city on how their functions should contribute towards the EPWP;
• To establish a delivery strategy in terms of socio-economic development, poverty alleviation, employment creation, and skills development;
• To ensure development integration across all sectors;
• To engineer the planning, design and implementation of programmes and projects with the city so that they maximise employment opportunities;
• The effectiveness of the EPWP policy depends on the compliance with the given policy of all entities in the city. Therefore, it is imperative to have mechanisms in place to monitor the implementation of and compliance with the city’s EPWP policy.
Part II: The report

INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS

From the lessons learned in the previous reporting periods, the cities realised the importance of formalising the EPWP coordinating structure. Each of the eight cities placed greater emphasis on their institutional arrangements, in an effort to achieve the following goals (among others):

- Creating organisational capacity to facilitate EPWP coordination within the cities
- Increasing the cities’ ability to implement EPWP projects
- Improving performance
- Ensuring that all internal and national EPWP targets are met
- Generating support
- Ensuring commitment and responsibility in the various departments
- Centralising coordination of EPWP projects and goals in each city

The cities established steering committees, headed by programme managers and consisting of administrators and coordinators. The duties of the organisational structure in each city include reporting on the WOs generated through EPWP, ensuring that labour-intensive construction (LIC) methods are used where applicable, setting internal targets that are aligned with each city’s EPWP policy, and providing an enabling environment for the creation of jobs and implementation of EPWP across the city.

During the previous financial year, 2014/15, efforts were made to identify key positions in each city’s organisational arrangements that would enhance capacity to carry out EPWP activities. All eight cities in the RG, therefore, made an effort to increase organisational capacity through the appointment of EPWP staff, such as coordinators, data capturers, project managers, administrators and supervisors. In 2015/16, the cities made efforts to fill vacant posts in an effort to further capacitate the city, and have dedicated staff to implementing the EPWP effectively.

Policy Changes and Targets in 2015/16

Since 2015/16 is the second year into Phase III of the EPWP, policy revisions had to be made by each city to align with the current phase and in order to meet the requirements of the current phase, as highlighted by Deputy Minister of the NDPW, Mr Jeremy Cronin, at a briefing held on 5 March 2015 (https://pmg.org.za/committee-meeting/17031).

Table 2 reports on the status of the revisions and the dates for initial approval of each city’s EPWP policy.

The main challenge that the cities faced in 2015/16 is their inability to hold line departments accountable for non-compliance without approved policies. This also affects implementation of EPWP projects, reporting, monitoring and evaluation.

Table 2: Policy status of the cities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATE APPROVED</th>
<th>REVISIONS MADE</th>
<th>REVISION STATUS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>1st revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>To be confirmed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>2nd revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>2nd revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1st revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Under review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>2nd revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Under review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>1st revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>1st revision TBC – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>1st revision 2014/15 – alignment to EPWP Phase III</td>
<td>Under review</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART II: 

The report

OVERVIEW OF EPWP IMPLEMENTATION

This section of the report highlights the progress of the cities in their implementation of the EPWP during 2015/16, which marks the second year of Phase III of the EPWP, and reviews trends over the preceding 2011/12-2014/15 financial periods.

The main objective of Phase III is to provide work opportunities and income support to the poor and unemployed through the delivery of public and community assets and services, thereby contributing to development.

Six indicators are used to assess each city’s progress in meeting their EPWP objectives:

- number of WOs created;
- number of person-days of work created;
- minimum day-task wage rate;
- number of person-days of training provided;
- overall budget and expenditure; and
- demographics of workers.


Indicators cannot be reviewed in isolation when assessing the progress of the EPWP in the cities. Therefore, progress across previous reporting periods is reviewed in conjunction with the 2015/16 achievements. Analysis across reporting periods will show the emerging trends and underlying correlations influencing the progress and success of the EPWP.

PROJECTS IMPLEMENTED

The eight metropolitan municipalities and Msunduzi implemented 688 EPWP projects in total during the 2015/16 financial year, as illustrated in Figure 3. A total of 391 (56.8%) of the projects were implemented through the infrastructure sector, 152 (22.1%) were from the social sector and 144 (20.9%) from the environment and culture sector.

There is still a need for the cities to find innovative ways to implement projects in the non-state sector, which had been reported not to have implemented any projects in the nine cities. Consultation and knowledge-sharing may be required beyond the Reference Group in order to learn from other municipalities (metropolitan, district and local), since the national total number of projects implemented through the non-state sector in 2015/16 is 504.
City of Cape Town implemented the highest number of projects, making up 37.4% of the total number of projects implemented by the nine cities.

Msunduzi, the smallest of the municipalities, had the lowest number for projects implemented, accounting for 1.89% of the 688 projects implemented by the nine cities. While the comparison may reflect negatively on Msunduzi, it should be noted that it is a metropolitan municipality, and the EPWP budget that it receives is considerably lower than those of the larger metropolitan municipalities – budget and expenditure data is also presented in this report.

All the cities, with the exception of Mangaung, have reported a decrease in the number of projects implemented between 2014/15 and 2015/16. Figure 4 shows the number of projects implemented by the city between 2011/12 and 2015/16. City of Cape Town has been reporting an increase in projects from 2011/12 to 2015/16, while the number of projects implemented by Buffalo City has been decreasing over the past five years. The number of projects implemented by Mangaung has increased every year for the past three years, though the number of projects reported is lower, relatively, than those implemented by most of the nine cities.

Mangaung is the only city that reported more projects in 2015/16 than in the last financial year, showing a -15% decrease – with the number of projects increasing by 15%.
Even with the greatest decrease in the number of projects reported for City of Cape Town, the number of projects implemented is the highest it has been over the past five years. This can be used as an indication of the city’s performance and its innovative methods of implementing projects. The Reference Group can also draw lessons from Mangaung, which – in spite of the common challenges, which will be presented in the latter sections of this report – has managed to increase the number of projects implemented by 15%.

**EMPLOYMENT CREATED**

In order to assess the performance of the cities with regard to the EPWP, it is important to review the targets set for EPWP Phase III. Table 3, Table 4, Table 5 and Table 6 show the WO and FTE targets for the various spheres of government and sectors.

Table 3: Work-opportunity targets for all spheres of government

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FINANCIAL YEAR</th>
<th>LOCAL</th>
<th>PROVINCIAL</th>
<th>NATIONAL</th>
<th>TOTALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>278 382</td>
<td>354 924</td>
<td>412 213</td>
<td>1 045 519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>310 992</td>
<td>380 172</td>
<td>436 022</td>
<td>1 127 186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016-17</td>
<td>347 578</td>
<td>382 869</td>
<td>612 707</td>
<td>1 343 154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-18</td>
<td>395 238</td>
<td>391 252</td>
<td>620 246</td>
<td>1 406 736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-19</td>
<td>428 875</td>
<td>397 778</td>
<td>629 187</td>
<td>1 455 840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>1 761 065</td>
<td>1 906 996</td>
<td>2 710 375</td>
<td>6 378 436</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Department of Public Works: 2015-2020 Strategic Plan

Table 4: Work-opportunity targets by sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FINANCIAL YEAR</th>
<th>INFRASTRUCTURE</th>
<th>ENVIRONMENT &amp; CULTURE</th>
<th>SOCIAL</th>
<th>NON-STATE</th>
<th>TOTALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>379 156</td>
<td>227 650</td>
<td>202 714</td>
<td>236 000</td>
<td>1 045 519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>447 671</td>
<td>229 208</td>
<td>205 307</td>
<td>245 000</td>
<td>1 127 186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016-17</td>
<td>488 636</td>
<td>230 550</td>
<td>205 968</td>
<td>418 000</td>
<td>1 343 154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-18</td>
<td>546 067</td>
<td>231 173</td>
<td>210 496</td>
<td>419 000</td>
<td>1 406 736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-19</td>
<td>589 473</td>
<td>232 923</td>
<td>214 444</td>
<td>419 000</td>
<td>1 455 840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>2 451 003</td>
<td>1 151 504</td>
<td>1 038 929</td>
<td>1 737 000</td>
<td>6 378 436</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Department of Public Works: 2015-2020 Strategic Plan

In 2015/16, the cities contributed to 38% of the work opportunities created by all the municipalities in the country, compared to the 51% contribution made in 2014/15. Even though the cities created fewer WOs as a percentage of the total WOs created by all municipalities, they contributed to 81% of the WOs created by the Western Cape, and Mangaung created to 86% of the WOs created in the Free State. This is further evidence that metropolitan municipalities play a significant role in creating employment and meeting the EPWP job-creation target for the country.

Figure 6 shows the WO targets compared to the WOs achieved by the nine cities.
The cities generated 33% of their WO targets for 2015/16 compared to the 125% achieved in 2014/15, this is a considerable decrease in the number of WOs created. Due to the introduction of the new reporting system by NDPW, most cities created WOs that could not be reported. Therefore, the cities may have created more WOs, and could possibly have met their targets for 2015/16. Having achieved and surpassed the WO targets in Phase I and Phase II of the EPWP, the WO targets were increased for Phase III – WO targets were increased by 20% from 2014/15 to 2015/16. City of Cape Town, having generated the highest number of WOs over the past five years, increased their WO targets by 68%; but reported a 75% decrease in WO targets and a 79% decrease in projects implemented from 2014/15 to 2015/16.

Mangaung has the second-lowest increase (8%) in WO targets over the past two financial years; and consequently, the lowest decrease in the number of WOs achieved (2.4%). Mangaung also reported an increase in EPWP projects implemented over the two years. The WO targets for Buffalo City increased by 9%, while the number of projects implemented decreased by 26% between 2014/15 and 2015/16; however, the WOs achieved increased by 96%. Buffalo City created the lowest number of WOs in 2014/15, and had the second-lowest targets in 2015/16.

The WOs achieved by the cities were analysed over a five-year period, from 2011/12 to 2015/16 (see Figure 7).

The WOs created by four of the cities (City of Cape Town, City of Johannesburg, City of Tshwane and Nelson Mandela Bay) decreased by no less than 75% each between 2014/15 and 2015/16. The cities have been creating more work opportunities from year to year over the past five years; with the exception of Nelson Mandela Bay, which showed a general decrease in the number of WOs created from 2011/12 to 2015/16.

The city with the lowest statistical range with regard to the WOs created over the past five years is Ekurhuleni, followed by Mm mundzi, Buffalo City and Mangaung. These cities have the lowest difference in the number of WOs created between 2011/12 and 2015/16 – that is, they have reported similar numbers of WOs from year to year since 2011/12. City of Cape Town, City of Johannesburg, City of Tshwane, eThekwini and Nelson Mandela Bay have the highest statistical ranges, with the biggest difference observed between 2014/15 and 2015/16. The decrease in WOs created by these five cities ranged from 55 to 85%.

The person-years of work including training (FTEs) were also analysed, along with the relationship between FTEs and WOs created in 2015/16. Figure 8 shows the number of FTE targets compared to the number of FTEs achieved by the nine cities in 2014/15.
Part II: The report

Figure 8: FTE targets vs FTEs achieved (2015/16)

With the 20% increase in WO targets from 2014/15 to 2015/16, and the 68% decrease in WOs created, the cities consequently increased their FTE targets by 10% and reported a 61% decrease in FTEs achieved. The cities achieved 37% of their FTE targets in 2015/16, with Msunduzi achieving the highest percentage (124%), and Nelson Mandela Bay achieving the lowest, at 7%. Msunduzi implemented the lowest number of projects (13), and created the second-lowest number of WOs (1393) in 2015/16. eThekwini achieved the highest number of FTEs (at 85% of the 2015/16 target).

Buffalo City had the third-lowest increase in FTE targets over the past two years, along with Ekurhuleni and Mangaung. However, Buffalo City and Mangaung reported a 367% and 67% increase in FTEs achieved respectively, while Ekurhuleni reported a 20% decrease in FTEs achieved. Another city that reported an increase in FTEs achieved, at 6%, was Msunduzi, with the highest decrease in FTE targets (67%).

These results should not be considered evidence of better performance by the cities without considering the targets and achievements over the two years, in terms of numbers and of the challenges faced by the cities in 2015/16, which will be presented in this report. For instance, Buffalo City only achieved 90 FTEs in 2014/15, and reported the second-lowest number of FTEs (420) in 2015/16, with the highest being 6376, reported by eThekwini. The cities with the highest decrease in FTEs achieved between 2014/15 and 2015/16 were Nelson Mandela Bay, City of Johannesburg, City of Tshwane and City of Cape Town, with percentages ranging from 80 to 86%.

Figure 9 shows the FTEs achieved by the cities over the past five years (2011/12 - 2015/16).

Even though the trend shows a general decrease in FTEs achieved by City of Johannesburg over the five-year period, the city recorded the highest FTEs between 2011/12 and 2014/15. The number of FTEs reported by City of Cape Town is relatively low, considering that the city has been creating the most WOs and has implemented the most EPWP projects over the past five years. It is evident that the city has not placed enough emphasis on creating longer-term employment per work opportunity and project.

The cities with the lowest numbers of projects implemented, WOs created, and consequently FTEs achieved over the five-year period are Buffalo City, Mangaung, Msunduzi and Nelson Mandela Bay.

These cities are relatively small compared to the other five cities.

Figure 10 shows the number of FTEs achieved for the WOs created in the 2015/16 financial year.
Part II: The report

As observed in the FTE targets analysis (Figure 8 and Figure 9), eThekwini has been able to create longer-term employment for the work opportunities created. The larger cities—City of Cape Town, City of Johannesburg, City of Tshwane, eThekwini and Ekurhuleni—have implemented the most projects, created the largest numbers of WOs, and achieved the highest numbers of FTEs.

### TRAINING

Phase III places more emphasis on quality delivery of EPWP projects; as such, training remains an important factor, and is required to develop the skills of the participants. A skills audit is required before a particular type of training programme; training providers are chosen to avoid training participants in skills that they already have, and to ensure that training addresses the skills that are project- and sector-specific.

All public bodies must ensure that some of their project budget is ring-fenced to support EPWP training. This is to offset the limited funding, often sourced from external funders. The training budget must be included in the respective municipal policies, as well as in the sector plans – NDPW Phase III training Framework (2015).

The following key areas will be reported for training:

- Number of participants trained
- Types of courses (accredited/dual purpose)
- Types of providers (accredited/approved)
- Number of training days

Table 7 shows the days of employment and training days, along with the proportion of training days to days of employment as a percentage.

According to the training framework for Phase III by NDPW, training remains an essential part of the EPWP – yet, due to funding challenges, remains non-mandatory. This may have an effect on the emphasis and importance placed on training by the cities. In 2015/16, the cities reported 537 training days – 0.03% of the total days of employment reported. The city with the highest number of training days, Msunduzi, also has the highest proportion of training days to number of days of employment, at 0.31%. The cities with the second- and third-highest training days are eThekwini and City of Johannesburg respectively.

It should be noted that there are cities—for example, City of Tshwane—which have training programmes that have generated training days and were reported to the NDPW, but were not included, due to the requirements of the new reporting system (refer to City of Tshwane’s individual report in Part III of this report). The other city to report training days is City of Cape Town, with a total of three training days (0.0045% of the days of employment). The days of employment dedicated to training were less than 1% for all the nine cities, with five cities reporting no training at all.

A sector analysis was done to determine the sector that provides the most training, and to identify the sectors that may have challenges in providing training. Figure 11 shows the person-years of training provided through the four sectors. The figures presented are consolidated results for all municipalities in the country.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CITY</th>
<th>DAYS EMPLOYED</th>
<th>TRAINING DAYS</th>
<th>TRAINING DAYS AS % OF DAYS EMPLOYED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Buffalo City</td>
<td>53310</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Cape Town</td>
<td>67357</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.0045</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Johannesburg</td>
<td>133130</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.0165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Tshwane</td>
<td>180226</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ekurhuleni</td>
<td>281604</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eThekwini</td>
<td>902335</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>0.0129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mangaung</td>
<td>138965</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Msunduzi</td>
<td>129011</td>
<td>396</td>
<td>0.3070</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nelson Mandela Bay</td>
<td>25518</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>1911456</strong></td>
<td><strong>537</strong></td>
<td><strong>0.0281</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 10: WOs created to FTEs achieved (2015/16)

Table 7: Training days to days of employment

![Figure 11: Person-years of training by sector](image-url)
A total of 59 person-years of training were reported for all sectors in 2015/16, with 81% of those person-years of training being provided through the infrastructure sector. The environment and culture sector contributes the second-highest percentage of person-years of training, at 12%. It is evident that more work needs be done in the social and non-state sectors with regard to training. It should also be noted that these two sectors also implement the smallest number of projects, and created the lowest number of WOs and FTEs.

**EXPENDITURE ON EPWP**

Expenditure is another key indicator of the performance and efficiency of the cities’ EPWP implementations. In order to assess the ability of the cities with regard to implementing EPWP projects, the budgets, incentive-grant allocations and expenditure were evaluated, along with wages paid. Figure 12 shows allocated budget and expenditure, including professional fees, for EPWP projects in 2015/16.

Msunduzi had the lowest budget allocation (R105.5 million), and spent the least (R27.5 million). Nelson Mandela Bay, City of Cape Town, Buffalo City and Ekurhuleni had relatively lower allocations than the other four cities, and consequently, lower expenditures in terms of total amounts. The amount in Rands spent by the cities cannot be taken as a measure of performance on their own. The percentages spent over the budget allocated are illustrated in Figure 13.

The cities spent a combined 10% of their allocated budget, at an average of 17%, in 2015/16. Buffalo City was allocated the second-lowest budget (R235.8 million) and spent just above the average in Rands (R126.4 million); however, its expenditure as a percentage of the budget is the highest, at 49%. The cities – City of Tshwane, for example – had a higher expenditure in Rands and in terms of percentage than reported above. The low percentages seen above can be attributed to the following:

- reporting expenditure only on wages paid to EPWP participants;
- expenditure that was not reported; and
- reports that did not include expenditure on materials, professional fees, training, etc.

Figure 14 shows the cities’ expenditure between 2011/12 and 2015/16.
For most of the cities, expenditure decreased from 2014/15 to 2015/16. Buffalo City’s expenditure has increased over the past two years. All nine cities reported a decrease in the number of projects implemented, and WOs and FTEs created; and consequently reported lower expenditures. Buffalo City reported the highest expenditure as a percentage of allocated budget, and an increase in number of projects implemented, WOs created, and FTEs achieved. In comparison, the other cities reported a decrease in these indicators between 2014/15 and 2015/16. However, it must be reiterated that this should not be used as an isolated measure of performance; it must also be taken into consideration that there have been challenges with regard to compliance with the new system requirements. These challenges and others will be addressed in Table 9 in the challenges section of this report.

The expenditure reported for eThekwini has been increasing from 2011/12 to 2014/15, but decreased in 2015/16, while City of Johannesburg’s expenditure has remained in a narrow range over the past five years. Cities that have shown a decreasing trend in terms of expenditure from 2011/12 to 2015/16 are City of Cape Town and Mangaung.

The cities also receive incentive grants, to assist and support the implementation of EPWP projects and to meet the set targets. Figure 15 shows the incentive grants allocated to each city, along with the expenditure.
Cumulatively, in 2015/16, the cities received R164.5 million in incentive grants and spent 82% of the grant allocation. eThekwini received the highest amount in incentive grants (R40.6 million), while Buffalo City received the least, at R1.2 million.

In terms of percentages, four cities spent 100% of their incentive grant allocation; those cities are Buffalo City, City of Tshwane, eThekwini and Msunduzi, followed by Mangaung at 93%. City of Cape Town, Ekurhuleni and City of Johannesburg spent 61, 73 and 77% respectively of their allocated incentive grants.

Nelson Mandela Bay received R8.7 million in incentive grants – higher than three other cities – and only spent 12% of the allocation. The city spent 15% of its allocated budget in total and implemented 43 EPWP projects; lower than the nine cities’ average of 7%, while creating the lowest number of WOs (1229), at only 10% of the annual target, and the lowest number of FTEs (245), at 7% of the annual FTE target.

Further investigation was done to determine the trends regarding Nelson Mandela Bay’s performance over the past five years, along with all the other cities. Figure 16 shows the incentive grants allocated to the nine cities from 2011/12 to 2015/16.

Msunduzi has the lowest to the second-lowest incentive grant allocations over the past five financial years; however, the municipality has achieved 87% of its WO targets for 2015/16, 124% of its FTE targets, and has reported the highest number of training days.

City of Johannesburg implemented the second-highest number of projects, and created the second highest number of WOs and the highest number of FTEs, even though the city spent only 10% of its allocated budget, and its incentive-grant allocations have decreasing year to year from 2011/12 to 2015/16. This is evidence that the cities have been able to balance the incentive grants and budget allocations from year to year, in spite of the challenges and changes faced, in order to efficiently implement EPWP projects and create job opportunities.

In order to analyse the relationship between wages paid and performance (i.e. between WOs and FTEs created and the number of projects implemented), the minimum daily wage rates per city were analysed (see Figure 18). These are the rates per EPWP participant per project for 2015/16. It should be noted that wage rate has not been standardised, so rates will therefore differ from city to city. However, all of the cities’ wage rates are higher than the minimum recommendation for EPWP projects.
Nelson Mandela Bay paid the highest wage rate in 2015/16, at R168.51 (a 55% increase from last financial year); yet in terms of the total amount paid in wages, the city paid the lowest. This is can be attributed to the fact that Nelson Mandela Bay created the lowest number of WOs and FTEs. On average, the minimum daily wage rate paid by the cities increased by 13% over the last two years, while number of work opportunities and projects implemented decreased. This may be attributed to wage increases to account for inflation and the increased cost of living.

It is evident that all the cities need to strike a balance – as the larger metropolitan municipalities have done (City of Cape Town, City of Johannesburg and City of Tshwane) – between wages (wage rates and total wages paid) and WOs and FTEs created. Wages must be high enough to attract participants to the programme, but also low enough to ensure that the budget is spent effectively and WOs are maximised. The budget needs to be distributed between wages, materials, professional fees and other components required for the effective implementation of EPWP projects.

There is a need for the NDPW to standardise EPWP wage rates, to ensure that:
• beneficiaries have sufficient income, thus avoiding labour disputes;
• beneficiaries are safeguarded from exploitation; and
• cities meet WO targets by allocating budgets effectively across all components of EPWP projects.

In order to further assess the cities’ spending efficiency, the costs per work opportunity generated from 2011/12 to 2015/16 were analysed (illustrated in Figure 18).

The costs per work opportunity have been increasing for five of the nine cities (Buffalo City, City of Johannesburg, eThekwini, Msunduzi and Nelson Mandela Bay), with the largest increases reported at the beginning of Phase III.

Since expenditure has decreased by a cumulative 58% since the beginning of the current phase, and WOs created have decreased by 68%, the increased cost per WO can be attributed to the 13% average increase in daily wage rates.

City of Cape Town, City of Tshwane, Ekurhuleni and Mangaung have shown a decreasing trend in costs per WO, but have been performing relatively well over the past five years. This can be regarded as an indication that the cities have generally been more efficient in implementing EPWP projects, and may be implementing more small-scale projects at lower cost.

In order to analyse the cities’ success in generating employment by demography, it is important to highlight the targets for Phase III, which were to generate employment in the following proportions:
• 55% for women
• 55% for youth
• 2% for people with disabilities
Part II: The report

Table 8: Demographics of EPWP beneficiaries (2011/12-2015/16)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>% Youth</th>
<th>% Disabled</th>
<th>% Youth</th>
<th>% Disabled</th>
<th>% Youth</th>
<th>% Disabled</th>
<th>% Youth</th>
<th>% Disabled</th>
<th>% Youth</th>
<th>% Disabled</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>0.001%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>0.001%</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>0.001%</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>0.001%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>0.001%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015/16</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>0.001%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>0.001%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>0.000%</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Only one of the nine cities has met and exceeded the 2% target for people with disabilities: Buffalo City, at 6.8%. It is evident that the cities need to find innovative ways of creating employment for people with disabilities; however, the issue may lie in the classification of PWDs. Statistics South Africa (StatsSA) classifies disability into the following categories:

- Difficulty seeing (sight disability)
- Difficulty hearing (hearing disability)
- Difficulty communicating (communication disability)
- Difficulty in walking (physical disability)
- Difficulty in remembering or concentrating (mental disability)
- Difficulty in self-care

The EPWP uses the United Nations (UN) standard of classification for PWDs, meaning they self-declare. It is possible that people are reluctant to declare their disabilities, and that the EPWP implementers and participants may not fully understand the term ‘PWDs’, as defined by StatsSA. The issue could therefore be under-reporting, masking itself as underperformance. Awareness is required in order to ensure that all parties (participants and implementers) understand the classifications of PWDs, and that they are all captured.

Another challenge for the EPWP has been the issues of training and youth unemployment. Training is important, especially in the EPWP, so as to ensure that beneficiaries gain skills that may enable them to get full-time jobs and participate in the formal job market, or the SMME sector. In 2015, as many as 3.6 million youth were unemployed and actively seeking employment, compared to 1.9 million adults in the same situation. There are cities that are still unable to meet the 55% target for youth, which has been the case for the past five reporting periods (2011/12 – 2015/16). It is thus evident that the cities need to put more emphasis on creating work opportunities for youth, in order to meet the targets and contribute to solving the high youth unemployment rate that is such a challenge for South Africa.
**EPWP SECTOR ANALYSIS FOR THE CITIES**

This section focuses on the sectors in which the cities are implementing projects. The predominant sector is infrastructure, but the cities are also implementing projects in the environment and culture, social, and non-state sectors, as shown in Figure 20.

![Figure 20: EPWP sectors being implemented by the cities](image-url)
INFRASTRUCTURE SECTOR

The infrastructure sector is led by the NDPW, which collaborates with the Departments of Transport, Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, Water Affairs, Mineral Resources, and Energy. The key EPWP infrastructure programmes include:

• VukuVhile Learnership Programme: This programme trains individuals in labour-intensive methods of construction, to become contractors at National Qualifications Framework (NQF) level 2, and supervisors at NQF level 4;

• National Youth Service Programme: This is a year-long skills training and development intervention that aims to provide unemployed youth with technical skills, life skills, access to practical work experience, and mentoring;

• Large Projects: These are projects with a minimum budget of R30 million, aimed at ensuring the delivery of large-budget projects based on EPWP principles and meaningful development of emerging contractors; and

• Provincial Roads Programme: This programme provides assistance to provincial roads departments to help them implement labour-intensive projects and programmes. The assistance is provided in partnership with the national Department of Transport, and focuses on rural access roads.

ENVIRONMENT AND CULTURE SECTOR

The environment and culture sector builds South Africa’s natural and cultural heritage; and in doing so, dynamically uses heritage to create both medium- and long-term work and social benefits, while at the same time responding to climate-change challenges.

The key EPWP environment and culture sector programmes include:

• to create land-based livelihoods;
• to promote community-based natural resource management;
• to develop natural resources and cultural heritage;
• to rehabilitate natural resources and protect biodiversity; and
• to promote tourism.

Key environment and culture projects include:

• sustainable land-based livelihoods;
• waste management;
• tourism and creative industries;
• parks and beautification;
• coastal management; and
• sustainable energy.

SOCIAL SECTOR

A key focus of the social sector is to equip pre-school teachers and support staff with adequate training, so that they can pass on their knowledge to benefit the country’s children in the long term. The social cluster comprises the Departments of Social Development, Education, and Health. Much of the work of these three departments relies on the input of volunteers and civil-society organisations, and is suitable for the development of the EPWP.

While a number of programmes present a range of opportunities for work creation, the following programmes have been selected as flagship programmes for the social sector:

• Early childhood development (ECD): The main purpose of early childhood development is to protect the child’s rights. The ultimate goal is to improve young children’s capacity to develop and learn. ECD interventions include educating and supporting parents, delivering services to children, developing the capabilities of caregivers and teachers, and using mass communication to enhance parents’ and caregivers’ knowledge and practices.

• Home/community-based care (HCBC): This entails the provision of comprehensive services, including health and social services, by formal and informal caregivers in the HCBC support programmes. It is prioritised as a cost-effective response substitute for a significant portion of AIDS-related hospital care. The programme aims to facilitate the laying of the foundation for launching the Community Health and Development Worker Programme, by equipping unemployed individuals with foundation skills and experience.

• School nutrition programme: Community members are employed as food handlers to provide food to children from needy families, thereby addressing malnutrition.

• Community crime prevention: Community members are encouraged, by employing volunteers in EPWP projects, to help identify community safety priorities for their neighbourhoods.

• School mass participation: Work opportunities are provided to sports coaches, and members of the public are encouraged to participate actively in sports. The objective is to promote good health, self-realisation, community development, and social cohesion.

• Kha Ri Gude (Tshivenda for ‘let us learn!’): This is a mass literacy campaign aimed at adults who missed out on schooling and who cannot read or write, inviting them to join literacy classes provided across the country.

NON-STATE SECTOR (NSS)

The NSS comprises the Community Work Programme (CWP) and the NPOs. The CWP is area-based, and is managed by the Department of Cooperative Governance. The NPOs are institutionally based, and are managed by the NDPW – which, as the custodian of the programme, offers an administration fee and wage subsidy towards the wages of the individuals employed in the non-profit organisations.

The purposes of the NSS programme are:

• to create an avenue through which NPOs can assist government in creating income for large numbers of individuals, through socially constructive activities in their local communities;

• to provide accredited training to beneficiaries so that at the end of the year, beneficiaries can evolve into the second phase of the job market, which would be to exit into full-time jobs in line with the six job drivers of government’s new growth path;

• to encourage municipalities to use the human capacity of NPOs funded by the NSS; and

• to develop local communities through municipal IDP projects.
Part II:  
The report

Challenges faced by the cities

Based on the responses obtained from the cities, and on analysis of existing documentation, Table 9 highlights some of the major challenges facing the cities in implementing the EPWP, as well as potential solutions to those challenges.

Table 9: Challenges and potential solutions for implementing EPWP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHALLENGES</th>
<th>POTENTIAL SOLUTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reporting non-compliant data, as per the new reporting system requirements – resulting in under-reporting, and what may appear to be poor performance</td>
<td>Cities should include data requirements in procurement documentation, to ensure that contractors collect and keep a record of the required information. The NDPW can assist the cities by allocating data capturers and officials from Monitoring and Evaluation to train data capturers in the cities, in order to ensure that data is collected correctly and undergoes quality-checking before it is reported on a national level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenges in generating high FTE numbers</td>
<td>Cities should focus on identifying and implementing maintenance-focused projects, to increase the employment period.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants and labour unions expecting full-time employment</td>
<td>Cities and EPWP practitioners or implementers should ensure that all beneficiaries and contractors understand the conditions of EPWP employment before starting work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficulties in creating WOs and employing persons with disabilities.</td>
<td>The cities should focus on implementing more disability-friendly projects, such as social-sector projects, and train implementing agents on the definition of ‘persons with disabilities’, to avoid misconceptions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disputes regarding wage rates being different from city to city, and sometimes from project to project within the same city</td>
<td>There needs to be standardisation of wage rates by the NDPW to ensure that all EPWP wages are the same, and to ensure that cities use allocated budgets effectively and do not spend them largely on wages.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mitigation measures implemented by the NDPW

The NDPW has introduced additional mitigation measures, in an attempt to help cities overcome these challenges. These include:

- using baseline allocation to implement the EPWP, rather than only the Integrated Grant allocation that they receive from the NDPW;
- improving implementation of EPWP Integrated Grant-funded projects. There seem to be delays experienced in implementing, projects not registered, and projects registered and reported on using different project names. The IG prefix must be used on registration of projects;
- upgrading management information systems to improve reporting efficiency; and
- providing training to city officials, to ensure a thorough understanding of EPWP principles.
Part II: The report

Conclusion

The EPWP is an important initiative that government has formulated to elevate poverty and create employment for unskilled people in South Africa. This programme can be implemented across the infrastructure, social, environment and culture, and non-state sectors. With the main objectives of the programme being skills development, training, and generating WOs, projects within the EPWP should be designed and coordinated as labour-intensively as possible. Through this programme, the municipalities are committed to ensuring that the EPWP beneficiaries exit the programme with enough skills to compete in the mainstream labour market. In future, therefore, more emphasis should be placed on providing training through the EPWP, which was seen to be lagging behind in 2014/15.

The SACN member cities have recognised the importance of formulating and updating EPWP policy, along with establishing institutional arrangements in order to ensure effective implementation, monitoring, evaluating and reporting of EPWP projects. Through this, the cities have managed to create institutional capacity and support for the EPWP, with political champions, executive management and steering committees.

The most common challenge in 2015/16 has resulted from the introduction of a new reporting system that requires documentation such as certified copies of identity documents, contracts of employment, attendance and payment registers, and Unemployment Insurance Fund (UIF) and Compensation for Occupational Injuries and Diseases Act (COIDA) contributions. Most cities could not provide compliant data, which affected the work opportunities they reported on, and thus appeared to show poor performance. It may be that similarly what occurred in Phase I and Phase II, and in 2014/15, cities might have met and even exceeded their WO targets, but could not report on them as per the new system requirements. It is recommended that the cities include data requirements into the contracts, tender documents or procurement documents, and ensure that contractors, participants and administrators capture complete and compliant data.
Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality

Overview of the EPWP in the City

Job creation and skills development remain key priorities of the South African Government. The EPWP is a Cabinet-endorsed programme aimed at creating six million jobs between the 2014/15 and 2018/19 financial years. Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality has implemented the Vuk’uphile programme, which is an EPWP learnership contractor-incubator programme aimed at addressing the shortage of skills of emerging contractors by providing necessary skills, training and qualifications.

The municipality implements the EPWP in the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors. It is aided by a task team, commissioned by the city manager to oversee the implementation of the programme and ensure that the targets are met.

Policy and Implementation

Cabinet has adopted the EPWP as a primary vehicle for the creation of work opportunities, and has endorsed a conceptual framework which designates specific roles and targets for each municipality in terms of the programme. To date, the municipality has given effect to the call by signing an Implementation Protocol with the Minister of Public Works to partner and cooperate in terms of the EPWP. In order to mainstream the programme through the municipality, an EPWP policy is required to guide the implementation of the EPWP within the municipality. For the EPWP to be effective, the programme needs to be incorporated in all activities of the municipality. This will require that every project (as per the IDP) must promote EPWP principles and re-structure project activities to facilitate and create greater employment opportunities per unit of expenditure, where possible. This policy is therefore prepared for the entire metropolitan municipality, with the intention to close the identified gaps and mitigate the challenges in the implementation of the EPWP, as well as to strengthen the existing interventions and introduce new ones. The EPWP policy for Buffalo City was endorsed in May 2013.
INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS

The city approved the EPWP structure in 2013/14, with an EPWP manager to head the unit. The creation of the unit aimed at centralising the programme. In line with the EPWP institutional arrangements and the Protocol Agreement signed by the Minister of Public Works and the Executive Mayor, the Executive Mayor was given the responsibility of providing political leadership. The Executive Mayor subsequently appointed members to champion the EPWP in the infrastructure and environment and culture sectors. The city manager commissioned a task team to oversee the implementation of the EPWP in the city, and to be responsible for providing support for the coordination of the EPWP across all sectors.

Although vacant strategic management positions were advertised, they were not filled between 2013/14 and 2015/16. However, the EPWP programme manager position was filled on 1 June 2016. This had a significant effect on the efficiency of the institutional arrangements. Figure 21 illustrates the approved institutional arrangements in the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality.

Significant changes that the municipality experienced included:

- The employment of dedicated EPWP data capturers to assist with data collection and reporting;
- Increased EPWP awareness through engagements; and
- A greater number of work opportunities reported.

Figure 21: Buffalo City institutional arrangements

BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR EPWP

The EPWP unit in Buffalo City Municipality relies mainly on the 5% capacity portion of the EPWP incentive grant received from the NDPW. This allocation is used to ensure adequate project management capacity and monitoring systems.

Challenges experienced with regard to funding sources included under-reporting by municipal departments, which negatively affected the budget allocation received for the 2015/16 reporting period. Table 10 shows the budget and expenditure for the city over the 2014/15 reporting period.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2015/16 INCENTIVE GRANT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10: Buffalo City budget allocations (2015/16)

EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS

The city prioritised the beneficiation of local residents in the designated areas where the projects are implemented. Buffalo City promoted EPWP principles and re-structured project activities where possible, to create greater employment opportunities when implementing projects. The city employs beneficiaries according to the national demographic targets that were set for Phase III. Only one person per household is selected for the programme, with no more than 20% of skilled participants from each community. Participants are also selected from the following categories:

- Individuals from households that are headed by people with qualifications lower than primary education level.
- Individuals from households in which only one person earns an income from a full-time job.
- Individuals who are from households in which the source of income is subsistence agriculture.

PROGRESS

Buffalo City Municipality implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors. Table 11 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors during 2015/16. The city implemented more projects and created more WOs and FTEs than were reported in the earlier section of this report. The main challenge was under-reporting (most of the data was not compliant with the new reporting system), which appeared as poor performance.
Table 11: Buffalo City EPWP progress (2015/16)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
<td>2332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
<td>1014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure (R million)</td>
<td>R 126.65 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid (R million)</td>
<td>R 14.05 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**FLAGSHIP PROJECTS AND SUCCESS**

**Maintenance of Eco Parks in Mdantsane and Duncan Village**

Maintenance of Eco Parks is an ongoing project funded through the EPWP incentive grant. It is implemented by the Directorate of Community Services, and its main objectives are to clean up the open spaces in order to prevent illegal dumping, and also to promote efficient use of open spaces in the form of recreational open areas. Maintenance of Eco Parks was done through the employment of EPWP beneficiaries, and created 114 work opportunities. The Eco Parks generated much-needed employment, training and skills transfer.

**Operation and maintenance of public facilities in Buffalo City Municipality**

This project is aimed at the provision and maintenance of sanitation services to informal settlements throughout the municipality, through the use of labour-intensive construction methods and EPWP employment. The Sanitation Department implemented the project, and created 289 work opportunities.

**KEY CHALLENGES**

EPWP has been implemented on a small scale in the city, yet with commendable outcomes in terms of the involvement of local communities in delivering local assets, transfer of wages, the creation of sustainable livelihoods, and reduction of crime. The challenges experienced by Buffalo City Municipality in 2015/16 include:

- Capacity in terms of designing projects labour-intensively
- Achievement of longer duration of work opportunities and targets
- Institutionalisation of the EPWP in the city in order to provide strategic focus and coordination of EPWP
- Lack of commitment from other directorates, as this does not assist in reporting
- New reporting system requirements leading to non-reporting or under-reporting
- Expectations from EPWP participants who want to be offered full-time employment
- Lack of technical capacity to ensure that projects are designed to be as labour-intensive as possible

**LESSONS LEARNED**

From the challenges and success of 2015/16, the city learned the following lessons, which will help improve the EPWP in the future:

- The city needs to improve on the communication process in educating key EPWP personnel and department managers, with regard to aligning their programmes with job-creation initiatives.
- Project managers must be encouraged to provide for the EPWP in their municipal budgets.
- An optimum labour component should become a design parameter and a condition of contract.
- The city needs to apply penalty or incentive schemes, to encourage performance and ensure compliance and accountability.
Part III: City reports

City of Johannesburg metropolitan municipality

Overview of the EPWP in the city

The city continues to make strides in ensuring that there is an exit strategy in place for individuals who participate in the EPWP. The impact of the programme is visible, with the following successes reported in 2015/16:

- 260 participants from the EPWP Johannesburg Metropolitan Police Department (JMPD) Peace Officers project were absorbed into permanent employment as JMPD Metro Police Officers.
- The Johannesburg Market has permanently absorbed 38 former EPWP participants.
- The Dobsonville Housing project has given its 11 community members an opportunity to receive on-the-job training to allow them to complete their experiential training, so as to eventually complete their diplomas at institutions of higher learning in the construction industry.
- 45 students from the University of Johannesburg participated in the Asset Verification project implemented through the Johannesburg Property Company, to be exposed to practical work in order to obtain their university qualifications. These students were identified and selected from the following trades: Town and Regional Planning; Real Estate; and Building Sciences.
- Some EPWP participants have gone on to the formation of cooperatives and SMMEs, using the skills acquired from the EPWP interventions while they were earning a salary.

Policy and implementation

The City of Johannesburg’s EPWP Phase III Policy Framework was approved by Council in July 2015. The policy has been aligned such that it caters for the EPWP Phase III strategies, and ensures EPWP compliance by the city’s core departments and municipal entities.

Changes or additions to the policy included the following:

- The City of Johannesburg Growth and Development Strategy (GDS) 2040
- City of Johannesburg EPWP coordination (with the Executive Mayor as the overall coordinator, and political coordination by the MMC: Economic Development), and the City of Johannesburg Regions as standing members of the EPWP Steering Committee
- EPWP Targets for Phase III (2014/15-2018/19)
- Exit strategy
INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS

The City of Johannesburg’s EPWP responsibilities cut across all departments and municipal-owned entities. The EPWP is coordinated within the Department of Economic Development, since it facilitates economic development and job creation. The city is currently coordinating three sectors: infrastructure, social, and environment and culture.

The city’s EPWP unit currently has two vacancies, for an administrative assistant and a bookkeeper. The city has managed to employ six data capturers (interns) who assist with data collection and reporting. Figure 22 illustrates the approved institutional arrangements for the City of Johannesburg.

Figure 22: City of Johannesburg institutional arrangements

BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR THE EPWP

The Incentive Grant allocation contributes less than one per cent of the city’s annual capex and opex budgets allocated to departments and municipal entities. The city has fair and transparent grant-disbursement processes and criteria in place. Table 12 shows the incentive grant allocated and transferred to City of Johannesburg, along with the expenditure for the year 2015/16.

Challenges experienced with regard to the EPWP Integrated Grant:
• The proposals received from the city’s departments and municipal entities suggest that the NDPW Integrated Grant may not always be enough.
• Changes in initial project scope and name have contributed to delays in the implementation of EPWP projects.
• Submission of claims and invoices has not always been effective.

Table 12: City of Johannesburg budget allocations (2015/16)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2015/16 INCENTIVE GRANT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS

The city has always adhered to the Ministerial Determination and Code of Good Practice when recruiting EPWP participants and implementing projects.

There have been disputes around the EPWP wage rate, and the city has been unable to reach a resolution through the consultation process aimed at standardising the rates.

The city has ensured that EPWP participants are not kept in one project for longer than 12 months, since this has in the past created expectations of permanent absorption, more especially in the social and environment and culture sectors. The EPWP in the city is governed by the following legislation:
• Ministerial Determination 4, No. 35310, 2012
• Code of Good Practice, No. 34032, 2011, Sec 87 (2)
• Basic Conditions of Employment Act (Act 75 of 1997)
• City of Johannesburg EPWP Phase III Policy Framework, 2015
Part III: City reports

The City of Johannesburg implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors. Table 13 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors in 2015/16.

Table 13: City of Johannesburg EPWP progress (2015/16)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WO’s created</td>
<td>5734</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
<td>1610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure (R million)</td>
<td>R 279.6 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid (R million)</td>
<td>R 48.7 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There has been a decline in the number of work opportunities reported by the city in the 2015/16 financial year, compared to previous financial years in which it was able to achieve and exceed the set targets.

Flagship Projects and Success

**Applied Performing Arts and Arts Management (APAAM)**

The project is implemented by the Johannesburg City Theatre (JCT) through the NDPW Integrated Grant allocation, for a duration of 12 months. The programme was launched in 2014, and has appointed 45 candidates in the 2015/16 financial year. The candidates have received certificates in Humanities from the Wits School of Arts (NQF level 4 and 5). The APAAM programme seeks to turn community-based theatre groups into companies or organisations that are business conscious, irrespective of whether they are for profit or not. The targeted groups and areas were: Die Dinge (Diepsloot); Ambitious Theatre Group (Orange Farm); and The CAVE Productions (Johannesburg Inner City).

Key Challenges

The challenges experienced by the City of Johannesburg in 2015/16 included:

- Failure to create targeted work opportunities for PWDs.
- Work disruptions or stoppages by other community structures. In most cases this affects and delays implementation, and ultimately compromises the city’s ability to meet EPWP targets.
- Budgets are shared between the EPWP and the Jozi@work programme, resulting in a reduction of EPWP opportunities.
- The introduction of the new EPWP reporting requirements has meant that the city’s departments and municipal entities only report on compliant work opportunities. This under-reporting, therefore, appeared to be poor performance by the city.
- Not all the new changes as reflected on the approved City of Johannesburg EPWP Phase III Policy Framework have been implemented.
- Record-keeping by contractors on site has been poor.
- Inconsistent wages for EPWP participants and Community Liaison Officers (CLOs).
- Expectations of permanent absorption from EPWP participants.

Lessons Learned

The City of Johannesburg has drawn from the challenges and the successes listed above, extracting the following lessons to be used to further improve the EPWP in the city:

- The longer that EPWP participants are kept in the projects, the higher the expectations created of permanent absorption.
- Not all planned projects are implemented, which has an impact on the city’s overall targets.
- Reporting bodies have a tendency to report only compliant work opportunities.
- Contractors cannot be held accountable if there is nothing forcing them to keep the required EPWP evidence.
- Reporting will always be compromised if the reporting bodies do not have EPWP-dedicated personnel or champions for accountability and responsibility.
OVERVIEW OF THE EPWP IN THE CITY OF TSHWANE

The EPWP is one of the initiatives by the government aimed at creating short-term work opportunities linked to training and skills development for marginalised: women, youth and people living with disabilities.

The programme is not implemented in isolation from other government strategic initiatives. The New Growth Path (NGP) outlines key job drivers, such as targeting more labour-absorbing activities across the main economic sectors; and substantial public investment in infrastructure, both to create employment directly – in construction, operation and maintenance, as well as the production of inputs – and indirectly, by improving efficiency across the economy.

EPWP work opportunities are all linked to the NGP job drivers, and are expected to contribute to the NGP targets through its Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) targets.

In the City of Tshwane, EPWP can and should play a meaningful role in the following sectors, because they have the need and the potential to be further developed to support the objectives of economic growth and job creation:

- Agriculture and farming
- Mining
- Tourism
- SMME development
- Information technology

A focus on training as an exit strategy should be aligned with and targeted at the selected sectors mentioned above.

POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION

The city’s EPWP policy, which is aligned to Phase III of the EPWP, was approved in November 2014. The policy is supported by the EPWP Business Plan and sector plans, and monitored through the EPWP Policy Implementation Monitoring Tool. The policy is valid for a period of five years.

The EPWP in the city is regulated mainly through national legislation, including:
- Ministerial Determination 4: Expanded Public Works Programme, No. 35310, gazetted 4 May 2012;
- Code of Good Practice for employment and conditions of work for Expanded Public Works Programme, No. 34032, gazetted 18 February 2011;

No single policy offers the solution to addressing youth unemployment; what is needed is a sustained period of accelerated and inclusive economic growth, and a comprehensive set of short-term and long-term policy reforms and initiatives in light of the increasing demand for labour that encompass the improvement of education and skills, and labour-market interventions that increase the employability of young people.

Part III: City reports

INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS

The political champion for the EPWP in the City of Tshwane is the executive mayor, while the administrative champion is the city manager. The EPWP office ensures that all the sectors are active in the city. When reporting, projects are classified into different EPWP sectors, according to their nature and to the mandate of the Department or Regional Division. Figure 23 illustrates the institutional arrangements for the City of Tshwane, as approved for 2015/16.

BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR EPWP

Although the city receives a significant amount from the incentive-grant allocation, the main sources of funding are the capital- and operating-expenditure budget allocations. Table 14 shows the 2015/16 incentive-grant allocation for the city, along with the expenditure.

EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS

Over and above national legislation, the city developed an EPWP policy, an EPWP business plan, and EPWP sector plans for each sector (environment and culture, infrastructure, and social), to provide guidance and assistance with the implementation of the EPWP. With all systems in place, the city still experienced implementation challenges with regard to conditions of employment – e.g. duration of employment, and study leave for training initiatives, whether arranged by the city or by the learners themselves.

The city regards training as the only means to getting people out of poverty and into more sustainable work. In addition to training opportunities offered by the NDPW, or internally by the city, some learners also register privately. But their supervisors will not grant them study leave, as it is not allowed for in EPWP legislation. EPWP legislation does not contain detail regarding duration of employment or support for skills-development programmes (study leave).

If the duration of employment is not specified, there is no valid reason to terminate employment – especially in projects rendering continuous service, such as the Youth Greening Project (Vat Alles). This leads to a longer duration of employment, which results in labour issues. It is recommended that EPWP legislation should be read in conjunction with other legislation – again, this poses a challenge, as some other legislation was never meant for use in the EPWP. Referring to every other piece of legislation for EPWP implementation creates inconsistencies for the public bodies that must manage the programme. It also opens a loophole; beneficiaries sometimes refer to only the legislation that favours them on a particular issue, when in fact it is not meant for them.

PROGRESS

The City of Tshwane has implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors. Table 15 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors during 2015/16.
Youth Greening Project (Vat Alles)

For the 2015/16 financial year (FY), the City reported 94 projects across all the sectors. The projects are centred on the principles of service delivery, city beautification, community development, job creation and skills enhancement. The City had a national target of creating 19,593 work opportunities (WOs) for FY 2015/16; performance to date is 5,084 WOs.

The Youth Greening Project (Vat Alles) is the city’s mayoral project; it was launched in May 2012, and has created 6,000 WOs to date. Beneficiaries in this project are involved with waste management and city beautification activities. The project won the Best Metropolitan and District/Local Environment and Culture sector project category at the national Kamoso awards.

**KEY CHALLENGES**

- EPWP legislation is not clear with regard to duration of employment, making it difficult to terminate contracts – especially for programmes that are continuous in nature, such as the ‘working on waste’ programme.
- There is a need for the standardisation of wage rates for the EPWP, especially for those sectors that are regulated. There are instances of projects that are implemented in the same ward, but beneficiaries are not paid the same wages. Wage-rate standardisation per province, taking into consideration the economic conditions of each province, would allow for better management of EPWP implementation.

**LESSONS LEARNED**

- Regionalisation of services in the city gave workers an opportunity to gain experience in different fields, for example, maintenance of swimming pools, cemeteries and parks.
- Introduction of “Tshepo 10 000” provided an opportunity for entrepreneurship development and maximisation of job creation in the city.
- Providing performance feedback and incentives on a quarterly basis to departments and regions has encouraged better performance and accountability in the city.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 15: City of Tshwane EPWP progress (2015/16)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure (R million)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid (R million)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**FLAGSHIP PROJECTS AND SUCCESS**

**ABET Level 5**

The city introduced the ABET programme for EPWP beneficiaries who do not have a senior certificate. The programme started in 2015, with 101 learners. It is currently in its second phase, with 234 learners. Classes are attended once a week. In 2016, 234 learners were registered for ABET level 5. The examinations will take place in May/June 2016.

Other training programmes:
- Meter Reader and Microsoft Office (507 beneficiaries)
- Disaster Risk Management (4 beneficiaries)
- Construction Road Maintenance (4 beneficiaries)
- Cooperative Development Training (12 beneficiaries)
- Water reticulation and sewer pipeline installation (22 beneficiaries)
- Basic Firefighting (26 beneficiaries)
- Machine Operators (4 beneficiaries)
- Basic Welding (4 beneficiaries)
- Financial Management (324 beneficiaries)
- First Aid, Health and Safety (4 beneficiaries)
- Financial Management (234 beneficiaries)
Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality is fully committed to the implementation of the EPWP. Given the rate of unemployment in the municipality, especially for youth and women, the programme has made a huge impact in the lives of the community.

A number of large projects were initiated, mostly in the social and the environment and culture sectors. These are longer-term projects, providing the participants with a better opportunity to develop their lives. Though there has been much activity in these sectors, there has been a decline in 2015/16 – not in implementation, but in the reporting thereof, especially in the infrastructure sector. In the coming financial year, the municipality will be putting in more effort to ensure that departments implement and report consistently.

The impact of the EPWP in the municipality includes the following:
- A cleaner city
- Reduction in emergencies in the informal settlements
- Better service in clinics
- Quicker reporting and fixing of pipe leaks and potholes
- Rodent control

POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION

Though the EPWP policy has not been approved in Ekurhuleni, its regulations and conditions are implemented by the municipality. Efforts are made to ensure that the policy will be approved as soon as possible, as there are some conditions that cannot be implemented without approval by the municipality.

INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS

The programme is administratively managed by the Head of Department of Economic Development, and the political champion is the Member of the Mayoral Committee (MMC: Economic Development and city planning). Most of the posts are vacant, with only the posts for divisional head and programme manager and one project administrator post filled. The structure has been approved by the municipality, with only certain critical posts that can be advertised. Figure 24 illustrates the approved institutional arrangements for Ekurhuleni for 2015/16.
**Table 16: Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality budget allocations (2015/16)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2015/16 INCENTIVE GRANT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS**

The programme employs participants from the poor community, with a focus on youth and women. All the requirements of ministerial determination are adhered to, including leave, working hours, UIF and COIDA. Issues around the standardisation of wage rates are still a challenge; for example, in cases where the province and municipality implement the programme in the same area, but wages are different.

**PROGRESS**

Ekurhuleni Metropolitan Municipality implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors. Table 17 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors during 2015/16.

**Budget Allocations for the EPWP**

Ekurhuleni received an incentive allocation of R13,790,000 for the 2015/16 financial year, as shown in Table 16. The full amount was allocated to the Primary Healthcare Support Programme serving all the clinics in the municipality.
Part III: City reports

ETHEKWINI METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY

Overview of the EPWP in ETHEKWINI

During 2015/16, eThekwini Municipality continued to create awareness about the EPWP, and encourage LIC methods in all of its projects, in order for the EPWP to be effective. The city has prioritised and promoted EPWP principles in as many projects as possible. EPWP projects have been implemented across all sectors, with a significant portion attributable to infrastructure. A dedicated EPWP department is still in the implementation process. The EPWP unit, located within the Infrastructure Management Socio-economic Development and Rural Area Based Management Department (IMS/RABM), was responsible for overall coordination and administrative support of the programme. In addition, a very able councillor has been appointed as political champion, who allowed for greater political representation in the city.

NDPW terminated the data-capture services of KDBS Consulting and the Technical Support services of Akatech Consulting during the year. This left a void in two vital services. However, eThekwini municipality employed three local data capturers and acquired technical capacity to fill the void.

Data collection from line departments continues to be a challenge. An even greater challenge is acquiring data from certain contractors. There is also resistance from data compilers to using the new templates, which they claim to be too time-consuming and resulting in duplication of information. The new Management Information System (MIS) has been a major challenge since implementation. This has adversely impacted reporting of WO and FTE outcomes for the current year. Contingency plans have been implemented to manage this challenging situation efficiently going forward.

Apart from new-beneficiary induction, no other formal training has been done, due to the unavailability of funding. The importance of training and keeping training records has been highlighted by audit procedures.

In the absence of a formal exit strategy, many beneficiaries have been absorbed into permanent employment, especially in the Cleansing and Solid Waste (CSW) department. Most other beneficiary contracts are renewed with the continuation of ongoing or multi-year projects. It is envisaged that eThekwini municipality will achieve, if not exceed, its five-year target of 38 419 FTEs.

Flagship Projects and Success

Primary Health Care Support Programme

The Primary Health Care Support Programme has employed 630 participants placed in clinics around the municipality, and was also supported by provincial departments. Participants are placed as closely as possible to their respective places of residence, to avoid having to use their wages for transport to work. A skills survey was done, to ensure that participants would be placed in tasks and functions related to their existing skillsets or qualifications. These include data capturing, cleaning, clerical work, marshalling and gardening. The municipality also worked in partnership with Love Life in this youth-friendly service, to educate and assist their peers regarding youth-related matters.

Key Challenges

Though there has been great understanding of and buy-in to the programme, the municipality has experienced the following challenges:

• Disputes over the minimum wage. There is a misunderstanding between the unions and the municipality regarding EPWP minimum wages and sectoral minimum wages. This has led to protests, which delayed implementation of projects. There have been instances in which different projects have been implemented in the municipality, but participants have not been paid the same wages.
• Regardless of how clear the contracts are that are drawn up, and how clear the interaction is with participants at the beginning of and during project implementation, there is an expectation of permanent jobs. This has happened mainly where people were placed in offices – as data capturers and cleaners, for instance – for a period of more than one year.

Lessons Learned

• There is a need for thorough community mobilisation before the beginning of a project.
• Timeous planning of projects is essential for better implementation.
• Wage rates must be standardised and regulated; not only at municipal level, but at national level.

Primary Health Care Support Programme

Patients with Queue Marshals (left) and Cleaning Services (right)
POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION

The eThekwini EPWP policy is presently in an advanced stage of review, and still progressing to final authorisation. The policy has been circulated for review and comment among senior managers. The formulation and the adoption of the policy aim at integrating the EPWP principles into the Independent Development Plan (IDP) for all projects implemented. The finalisation of the policy would allow for improved project facilitation within the eThekwini EPWP Programme, with all of its latest updates, and entrench the objectives, goals and vision of the EPWP in eThekwini. It would also align our policy with that of the EPWP Integrated Manual.

In the absence of the EPWP policy, it is difficult to hold line departments accountable for any non-compliance. Furthermore, the establishment of the city's dedicated EPWP structure is being delayed because of this. The finalisation of the EPWP policy would significantly increase EPWP capacity.

INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS

During 2015/16, eThekwini Municipality continued to operate within the existing institutional arrangements established to govern EPWP in the municipality. The Mayor is the political champion for the EPWP in the city, while the City Manager is the administrative champion responsible for providing support in coordinating the EPWP across all sectors.

The dedicated EPWP unit, located within the IMS, was responsible for overall coordination and administrative support of the programme. The EPWP task group, consisting of champions for each cluster/sector in the municipality, also supported the coordination of the EPWP. The task group included representatives from treasury, skills development, supply-chain management and human resources.

A nominated councillor provided political support for the programme, embarking on an EPWP road show in the metro area. The EPWP task group managed the coordination of the EPWP, and was directly responsible for ensuring integrated planning, coordination, monitoring and reporting of all EPWP activities within each cluster.

The department continued to be restructured during the past year, which resulted in vacant positions. These negatively influenced the coordination and success of the EPWP in the municipality. It is envisaged that the vacant positions and restructuring of the department will be finalised before the end of the next reporting period. However, the current institutional arrangements do allow acceptable capacity for EPWP operations. Figure 25 shows the approved institutional arrangements for eThekwini Municipality.

BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR THE EPWP

Although the city receives a significant amount from the incentive grant allocation, the following were the main EPWP funding sources during the 2015/16 reporting period:

- Capital budget
- Operational budget
- Various grant and institutional funding

Using internal municipal funding has allowed the city to maximise the available EPWP work opportunities created. An additional amount of R22 million was requested from the municipal adjustment budget to supplement the EPWP grant-funded projects. Table 18 shows the incentive grant allocations along with expenditure for 2015/16.

Table 18: eThekwini Municipality budget allocations (2015/16)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2015/16 INCENTIVE GRANT</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
<td>R40.6 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
<td>R40.6 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
<td>R40.6 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance (over expenditure)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Challenges experienced with regard to the funding sources during this reporting period included:
- Insufficient grant funding received from the NDPW limited the expansion of the EPWP in the municipality.
- Inadequate budget allocated to EPWP projects from the capital and operating expenditure budgets, as departments relied largely on grant funding. This limited the number of projects that could be implemented in a financial year, and affected the continuity and/or expansion of existing projects.
- Inconsistent distribution of funds across the various sectors, which affected the success and continuity of projects.
- Inadequate grant funding to provide for protective clothing, tools and necessary equipment.
- Training with external service providers could not be secured, due to funding limitations.

EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS

The EPWP grant allocation is primarily utilised to increase and maximise job creation in the delivery of EPWP programmes or projects. Table 19 shows the employment demographics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WO</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Work Opportunities (year)</td>
<td>13016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DEMOGRAPHICS:
- Work Opportunities: women (year) 9005 69.18%
- Work Opportunities: youth (year) 3581 27.51%
- Work Opportunities: people with disabilities (year) 28 0.21%

Beneficiaries are employed through ward councillors, to conduct work in or in close proximity to their respective wards.

Due to the high prevalence of conflict and disputes, beneficiaries are informed of all compliance issues before being taken on to a project. Through an induction programme, they are made aware of the EPWP principles, the Ministerial Determination, and the Code of Good Practice.

The minimum EPWP wage rate was governed by the Ministerial Determination. However, the wage rate varied across sectors and departments. The wage rate remained unchanged at R112 per day for the current year.

Formal training budgets were not taken into account, due to inadequate funding. Most of the training consisted of induction and ‘tool-box’ talk, which is included in the MIS data.

Although the municipality promoted LIC where possible, the supply chain management and contract documentation did not specify or regulate EPWP and LIC requirements. Changes to the supply chain management policy to this effect are imminent.

PROGRESS

eThekwini Municipality implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors. There was an overall decrease in performance from the previous reporting period. Table 20 shows the progress of the city in 2015/16.

Table 20: eThekwini Municipality EPWP progress (2015/16)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
<td>13 016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
<td>6 376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure (R million)</td>
<td>R335.5 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid (R million)</td>
<td>R170.5 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DSW City-Wide Cleaning Programme

This project aims to expose recruited participants from disadvantaged communities to the workplace environment; and at the same time, bring about cleanliness to the city and the immediate environment. It is also aimed at engaging the buy-in and education of localised citizens to better understand the process and the provision of temporary jobs as part of poverty alleviation through the EPWP.

The EPWP project commenced on 1 December 2010, and continues to 30 June 2017. The estimated budget amount as at end June 2016 is R90 092 705, including incentive-grant funding.

The following duties are performed to alleviate poverty and reduce unemployment:
- clearing illegal dumping hotspots;
- street cleaning (litter picking & street sweeping);
- litter picking on open areas;
- gutter clearance;
- emptying of pole bins, dustbins & removal of dead animals from the road;
- collecting of refuse and loading it into CSW trucks;
- offloading at the landfill site;
- distributing bags to households.

This project is also in line with the ‘Clean and Maintain My City’ programme instituted by the eThekwini City Manager. Evaluation methods adopted to monitor the project include:
- Weekly management project site visits and project monitoring;
- Meetings held with staff;
- Regular monthly reporting;
- Attendance registers monitored daily, and marked by senior supervisors;
- Daily inspection and checks by unit senior supervisors;
- Payment schedule checked and authorised.
PART III: City reports

KEY CHALLENGES

Key challenges experienced were:

• The newly-implemented MIS has presented a major challenge, with additional mandatory compliance requirements.
• Certain projects were not registered on the new MIS, due to time constraints and new requirements.
• Projects were not timeously approved, delaying the commencement of work.
• Some EPWP participants demanded permanent employment.
• Some contractors did not supply beneficiary data for implemented projects.
• Some contractors did not use EPWP branding, including protective clothing.
• Wage rates were inconsistent across sectors or departments.
• Some training person-days were not reported.
• There was no effective exit strategy for some of the projects.
• There is a critical need for greater government funding to eThekwini to support the EPWP.
• There is a lack of dedicated EPWP staff in the municipality. Because the EPWP is not regarded as a permanent, mainstream programme of the municipality, it does not feature in the municipal organogram.

LESSONS LEARNED

Some of the operational challenges experienced led to the following lessons learned:

• EPWP reporting requirements should be incorporated into SCM contract documents, which would take care of branding and the submission of beneficiary data.
• Reporting of training days should be compulsory.
• Data-capture rejections impact on the accuracy of reported statistics; follow-up is required.
• eThekwini has appointed a dedicated EPWP HR practitioner, to contend with beneficiary challenges with regard to labour disputes.
• Recruitment setbacks have been addressed through the pending implementation of the Recruitment Strategy Guidelines.
• The communication process must be enhanced in educating key EPWP personnel and department managers in aligning their programmes with job-creation initiatives.
• Institutional arrangements must be in place, in order to provide a strategic focus for and coordination of the EPWP.
• Timeous and accurate reporting is required for early warning of deviations from plan, so that these can be adequately addressed.
• Sector reporting must be enhanced and streamlined, as projects that belong under other sectors are still being reported under infrastructure.
• Exit strategies must be defined, especially with contractors.
• Project managers must be encouraged to provide for the EPWP in their municipal budgets.

Environmental education in progress (left) and trail clearance (right).

Durban Green Corridor

Durban Green Corridor (DGC) is an initiative of eThekwini Municipality’s Economic Development & Investment Promotion Unit, and is managed by the NPO Dzu iMngeni Conservation Trust (DUCT). DGC aims to create jobs for, and up-skill, local communities living along the uMngeni River Valley. The project creates opportunities and makes a real difference to the lives of local previously-disadvantaged people. This is achieved through the development of ecotourism and adventure tourism services.

The DGC project was initiated in 2009 as a partnership between eThekwini Municipality and recreational and environmental interest groups, and implemented by DUCT. The project was the 2015 Lilizela Tourism Awards national winner for best economic impact by a small-scale project, and also won the KZN award for best community tourism guide.

The project has transformed previously inaccessible areas of natural beauty into areas that can be enjoyed by tourists, visitors and locals. These sites are connected by a network of trails, and include:

• uMngeni Valley Green Corridor (recreation and tourism);
• Go Durban bike parks and cycle academy (youth and NMT);
• GO Durban Cycle Academy – integrated riding, life skills and academic support to all sites, recreational and competitive riding;
• uMhlangane Green Corridor (urban public space transformation);
• uMhlangaCornubia Green Corridor (recreation and tourism – replication of uMngeni concept);
• KwaDabeka Agriculture and Ecotourism Project (redevelopment of old Waste Water Works).

Canoeing, hiking, mountain biking, bird watching or simply picnicking at any of these sites is possible thanks to the locally-employed guides and site staff. Authentic Zulu village tours and visits to sites of cultural significance are also offered.
Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality

OVERVIEW OF THE EPWP IN MANGAUNG

Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality has been making efforts to successfully implement the EPWP. Mangaung recognises that there were shortcomings in implementing the EPWP in 2015/16. With the continuous support from the EPWP unit at the National Department of Public Works, Mangaung managed to achieve 42% of the EPWP target for the 2015/16 financial year.

The city has implemented projects in the infrastructure, environment and culture, and social sectors; with infrastructure projects dominant. There is still something of a gap with regard to understanding of the EPWP, its objectives, and compliance with it, and the city is working tirelessly to bridge that gap. These efforts will ultimately enhance performance and compliance.

POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION

Mangaung has reviewed its policy, which has been approved by council. The city continues to ensure that EPWP projects are implemented in accordance to the Ministerial Determination, and all codes of practice are followed.

INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS

Mangaung does not have a structure specific to the EPWP. Figure 26 shows the structure in the city that managed and coordinated EPWP implementation. Two project coordinators were appointed under Manager Service Delivery Monitoring unit in order to build institutional capacity in the city. The manager acts as a central point of contact for departmental coordination.
**EPWP Employment Conditions**

EPWP participants working in Mangaung projects are encouraged to be employed under the conditions of employment as stipulated in the Ministerial Determination and Code of Good Practice for the EPWP. The municipality makes an effort to ensure that its projects fully comply with all labour legislation, such as the UIF, COIDA, and the Occupational Health and Safety Act (Act No.130 of 1993).

**Progress**

The Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality implemented projects in the social, infrastructure, and environment and culture sectors. Table 22 shows the progress of the city's EPWP across these sectors in 2015/16.

**Table 21: Mangaung budget allocations (2015/16)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2015/16 INCENTIVE GRANT</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
<td>R3.1 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
<td>R3.1 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
<td>R2.9 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
<td>R0.20 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 22: Mangaung EPWP progress (2015/16)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WO's created</td>
<td>2958</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
<td>805</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure (R million)</td>
<td>R 35.4 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid (R million)</td>
<td>R 24.2 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Budget Allocation for the EPWP**

The main EPWP funding sources for Mangaung were the Urban Settlement Development Grant (USDG) and the EPWP incentive grant. Table 21 shows the incentive grant allocation for the municipality, along with the expenditure for 2015/16.

The following directorates were identified as potential contributors to EPWP work opportunities:
- Social Services
- Engineering Services
- Fleet and Waste Management
- Human Settlement and Housing
- Corporate Services
- Office of the Executive Mayor (Youth Unit)
- Planning

**Figure 26: Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality institutional arrangements**
Employer’s Objectives
The employer’s objectives are to deliver public infrastructure that will see the eradication of the bucket system and the implementation of basic services (waterborne sewerage) using labour-intensive methods, thus also creating jobs in the communities they serve.

Labour-intensive Works
Labour-intensive works comprise the activities described in SANS 1921-5: earthworks activities which are to be performed by hand, and their associated specification data. Such works were constructed using local labour temporarily employed by the learner contractors in terms of this scope of work.

Learner Contractors
This project was executed using learner contractors assisted by an experienced supervisor and mentor, as a means of skills development and for the transfer of skills to assist contractors to become experienced, competent contractors.

KEY CHALLENGES
Mangaung experienced the following challenges in 2015/15:

• Difficulties with the reporting of EPWP projects and WOs because of the new system requirements, along with delays in submission of quality data;
• EPWP reporting-system problems (submission of non-compliant documentation);
• Non-compliance from some EPWP project implementers.

LESSONS LEARNT
The following lessons were learned from the challenges and successes in 2015/16:

• Mangaung needs an EPWP data-management centre, to manage and control data, and capture it into the EPWP system.
• Continuous workshops must be conducted with all stakeholders in Mangaung, such as service providers, project implementers, line departments and councillors, to ensure clear understanding of the EPWP and its components.
Part III: City reports

Msunduzi Municipality

Overview of the EPWP in the City

Effective from 3 November 2014, an EPWP unit has been set up within the Community Services Business Unit, comprising a manager and three EPWP administration assistants. Other business units in the municipality are lobbied to be part of the EPWP Steering Committee. In line with EPWP Phase III, EPWP policy incorporating set targets was amended and approved at a full council meeting on 25 February 2015, and was implemented in 2015/16 from 1 July 2015.

Policy and Implementation

The EPWP policy was approved for the first time on 25 September 2013, and effectively adopted by the municipality. Further amendments to the policy were made for alignment with Phase III targets and principles, and approved by the municipality on 25 February 2015.

Institutional Arrangements

A dedicated EPWP management team, with one acting manager and three EPWP administration assistants, was tasked with the responsibility of capturing and reporting all EPWP-related projects in Msunduzi Municipality. Figure 27 shows the institutional arrangements for Msunduzi Municipality for 2015/16.
Part III: City reports

Table 23: Msunduzi Municipality budget allocations (2015/16)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2015/16 INCENTIVE GRANT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS

The EPWP beneficiaries performed general maintenance duties, including grass cutting, cleaning of gutters, street sweeping, and clearing of illegal dumping within the boundaries of the city, and maintenance of city gardens, on a contract of three days a week for a period of 12 months. All beneficiaries were remunerated on a monthly basis at a rate of R120 per day. Conditions of service are observed for all beneficiaries according to the existing Ministerial Determination guidelines. There has also been an emphasis on using LIC methods in the infrastructure sector, in order to increase the WOs generated by the city.

PROGRESS

Msunduzi Municipality implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, social, and environment and culture sectors. Table 24 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors during the 2015/16 financial year.

Table 24: Msunduzi Municipality EPWP progress (2015/16)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WO’s created</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure (R million)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid (R million)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Budget Allocations for EPWP

The municipality relied on incentive-grant funding as well as allocations from the capital- and operating-expenditure budgets to implement projects during this period. Limited availability of municipal budget limited the implementation of proposed EPWP projects. Table 23 shows the incentive-grant funding allocated to the municipality for 2015/16, along with the expenditure.
City reports

Ward-Based Integrated Maintenance and City Beautification
This flagship project is part of the Mayoral Programme that employs 70 beneficiaries for a period of 12 months. Each of the 37 wards has a ‘maintenance crew’ of 20 individuals per ward. The crews work for three days a week, and deal with the issues in their respective wards. Part of their duties is to beautify city entrances by planting a mixture of vegetables and colourful flowers. Some of the vegetables that are planted are harvested for poor or disadvantaged households in Msunduzi Municipality, which is a two-fold impact for the project.

Challenges
Challenges experienced by Msunduzi Municipality in 2015/16 include:
- Labour unions putting pressure on the city to absorb EPWP beneficiaries into permanent positions in the municipality.
- Most projects that are EPWP compliant are not reported.
- The EPWP Steering Committee in the municipality is non-functional.

Lessons Learned
The challenges faced and other experiences during the implementation of the EPWP projects led to the following lessons:
- The city must to improve technical capacity for labour-intensive operations.
- Labour intensity must be improved, by increasing available internal sources of funding.
- There is no strategy to access additional grant-funding sources, to increase work opportunities in the municipality.

Flagship Projects and Success

Upgrading of gravel roads – Unit S Ward 10
The project in the infrastructure sector started on 13 July 2015. A total 36 beneficiaries have been employed. Beneficiaries are chosen from communities closest to the roads that need to be upgraded.

Maintenance of Public Cemeteries
Maintenance of Public Cemeteries is a flagship project that started on 1 July 2015, through the environment and culture sector. A total of 70 beneficiaries have been appointed to conduct general maintenance work, which includes grass cutting and reburials. The beneficiaries are appointed for a period of 12 months, on contract.
NELSON MANDELA BAY METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITY

OVERVIEW OF THE EPWP IN NELSON MANDELA BAY

The appointment of a city manager significantly enhanced the efficiency of the city’s EPWP coordination, as it allowed for enhanced capacity as well as continuity throughout the implementation and expansion of its EPWP activities.

Furthermore, the appointment of the city manager allowed Nelson Mandela Bay to focus on mainstreaming its EPWP coordination through the city’s dedicated EPWP unit. The EPWP unit was therefore relocated from the Special Programmes Directorate to the office of the Chief Operating Officer, to allow for centralisation of EPWP coordination. The relocation of the EPWP unit brought it closer to the centre of administration in the city manager’s office.

On 13 January 2014 the EPWP unit was relocated to the office of the Chief Operating Officer (COO), which is an extension of the city manager’s office. Politically, the COO’s office falls under the Deputy Mayor’s office.

POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION

The city’s EPWP policy was approved and adopted in October 2011, and has not been reviewed since. However, requests have been made to the executive directors for inputs. The framework for the implementation of the EPWP in Nelson Mandela Bay is still being guided by the policy that was approved in 2011, along with coordination and enforcement of compliance.

A Public Employment Programme committee (political and technical) was established in September 2014 to lead the EPWP in the city. This will assist the EPWP office to unblock some of the bottlenecks, and also align the city’s policy to Phase III of the EPWP.
**INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS**

The unit currently has four funded posts, of which two (contract positions) are filled. With the implementation of the Labour Relations Amendment Act, there is a possibility of converting all EPWP contractual staff to permanent employees. Figure 28 shows the institutional arrangements for Nelson Mandela Bay.

---

**BUDGET ALLOCATIONS FOR EPWP**

The city relied on incentive-grant allocations to fund EPWP projects and programmes, as budgeted for in each directorate. Table 25 shows the incentive-grant allocation to Nelson Mandela Bay for 2015/16, along with the expenditure.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2014/15 INCENTIVE GRANT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total grant allocation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total grant funding received</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative spending (to date)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of allocation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% spending (of transfer)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**EPWP EMPLOYMENT CONDITIONS**

In order to improve the city’s efficiency and performance, the EPWP targets were incorporated as part of the Executive Director’s score card. The requirements of the EPWP also formed part of the specifications for the various directors within the city. This has increased the level of responsibility and accountability, and in turn ensured better performance. The city must still improve on number of projects implemented and WOs created.

---

**PROGRESS**

Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality implemented EPWP projects in the infrastructure, social, and environment and culture sectors. Table 26 shows the progress of the municipality’s EPWP across these sectors during the 2015/16 reporting period.
Part III: City reports

An amount of R17 million was invested by the city for public art and art events programmes, in order to ensure that the city becomes one of the key tourism destinations of the Eastern Cape. The programme has garnered national and international interest, and this application seeks to continue the programming of the visual-art aspect of local economic development.

KEY CHALLENGES

The following are some of the challenges experienced by Nelson Mandela Bay in 2015/16:

• Non-compliance with Auditor General Requirements resulted in a loss of reported WOs and FTEs;
• Under-reporting by line directorates on WOs created;
• Executive directors not holding project managers accountable for not reporting on WOs created;
• Lack of creativity from the directorates when designing projects that could have yielded more WOs;
• Delays in starting dates of projects due to wage-rate disputes, where the minimum rate as per the Ministerial Determination is said to be too low.

LESSONS LEARNED

From the challenges experienced in 2015/16, the following lessons were learned:

• EPWP targets must be included on executive directors’ scorecards, so as to improve performance and accountability.
• The EPWP should form part of the Supply Chain Management Committees, in order to enforce EPWP compliance for tender documents.
• The EPWP should be accountable to its own Portfolio Committee.

Table 26: Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality EPWP progress (2015/16)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of projects implemented</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of WOs created</td>
<td>1,229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of FTEs</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of training days</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure</td>
<td>R70.1 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wages paid</td>
<td>R9.5 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**FLAGSHIP PROJECTS AND SUCCESS**

**Job Creation through Visual Arts and Chess**

Nelson Mandela Bay Municipality has created employment for 30 beneficiaries through the Visual Arts and Chess programme. This creative arts programme is not only about the development of urban-renewal art pieces; it also concentrates on the training of emerging artists, job creation, education, raising public awareness, and promoting the cultural industry as a driver of urban renewal.

This multi-dimensional approach is essential to allow the Mandela Bay Development Agency to be the driver of an economic focus on art, culture and heritage, in conjunction with strategic partners and aligned institutions, to fulfill its mandate to regenerate content in open spaces in its mandated area. The project is fundamental as a secondary economic driver, in a region where urban industrialism has limitations with respect to job creation, and alternate secondary industry is limited to informal seasonal jobs, with little or no creative products filling the vacuum.
Part IV: Case studies

BACKGROUND

One of the worst legacies of apartheid is the inadequate provision of water and sanitation service delivery. While the South African Constitution recognizes the universal right of access to these services, inadequate access still plagues the lives of the majority of South Africans. Previously, the eThekwini Metropolitan Municipality provided these services to its urban, mostly white and middle-class population; but with the influx of people to the city in search of job opportunities, informal housing settlements have expanded exponentially, and need to be serviced.

Densely-built informal settlements provide little space for full sanitation services, so residents must use home-made pit latrines, making them vulnerable to water-borne diseases. Women and children, who are responsible for cleaning, walk long distances in poorly-lit areas to obtain water or use toilets, making them vulnerable to crime. Environmental pollution also increases, due to open defecation and grey water runoff. This occurs when there is no waste-water and sanitation system in place. Currently, 350 informal housing settlements in Durban, housing approximately one million people, do not have access to these services. Because the area is also a site for the formal re-housing programme, the full water and sanitation service needs to be of a temporary nature until residents are relocated to fully-serviced houses.

PROGRAMME DESCRIPTION

The eThekwini Municipality has designed an effective temporary solution to address this problem, known as the Communal Ablution Blocks (CAB). These are modified shipping containers, each having two showers, each with a door for privacy; two flush toilets with doors; two hand basins; and a small, locked storeroom for cleaning materials. In addition, the containers used by men have two fitted urinals. Attached to the outside of each container are four basins, used for washing clothes. Lighting is provided at night and improves the safety of users, particularly the safety of women and children. The CABs are connected to the municipal sewerage and water systems, and are provided at 350 sites in informal settlements, in pairs – one for women and one for men.
This eliminates environmental pollution caused by open defecation, and minimises grey-water run-off. Although most of the washing takes place at the CABs, grey-water run-off has not been completely eliminated, as people use water for other purposes at the dwellings. To address this potential health hazard, a vertical garden for small purposes at the dwellings. To address this potential health hazard, a vertical garden for small purposes at the dwellings. To address this potential health hazard, a vertical garden for small purposes at the dwellings.

Programme Objectives

The CABs Programme had two objectives: to provide sanitation and water services, as well as skills training and job opportunities, to the residents of informal settlements.

Main strategies included: obtaining community buy-in; ensuring that the CABs were mobile; establishing a municipal support team for ongoing maintenance; and ensuring that the programme had a positive impact on the environment. Residents are ambivalent about receiving services. They are excited, but anxious about possibly being excluded from the housing waiting list. This ambivalence often contributes to the vandalism and destruction of government property.

To prevent this, the eThekwini Water and Sanitation (EWS) programme, in partnership with Africa Ahead (an NGO), established health clubs among the residents and conducted focus groups to determine what their needs were. Community buy-in was achieved in a way that would allow the community to be involved in the planning and design of the CABs. The CABs can be relocated to another informal settlement. A caretaker (EPWP participant) is employed to maintain the facilities on a daily basis, and a support team is set up in the EWS to respond to any maintenance work. Experience has taught the EWS that this is more cost-effective than having to replace infrastructure once it is completely damaged. To make sure that the programme has a positive environmental impact, vertical gardens were set up to capture grey-water run-off.

Alignment and Integration with Policies

Challenged to provide water and sanitation services to informal housing settlements, jointly the eThekwini Municipality’s Housing, Architecture, Health, and Water and Sanitation Departments came up with the CABs concept. The Health Department (HD) assumed overall responsibility for managing the programme (which was implemented in 2004), as they were mandated to roll out sanitation services in the Metro. But the HD did not have the technical skills to manage the large-scale rollout, operations and maintenance of these facilities. So in 2009, EWS took over responsibility of the programme and the installation of the CABs. Africa Ahead (an NGO) provided support to the health clubs and facilitated interaction between the residents, while Key of Hope (NGO) trained and educated local residents to manage play areas and creches.

The Expanded Public Works Programme funds the employment of 1 250 caretakers to assist with operations and maintenance of the CABs. The caretakers ensure that operations at the CABs run smoothly, to prevent damage to the facilities. The Department of Water Affairs and Forestry’s Mitigation Grant provides ongoing regulatory support and funding. The Agricultural Management Unit (AMU) within the municipality is responsible for the establishment of the communal food gardens to assist with poverty alleviation in those areas where the CABs are located. The AMU also provides ongoing support and funding.

Programme Implementation

Prior to 2004, informal-housing settlement residents in the Durban area had no access to formal water and sanitation services. In an attempt to address this challenge, the municipality’s Health, Housing, Water and Sanitation, and Architecture departments met and discussed how they could meet this need.

The solution was the implementation of the CABs in 2004. But due to inadequate planning and management, the existing CABs soon fell into disrepair, and the Health Department was not able to meet the needs of local residents. Throughout this period, only 180 CABs were built. To increase the delivery of services, it was decided to provide local informal settlement residents with chemical toilets; but this was not sustainable, and proved to be unhygienic.

In 2008, the municipal manager amended municipal by-laws that stated that the HD was responsible for the provision of water and sanitation services. This function was moved to the EWS in 2008. In 2009 the EWS assumed responsibility for the installation and management of the CABs in informal settlements, and since then more than 1 150 CABs have been installed. During 2010/11, UKZN conducted surveys among local residents to determine their levels of satisfaction with the CABs. For the duration of 2011 to 2015, the CAB programme rolled out to all the transit camps (the informal settlements being upgraded) in the Durban area.

The use of modified shipping containers as CABs allows for rapid installation on land that is often steep and where space is limited. It also allows for the easy relocation of the CABs to other areas, once new houses have been built. In comparison to brick CABs, building and maintenance costs are also reduced. A key factor is the use of materials that do not encourage vandalism, and require reduced maintenance. More than 1 150 CABs have been installed, with approximately 1 200 caretakers (EPWP participants) attending to their operation and cleaning requirements. Each CAB services 50 households, and an estimated 500 000 residents of informal settlements in Durban use them. Three thousand five hundred local labourers were trained and employed during the construction, and also benefited from acquiring skills as local builders.

The CABs have become social development hubs, with health clubs (HCs), creches, the food garden and play areas, tuck shops and telephone services. Research by the Health Club facilitator, Africa Ahead, shows that the HC and CABs resulted in the development of a strong sense of social cohesion in these communities, which had previously been lacking. During 2010 and 2011, UKZN conducted surveys to measure the effectiveness of the programme, assess customer satisfaction, and provide feedback to guide service delivery. The results highlight that 71.7% of the sample reported that the presence of sanitation facilities in their communities addressed their household needs. Another highlight was that 82.2% of households surveyed reported a significant improvement in their quality of life due to the CABs.

Reasons for dissatisfaction were analysed and fed back to the planning and design team. An original weakness of the project was the fact that the CABs were unhygienic, poorly maintained, and subject to vandalism and theft. This was addressed through the introduction of the caretakers and the operation and support team, as well as the use of plastic fittings and pipes.
The eThekwini Metropolitan Municipality has made a commitment to set aside funds on an annual basis until all informal settlements have received CABs. A succession plan is not required, as the Municipality is committed to the ongoing sustainability of the CABs through sound operation and maintenance. The key threat to the sustainability of the project is the withdrawal of funding from the EPWP for the salaries of the caretakers (EPWP participants). The caretakers are of utmost importance in the sustainability of the CABs; thus, alternative funding will be sought from Council or other government funding such as the Job Fund, to keep supporting the employment of caretakers. The eThekwini Municipality is already replicating the project throughout the municipality.

The key ingredient for the success of the programme is the sound leadership provided within eThekwini Water and Sanitation Department. Most of the staff have spent the majority of their professional careers at eThekwini Metropolitan Municipality, and this institutional memory and a wealth of expertise have enabled project managers to explore alternative solutions to service delivery challenges, often building on previous successful projects in the area. They are experts at accessing technical expertise and the funding available for necessary services. Partnerships with different institutions, such as the Africa Ahead NGO and the UKZN, helped in building social cohesion in communities.

eThekwini Metro outsourced the targeting and training of the beneficiaries to Africa Ahead; empowering residents to take ownership of the installation, maintenance and care of the CABs. Residents of informal settlements are often poor and lack resources, and where they see the benefits of job creation and an improvement to the personal services provided by the municipality, they are more likely to cooperate with government. When the residents do not feel a sense of ownership, this often results in the destruction of government property. The UKZN conducted research to determine the effectiveness of the CABs, and to explore the beneficiaries’ perceptions of the services received. This was crucial to preventing the vandalism of the CABs.

**SUPPORT PROVIDED BY THE MUNICIPALITY**

The average budget for the project for the period 2009 to 2015 was R250 million per annum. The total cost of a pair of CABs, including transport, site preparation, operations and maintenance, hardware and software is in the region of R1.1 million.

The fact that the EPWP provided the budget for caretaker (participant) salaries makes the operation and maintenance of the CABs far more cost-effective and sustainable. EWS manages the CABs programme and coordinates all related activities. Technical expertise and support was provided by the EWS engineering staff, while community liaison and education was provided by local ward councillors and NGOs respectively.

**LESSONS LEARNED, AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

- From a health perspective, the key positive impacts are improved health for those who benefit from the delivery of proper sanitation and safe drinking water, particularly in communities where there is a high prevalence of HIV/AIDS, which in some cases is almost 40%.
- Currently, EWS is improving project sustainability by stimulating user ownership of facilities and involve users in operation and management.

This initiative will include a micro-finance scheme and construction of shops, to generate more employment and encourage social gatherings.

- The construction and operation of CABs has alleviated the unemployment problem in Durban; and from a social point of view, the programme imparts a sense of dignity to local communities.

The project entails rehabilitation of private plumbing fixtures, including taps, flow-control valves on hot-water systems, cisterns, pans, guillies, and the provision of wash troughs where necessary.

The programme also involves the detection of leaks in existing mains and replacement of secondary water mains where necessary, including zone meters, to ultimately:

- Create job opportunities through the application of labour-intensive methods of construction;
- Develop emerging contractors through training and subcontracting of work to local small contractors.
The Pressure Management and Soweto Infrastructure Upgrade and Renewal Projects make a positive impact in the areas they are implemented. The overall impact is also becoming more visible, in that there is a constant decrease in water consumption per capita compared to the previous financial year. It is anticipated that the impact will become even more evident.

SUPPORT PROVIDED

The municipality has ensured proper introduction of the programme, community mobilisation, and political buy-in.

Other key role-players within the programme were:
- Johannesburg Development Agency (JDA)
- Joburg Property Company (JPC)
- Gauteng Economic Development Agency (GEDA)
- Blue IQ
- Department of Economic Development
- Department of Water Affairs

The following table shows the various support functions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSTITUTIONAL AND SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT (ISD)</th>
<th>TECHNICAL (CONSTRUCTION)</th>
<th>PREPAYMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Communication and public mobilisation</td>
<td>• Secondary mains upgrade</td>
<td>• Meter management (inventory and maintenance)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Secure and sustain project buy-in</td>
<td>• Retrofitting plumbing fixtures</td>
<td>• Programming and despatch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Stakeholder relations (Political and Social)</td>
<td>• Create water management zones</td>
<td>• Meter reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Water conservation awareness</td>
<td>• Monitoring of unaccounted-for water in each zone.</td>
<td>• Vendor and sales management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Project support (liaison)</td>
<td>• Project management</td>
<td>• Complaint handling and management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Project support (aftercare, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Prepaid meter development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LESSONS LEARNED

- The project has trained plumbers and emerging contractors; however, it is difficult to sustain work for them.
- There is still a degree of water loss, which needs continuous awareness for improving water-use management.
- People tampering with the meters is still a challenge; continuous awareness is vital.
COMMUNITY SAFETY AND SCHOLAR PATROL
MANGAUNG MUNICIPALITY

BACKGROUND
The Expanded Public Works Programme is an initiative promulgated by national government, aiming to improve the lives of the poor by developing the skills of the community, and also embarking on a process of pushing back the frontiers of poverty by ensuring mass participation of people in projects that are creating employment, through incentive grants to the municipalities throughout the country. These various projects are intended to be sustainable, and provide future skills to our communities.

DESCRIPTION
The following are the basic functions performed by the participants in the programme:

- Community safety participants’ duties are to patrol, monitor and report incidents in the cemeteries and other council assets;
- Scholar patrol participants assist children crossing roads to school, give advice on road safety issues, and record all activities of the morning and afternoon periods;
- Scholar patrol participants provide safety to adults and schoolchildren throughout the day by making sure that they cross the roads of Mangaung safely;
- Participants protect the assets of the council and community by controlling crowds in municipal buildings and cemeteries.

TARGET GROUP/BENEFICIARIES
The participants are selected from the following groups in the city:

- The poor and unemployed, willing and able to take up the offered work at the offered pay (not less than the minimum wage rate);
- Local labour (living close to the project area);
- Preference is given to providing work opportunities to, and empowering, women, youth and persons with disabilities;
- 50% of beneficiaries should be women;
- 50% of beneficiaries should be youth (to be aligned to the Youth Employment Accord passed by Cabinet);
- 2% of beneficiaries should be people with disabilities;
- The beneficiary-recruitment process must be fair, transparent and accessible to those who require EPWP work;
- The beneficiaries should be recruited from indigent households with no income, and priority must be given to one individual per household

WORK OPPORTUNITIES
The data below represents the work opportunities that were created through the programme in the three regions.
Part IV: Case studies

Support Provided

The city provides the following support to the project and its participants:

- Transportation (transporting tools and beneficiaries around parks and cemeteries), visiting places that needed more work force;
- Monitoring was conducted by supervisors and traffic officers, where their attention was needed;
- Training from Department of Traffic (Scholar Patrol and Law Enforcement) and Safety training (Parks and Cemeteries);
- Political guidance from the Deputy Executive Mayor and the Executive Mayor;
- Training from Mangaung Traffic College

Lessons Learned

- Though municipality had the staff, a helping hand from projects like this can be very useful to clean and beautify parks, keep the children safe to and from school, and protect its properties from being destroyed. These projects could be used where MMM lacked security, crowd control, and safety for adults and children.
- Audit readiness and compliance is very important.
**BACKGROUND**

Mangaung Metropolitan Municipality’s Youth Enterprise Development Programme (YEDP) was launched by the Executive Mayor, Cllr Thabo Manyoni, on 26 June 2015. It aims to unlock opportunities for skills training and knowledge infusion, and to develop and nurture the skills base in order to better employment prospects for youth, by exposing them to on-the-job training, and inculcating and supporting entrepreneurial aspiration among young people.

The programme is a partnership between the city, ABSA, Central University of Technology (CUT), and the Services SETA. It is intended to run for three years.

**PROGRAMME OBJECTIVES**

- Youth enterprise development;
- Unlock opportunities for skills training and knowledge infusion; and
- Develop and nurture skills base.
DIGITAL MIGRATION (THE DIGITAL SKILLS GAP – A KEY CHALLENGE AND OPPORTUNITY)

South Africa is faced with a major shortage of digital skills. There is currently a pool of just under 12 000 registered installers servicing a pay-TV market of about six million. The majority of installers are concentrated in urban areas.

With a limited time of just 18 months to migrate 15 million households, this only pointed to a dire digital skills shortage; hence the city took the opportunity to train youth. A total of 602 participants were trained for digital migration. The participants received accredited training between 14 September and 23 October 2015. The training was held in all regions, for two weeks per region, and covered 40% theory and 60% practice. A total of 467 participants successfully completed the training programme.

TRAINING

The training provided for the YEDP covered the following areas, to ensure that the youth are equipped for the formal job and entrepreneurial markets when they exit the programme:

- Basic business management;
- Financial literacy;
- Personal financial management;
- Assistance with registration of businesses (cooperatives).

PROGRAMME CONSTRAINTS

- Some participants left the programme before completion;
- Delay in starting on some projects/area of works, due to budget constraints;
- Delay in commencement in some areas of works due to delay in procurement of protective clothing;
- Tool and equipment theft by participants;
- Lack of commitment by some participants.

LESSONS LEARNED

- Strict control measures must be put in place over tools and equipment;
- The recruitment process must be improved to ensure that the most suitable participants are targeted;
- Improved participation and cooperation from the user directorate.
Expanded Public Works Programme – Reflections on Over a Decade

Released in 2016, this book from the SA Cities EPWP Reference Group reflects upon what has been achieved in 12 years of EPWP by way of addressing unemployment, and also in terms of policy and practice. The edited volume of papers concludes by making suggestions for the future of the programme.

Available for download at www.sacities.net/job-creation